

Name: _____

Directions:

Write your name in the upper right hand corner of each odd-numbered page.

Warning: Cite specifics and explain your conclusions or you'll lose points.

Write legibly.

Don't write more than is necessary. (There are no extra points for extra sentences.)

PART I: Video Deconstructions (3 videos, 45 points)

Analyze the TV news clips based on our guidelines and discussions. Be aware that any story can have strong aspects and weak aspects or elements of both, but in the end a news consumer has to make a judgment about the story.

Video #1 (15 points) "TSA Security Sting"

<http://abcnews.go.com/GMA/video/tsa-agent-found-abc-ipad-brian-ross-blotter-17336428?tab=9482931§ion=10268699&playlist=1299636>

1. In what way does this reporter "open the freezer" or fail to do so? (2 points)

2. Fill out the following evaluation chart. (3 points)

Source Evaluation Chart using IMVAIN rating scales		
Put an "X" in the appropriate boxes, then explain each rating.		
Source: "TSA told us..." (reporter says near the end of the report)		
Independent		Self-Interested
Explain:		
Multiple (Corroborated)		Lone/Solitary
Explain:		
Verifies		Asserts
Explain:		
Authoritative/Informed		Unauthoritative/Uninformed
Explain:		
Named		Anonymous
Explain:		
Overall, how reliable is information from this source?		
Put an "X" in the appropriate box, then explain your rating.		Very Unreliable
		Somewhat Unreliable
		Somewhat Reliable
		Very Reliable
Explain:		

3. Fill out the following evaluation chart on the source. (3 points)

Source Evaluation Chart using IMVAIN rating scales		
Put an "X" in the appropriate boxes, then explain each rating.		
Source: Andy Ramirez, TSA baggage screener		
Independent		Self-Interested
Explain:		
Multiple (Corroborated)		Lone/Solitary
Explain:		
Verifies		Asserts
Explain:		
Authoritative/Informed		Unauthoritative/Uninformed
Explain:		
Named		Anonymous
Explain:		
Overall, how reliable is information from this source?		
Put an "X" in the appropriate box, then explain your rating.		Very Unreliable
		Somewhat Unreliable
		Somewhat Reliable
		Very Reliable
Explain:		

4. What is missing from this story that would provide greater context? Describe at least two examples of missing context. (2 points)

5. Decide if you think this reporter is demonstrating fairness, balance or bias and then cite the evidence for your conclusion. (3 points)

6. Based on this report, can you conclude the risk of theft at TSA screening stations is unusually high? Using course concepts (as opposed to an emotional reaction to the story), explain your answer (2 points)

Video #2 (15 points) Ammonia Risks in Harris County

<http://www.click2houston.com/news/121-Harris-County-facilities-registered-with-EPA-to-use-anhydrous-ammonia/-/1735978/19809774/-/9r5sln/-/index.html>

7. Who is missing from this report and what might their comments add? (4 points)

8. Fill out the following evaluation chart.(3 points)

Source Evaluation Chart using IMVAIN rating scales	
Put an "X" in the appropriate boxes, then explain each rating.	
Source: Dr. Rob Emery, University of Texas School of Public Health	
Independent	
Self-Interested	
Explain:	
Multiple (Corroborated)	
Lone/Solitary	
Explain:	
Verifies	
Asserts	
Explain:	
Authoritative/Informed	
Unauthoritative/Uninformed	
Explain:	
Named	
Anonymous	
Explain:	

Overall, how reliable is information from this source?	
Put an "X" in the appropriate box, then explain your rating.	Very Unreliable
	Somewhat Unreliable
	Somewhat Reliable
	Very Reliable
Explain:	

9. List one example each of context and transparency in this report AND explain how each makes the story more useful to you as a resident of that TV station's community. (5 points)

10. Can you conclude from this report that all stored anhydrous ammonia locations are equally risky? Explain using information from the story. (3 points)

Video #3 (15 points) Autism/Vaccination Correlations

<http://www.nbcnews.com/id/3032619/ns/NBCNightlyNews/#51376272>

11. Decide if you think this TV news story is fair, balanced or biased and then cite the evidence for your conclusion. (3 points)

12. Fill out the following evaluation chart. (3 points)

Source Evaluation Chart using IMVAIN rating scales	
Put an "X" in the appropriate boxes, then explain each rating.	
<i>Source: Dr. Frank DeStefano, Centers for Disease Control</i>	
Independent	Self-Interested
Explain:	
Multiple (Corroborated)	Lone/Solitary
Explain:	
Verifies	Asserts
Explain:	
Authoritative/Informed	Unauthoritative/Uninformed
Explain:	
Named	Anonymous
Explain:	

Overall, how reliable is information from this source?	
Put an "X" in the appropriate box, then explain your rating.	Very Unreliable
	Somewhat Unreliable
	Somewhat Reliable
	Very Reliable
Explain:	

13. Fill out the following evaluation chart (3 points)

Source Evaluation Chart using IMVAIN rating scales	
Put an "X" in the appropriate boxes, then explain each rating.	
Source: "Dr. Tanya Altmann, Pediatrician"	
Independent	Self-Interested
Explain:	
Multiple (Corroborated)	Lone/Solitary
Explain:	
Verifies	Asserts
Explain:	
Authoritative/Informed	Unauthoritative/Uninformed
Explain:	
Named	Anonymous
Explain:	

Overall, how reliable is information from this source?	
Put an "X" in the appropriate box, then explain your rating.	Very Unreliable
	Somewhat Unreliable
	Somewhat Reliable
	Very Reliable
Explain:	

14. Identify an example of transparency the report provides and describe how it affects your judgment of the reliability of the report. (2 points)

15. There are political activists who say scientists have under-stated the risks posed by vaccinating children. Are their doubts fairly addressed in this news report? Using course concepts, explain your answer . (2 points)

16. Can you conclude from this report that you should have your children vaccinated? Using course concepts, explain your answer. (2 points)

PART II: Text Deconstructions (questions for 35 points)

Read the accompanying story before answering the following questions. Be aware that any story can have strong aspects and weak aspects or elements of both, but in the end a news consumer has to make a judgment about the story. BE SPECIFIC IN YOUR RESPONSES AND SUPPORT YOUR CONCLUSIONS by referring to the paragraph number where your support is found. Hand the print-out of the story in with your answer sheet, with your name on both.

17. Given there are 36,000 acres of farmland and almost 600 farms on Long Island alone, plus large immigrant and African American communities on Long Island, what kinds of cognitive dissonance or audience bias might a reader of this article fall prey to? Explain, using course concepts and at least two references to specific paragraphs in the article. (5 points)

18. What News Literacy concept is paragraph # 20 an example of? Explain your answer. (5 points)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 14 pt, No underline, Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 14 pt, No underline, Font color: Auto

Formatted: Font: Times New Roman, 14 pt, No underline, Font color: Auto

19. Who is missing from this story? (2 points)

20. Is this story balanced, fair or biased? Cite specific paragraphs and use News Literacy course concepts to explain your answer. (4 points)

21. Did the reporters open the freezer? Cite specific paragraphs to support your conclusion and explain, using the concepts of direct and indirect evidence) how their opening or not opening the freezer affects the reliability of the article. (4 points)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 14 pt, Font color: Black

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 14 pt, Font color: Black

Formatted: Font: (Default) Times New Roman, 14 pt, Font color: Black

22. Which of the following sources do you consider reliable and which do you rate as unreliable? Use the IMVAIN rubric to explain your ratings of each source: Brian Stanley, Jim Knoepp, Cindy Hahamovitch (10 points)

23. After deconstructing this article, can you conclude that onion farmers prefer Mexican workers because they work harder and tolerate mistreatment? Cite specific paragraphs containing the evidence on which you base your answer.(5 points)

Note to Students: For the purposes of this News Literacy exam, a New York Times article has been greatly altered, mostly by cutting it from 5,000 words to 1,700. Students are reminded to answer exam questions based on this version, not any version they may recall reading. Paragraphs are numbered to allow you to answer questions by making reference to specific paragraphs. Underlined words indicate hyperlinks that were built into the Times' online version of the report.

The New York Times

Published: January 25, 2012

Workers Claim Race Bias as Farms Rely on Immigrants

By ETHAN BRONNER

Published: May 6, 2013 559 Comments

1. VIDALIA, Ga. — For years, labor unions and immigrant rights activists have accused large-scale farmers, like those harvesting sweet Vidalia onions here this month, of exploiting Mexican guest workers. Working for hours on end under a punishing sun, [the pickers](#) are said to be crowded into squalid camps, driven without a break and even cheated of wages.
2. But as Congress weighs [immigration](#) legislation expected to expand the [guest worker program](#), another group is increasingly crying foul — Americans, mostly black, who live near the farms and say they want the field work but cannot get it because it is going to Mexicans. They contend that they are illegally discouraged from applying for work and treated shabbily by farmers who prefer the foreigners for their malleability.
3. “They like the Mexicans because they are scared and will do anything they tell them to,” said Sherry Tomason, who worked for seven years in the fields here, then quit. Last month she and other local residents filed a federal lawsuit against a large grower of onions, Stanley Farms, alleging that it mistreated them and paid them less than it paid the Mexicans.
4. The suit is one of a number of legal actions containing similar complaints against farms, including a large one in Moultrie, Ga., where Americans said they had been fired because of their race and national origin, given less desirable jobs and provided with fewer work opportunities than Mexican guest workers. Under a consent decree with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, the farm, Southern Valley, agreed to make certain changes.

5. With local unemployment about 10 percent and the bureaucracy for hiring foreigners onerous — guest workers have to be imported and housed and require extensive paperwork — it would seem natural for farmers to hire from their own communities, which they did a generation ago.
6. In fact, the farmers say, they would dearly like to.
7. “We have tried to fill our labor locally,” said Brian Stanley, an owner of Stanley Farms, which is being sued by Ms. Tomason and others. “But we couldn’t get enough workers, and that was hindering our growth. So we turned to the guest worker program.”
8. The vast majority of farm workers in the country are not in the guest worker program but are simply unauthorized immigrants. The plan to place those workers on a path to legal status would reduce the chances of their being exploited, the bill’s sponsors say, and thereby also improve the status of Americans who feel they cannot compete against vulnerable foreigners.
9. Mr. Stanley, like other farmers, argues that Americans who say they want the work end up quitting because it is hard, leaving the crops to rot in the fields. But the situation is filled with cultural and racial tensions.
10. Even many of the Americans who feel mistreated acknowledge that the Mexicans who arrive on buses for a limited period are incredibly efficient, often working into the night seven days a week to increase their pay.
11. “We are not going to run all the time,” said Henry Rhymes, who was fired — unfairly, he says — from Southern Valley after a week on the job. “We are not Mexicans.”
12. Jon Schwalls, director of operations at Southern Valley, made a similar point.
13. “When Jose gets on the bus to come here from Mexico he is committed to the work,” he said. “It’s like going into the military. He leaves his family at home. The work is hard, but he’s ready. A domestic wants to know: What’s the pay? What are the conditions? In these communities, I am sorry to say, there are no fathers at home, no role models for hard work. They want rewards without input.”

14. Such generalizations lead lawyers — and residents — to say there are racist undertones to the farms' policies.
15. "I am not arguing that agricultural work is a good job," said Dawson Morton, a lawyer who focuses on farm workers' rights at the [Georgia Legal Services Program](#), a nonprofit law firm. "I am arguing that it could be a better job. If you want experienced people, train them. Just because people are easier to supervise, agricultural employers shouldn't be able to import them. It is not true that Americans don't want the work. What the farmers are really saying is that blacks just don't want to work."
16. To which J. Larry Stine, an Atlanta lawyer for Stanley Farms and other big farms, replied: "The farmers are not racist or against Americans. They have crops to be picked, and they see that domestics just don't have their hearts in it."
17. Jim Knoepp of the [Southern Poverty Law Center](#), a nonprofit group that has campaigned against the guest worker program, said that farm work, like other difficult labor, could be made attractive to Americans at reasonable cost, and that farmers should not be excused from doing so.
18. "There used to be lots of American pickers who moved around the country," he said. "But wages have stagnated and conditions have deteriorated, and agriculture is unwilling to make these jobs attractive. Think of trash collection. That's not very appealing, either. But if you offer a decent wage and conditions, people do it."
19. Cindy Hahamovitch, an expert on guest worker programs at the College of William and Mary in Virginia, said that in the 1970s about two-thirds of farm workers were Americans and a third were foreign, and that a decade later the proportion was reversed. Today, she said, the vast majority of farm workers around the country are immigrants, although not in the guest worker program.
20. Republicans in Congress, mindful of the Democrats' desire to bring legal status to the nation's 11 million unauthorized immigrants, have made an expansion of the guest worker program a key element of any deal. Current proposals include increasing the number and category of temporary workers to the dairy and construction industries, and increasing their stays from a matter of months to three years so that employers have the workers they say they need.

21. The guest workers who are planting cucumbers for Southern Valley and harvesting onions for Stanley Farms are among 10,000 holders of H-2A visas in Georgia this year and 85,000 nationally. They are generally guaranteed a minimum wage of just over \$9 an hour, but are paid per piece and can boost those wages by increasing their productivity. Other workers, known as H-2B and numbering around 65,000, labor in other businesses in which there is a demand for temporary or seasonal workers, including hotels.
22. Employers must show that they have tried to hire Americans through advertising and other means and that they could not attract enough of them before resorting to the H-2 system. In the litigation that resulted in the consent decree with Southern Valley, the federal government argued that the effort had not been made or had been intentionally not serious. Excuses were used not to hire locals or to fire them — training was minimal, and people were fired when they were less skilled than others who had been doing the work for years.
23. “You’ve got some people who don’t work as fast as Mexicans, but they don’t teach you, and it can be learned,” said Misty Johnson, who was fired and then rehired by Southern Valley as part of the consent decree.
24. For the past few months, Southern Valley has been required to provide daily bus transportation to the farm and demonstrate that it was training and retaining Americans. But a recent inspection of those efforts left federal officials unimpressed.
25. Southern Valley officials make no secret of their belief that the consent decree — the free bus, the orientation program they now run and the training — is a waste of their time and money. They assert that there is no discrimination and that they would prefer to hire locals if they could.
26. Lawyers for the local workers say the system is rigged to favor low-cost foreign labor because, given the conditions and the pay, no one else will do it.
27. “If you can’t find locals to do the work, why is the answer to bring in people who have little protection and not grant them legal status?” asked Mr. Knoepp of the Southern Poverty Law Center. “If we need them, why not bring them in and make them legal citizens with real protections? The answer is because then they

wouldn't keep working in the fields given the conditions of that work. They would do something else. It doesn't have to be this way."