Stony Brook University

“Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins: Immigrant Women and Transnational Narrative in Contemporary Spain”

A Dissertation Presented

by

Neica Michelle Shepherd

to

The Graduate School

In Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

In Hispanic Languages and Literature

Stony Brook University

May 2010

Stony Brook University

The Graduate School

Neica Michelle Shepherd

We, the dissertation committee for the above candidate for the Doctor of Philosophy degree, hereby recommend acceptance of this dissertation.

Daniela Flesler-Dissertation Advisor
Associate Professor, Hispanic Languages and Literature

Kathleen Vernon-Chairperson of Defense
Associate Professor, Hispanic Languages and Literature

Lou Charnon-Deutsch
Professor, Hispanic Languages and Literature

Victoria Hesford
Assistant Professor, Women's and Gender Studies

Adrián Pérez Melgosa
Assistant Professor, Hispanic Languages and Literature

Parvati Nair
Professor of Hispanic Cultural Studies
Queen Mary, University of London

This dissertation is accepted by the Graduate School

Lawrence Martin
Dean of the Graduate School

Abstract of the Dissertation

"Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins: Immigrant Women and Transnational Narrative in Contemporary Spain"

by

Neica Michelle Shepherd

Doctor of Philosophy

in

Hispanic Languages and Literature

Stony Brook University

2010

Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins analyzes transnational literature and films produced from the 1990s to the present and draws upon literary theory, feminist theory, and cultural studies. This dissertation examines how the elaboration of Spanish national identity is challenged, diverted, and re-shaped in representations of feminine immigration in a seemingly post-national era characterized by porous national borders. Several of the tropes deployed in the contemporary texts call attention to the psychological and ideological legacies of Spain's conflictive histories with the Americas, Africa, and even Europe, evincing the vestiges of traumatic histories that continue to bear upon individual and collective structures of nationalistic identification and desire. This negotiation of immigration, representation, and agency serves as the basis of the dissertation.

My dissertation begins with an examination the intersection of race and gender in nationalistic discourse in 20th century works by Carmen Laforet, Lucía Etxebarria, and Manuel Gutiérrez Aragón. I then read contemporary depictions of immigrant life in Gerardo Muñoz Lorente's novel *Ramito de hierbabuena*, Nieves García Benito's short stories "Cailcedrat" and "Gabriela" and the films *Extranjeras* (dir. Helena Taberna 2003), *Princesas de África* (dir. Juan Laguna 2008), and *En la puta vida* (dir. Beatriz Flores Silva 2001) alongside theories of documentary narrative, including Latin American *testimonio*, Roland Barthes's philosophical approaches to photography, and documentary film theory. I examine the figure of the immigrant woman as prostitute and chart a genealogy of prostitutes in Spanish literature in 19th century novels by naturalist Eduardo López Bago to recent literary works by Lourdes Ortiz, Laila Lalami, and Fernando León de Aranoa's film *Princesas* (2005). My dissertation culminates in an analysis of contemporary Spanish multiculturalism as a demanding and risky ideal, as figured in the work of Najat el Hachemi and in the films *Flores de otro mundo* (dir. Iciar Bollaín 1999) and *I love you, baby* (dir. Alfonso Albacete and David Menkes 2003). In these final analyses I am interested in how gender and racial difference structure the modes through which the Other is imagined and represented in relation to the society in which she attempts to reside.

Table of Contents

Introduction

Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins engages representations of immigrant women in contemporary Spanish Peninsular literature and film. Toward the end of the twentieth century, Spain witnessed a shift in its global status, resulting in a surge in immigration. Indeed, a nation that provided migrant workers for the vast majority of the century now received thousands of immigrants from a multiplicity of world nations. This phenomenon is somewhat magnified by Spain's insularity for most of the twentieth century.

This dissertation specifically analyzes representations of women from Africa, Latin America, and the Caribbean. Several of these areas have centuries-old relationships with Spain, because of the Moorish Conquest and settlement—and subsequent Spanish *Reconquista*—and Spain's numerous colonial enterprises. Hence, while Spain remained excluded from the world stage following World War II, the historical connections to these cultures from which these new populations originate are undeniable. There is a simultaneous attachment and detachment from these new Spaniards that draws upon atavistic forms of knowing the Other while embracing the particularities of the present context. This phenomenon is best articulated by Anne McClintock in her critique of the term *postcolonial*, in which she posits: "Colonialism returns at the moment of its disappearance" (11). The prefix *post* belies the continuities and discontinuities of power in contemporary exchanges with colonial traces, such as immigration, which are often considered neocolonial. Portrayals of immigrant women evince forms of knowing idiosyncratic to Spain and its peculiar relationship to its new residents and reflect the

power paradigms at work in postcolonial or neocolonial relationships that structure immigration.

My dissertation focuses on women since, as Rosi Song asserts, women immigrants often function as intermediaries, vectors of immigration that influence integration and assimilation (45). Women are acculturated into Spanish society in a particular manner that entails gender; for if they opt to remain, they will reproduce this culture and propagate conceptualizations of home aligned with the way in which Spanish national identities are imagined.

When immigrant women are represented, their exteriority and foreignness are often underscored, thus making them seem distant from collective understandings of home, a microcosm for the nation. For example, Ruth Mestre i Mestre observes that legal discourses expound three models of immigrant women as wives of Spaniards, domestic workers in Spanish homes, or victims of organized crime syndicates based in the country of origin (142). As Judith Butler reminds us in *Gender Trouble*, such juridical discourse inevitably produces what it claims to represent (3). The immigrant identity constructed in such legal claims favors a collective imagining of immigrant women rooted in their exteriority. Contemporary depictions in fiction often reflect or magnify the tenor of these legal discourses, positioning women in rather extreme cases of the three scenarios above, all of which differ significantly from the ways in which national men and women are portrayed owing to both gender and ethnic difference.

Transnational narratives represent the act of immigration, often feature protagonists from the underdeveloped world who voyage to Spain, and represent these protagonists' relationship to the nation of origin and Spain. Contemporary narratives of

immigration often portray sensationalized scenarios that reveal collective anxieties about immigrants. Notions of racial and gender difference, also heavily reliant on fantasy, also inform depictions of immigrant women in contemporary Spanish literature and film. Tabea Linhard asserts that such narratives of immigration in contemporary Spain evince multiple, often messy layers of representation that reveal histories of Colonialism and Orientalism in Spain (401). Such histories, coupled with Spain's unique position in relation to Africa, Europe, and Latin America inform representations in contemporary transnational Spanish literature and film, thus providing a rich terrain for analyzing constructions of difference and processes of "othering" during an era of globalization and within an increasingly multicultural state.

In the Introduction to *The Second Sex,* published in 1949, Simone de Beauvoir details the various modes through which women are posited as the Other against which the (masculine) One defines himself. In a similar argument that entails race as opposed to gender, Frantz Fanon contends affirms that "the real Other for the white man is and will continue to be the black man" (*Masks* 161). These fundamental theories on difference, gender, and race serve as the foundation for this project. The double alterity that foreign women often face consists of this intersection of gender and racial Othering described by de Beauvoir and Fanon and its articulation in Spanish nationalistic discourse.

My dissertation asks: What representational economies mark these women as "Other"—unknown owing to collective understanding of race, ethnicity, and gender? How is this supposed unknown being translated into something relatable or "readable" for Spanish culture? As the title suggests, the border and national identity are key elements in this project. Hence, I analyze the construction of the Spanish border

genealogically. Further, how do these representations depict immigrant women's ability to navigate life in Spain? What is the degree of reciprocity in the relationship between sociality and a text that alleges a realistic representation of the social? What strategies of resistance emerge to restrictive representations?

Arjun Appadurai observes that immigration possesses the capacity to construct new forms of sociality in transforming the ground of *habitus*. According to Appadurai, it is the stability implied by Pierre Bourdieu's term, *habitus*, that is being everywhere devoured by a modernity that is now "at large," thereby depriving the nation-state of its previous authority as a structuring element in people's lives. Imagination serves as a democratized site of agency, owing to the media and the possibilities afforded by migration (44).

While imagination allows immigrants to conceptualize themselves in new ways, once in the social sphere, they often have preexisting models of being or stereotypes forced upon them. The gap that results from the immigrant's configuration of her identity versus the one imposed on her from the social sphere constitutes a mis-recognition. Hegel exposed both the intersubjective dynamic central to recognition and the relationships of power that surge from struggles of recognition. Immigration complicates the phenomenon of recognition in allowing for forms of mimicry, masking, and assimilation that often demand contradictory forms of recognition. According to Judith Butler, recognition allows us to become "socially viable beings" (*Undoing* 2). Such recognition arises because of the legibility of bodies in the public sphere, and the recognizability of certain physical characteristics, such as sex, ethnicity, etc.

This dissertation analyzes these corporeal morphologies, the structuring elements that precede, mediate, and even construct subject positions and determine how bodies are both read and interpreted. Judith Butler asserts that bodies are recognized through certain cultural norms and paradigms (*Undoing* 2). Foreign bodies desiring to be recognized as legitimate, relevant, and assimilable are often denied this concession. In this vein, I question how certain bodies are written or utilized to evoke conceptualizations of recognizable difference and thus, generate certain collective responses. How does an author craft characteristics and scenarios that convey legible difference in terms of gender and race for the intended readers/viewers? How are these foreign bodies recognized as they are inscribed into texts?

My project is highly informed by my own experience as an African-American traveler to Spain in the late 1990s and then returning there in 2002. The legibility of my body in the Spanish public sphere elicited readings initially indicative of novelty and, later, palpable discomfort. An array of significations resulting from global politics were impressed upon my person, against my will. I first traveled to Spain in 1996, on vacation with a large group of Americans. I noticed that the Spaniards who did respond to my presence considered my racial difference attractive or cute. My presence confirmed Spain's potency as a cosmopolitan tourist destination; I was welcomed as an exotic, fascinating "Other" by the Spanish nationals with whom I interacted. My initial encounters that evinced my status as an interesting, although exoticized "Other" would not be repeated.

I returned to Spain in 2002 and remained until 2004 as a Master's student at NYU in Madrid. By 2002, the immigrant population had nearly quadrupled, from 542,314 in

1996 to 1,977,946 and gained a degree of visibility in the Spanish public sphere. During this period, I received a myriad of stares, grimaces, and comments that conveyed my status as an "Other." The most disturbing dimension of this characterization for me was that I was seen in wholly different terms than my predominantly white American classmates and colleagues, who were usually perceived as foreign or even strange, but harmless and whimsical. On the other hand, I was viewed as an outsider, worthy of Spanish derision. I was expelled from my comfortable subject position not only as a scholar, but also as an American citizen by a Spanish public that immediately categorized me as an illegal immigrant, *sin papeles*, most likely from Africa or the Caribbean.

These episodes reminded me of those Fanon experienced in France in the mid-twentieth century owing to the disjuncture between his own configurations of his body and his persona versus those impressed on him by the French public. The responses my mere presence elicited in Spain have led me to study in greater detail those conceptions of Spain's nationhood that my body visibly contradicted. I examine how gender and race inform national identity and complicate nationalistic discourse in a multicultural society.

Chapter one situates Spain within several theoretical frameworks, including border studies, critical race theory, postcolonial theory, and postmodernist feminist theory. I utilize several philosophers who build upon conceptualizations of race and gender begun by Fanon and De Beauvoir. I utilize post-colonial theory as this line of thought engages with both cultural identity and nationalism. I employ postmodern feminist theory, which postulates the constructedness of gender and the intersectionality of gender with other socially created categories such as race and class. I also draw on the work of women of color feminists, specifically Gloria Anzaldúa and Patricia Hill Collins,

who study the marginalization of Latina and African-American women's experiences in America, respectively. I apply their methodologies and theories to the rather peculiar and novel situation in Spain.

I begin by charting how gender and racial dynamics have informed nationalistic discourses in Spain, building upon the work of George Mariscal in his seminal article "The Role of Spain in Contemporary Race Theory." I also engage literary and cultural critics such as Israel Burshatin, Lou Charnon Deutsch, Daniela Flesler, Barbara Fuchs, Susan Martín-Márquez, and Parvati Nair who each address the role of race and racialization with regard to North African Moors, Gypsies, and the formerly colonized, in various points in Spain's history. In addition, I examine gendered articulations of national identity in the works of Carmen Laforet and Lucía Etxebarria. The ways in which gender and race are imagined reflect the constructedness of each category, constructions that have rigidly structured and divided populations within the Peninsula and continue to do so in the contemporary context of globalized immigration.

This chapter also takes into account Spain's historical liminal position with regard to Europe and how its nationalistic discourse seeks to recuperate a form of "European-ness" that paradoxically embraces its geographic position as a border to assert its inclusion. Spain's ambivalent position toward other nations, resulting from its most recent period of isolation, allows for re-conceptualizing constructions of hybridity and fluidity central to several theoretical positions, like cultural studies and postcolonial studies. Further, I engage the notion of "postcolonial Europe," a critical approach that reassesses Europe not only in its past imperial pluralities and contemporary divergent

multicultural scenarios, but also with regard to the primacy of de-territorialization and migration in creating a sense of indeterminacy.

In terms of the collective imagination and cartography, Spain, as the delimiter of Europe and not-Europe is therefore unequivocally within Europe. This manifests the nation's ability to establish relationships with other nations in defense of an agenda that is both Spanish and now, European. Thus, this chapter examines nationalistic discourse, indubitably a counterpoint to representations of immigration, within Spain's circumstances. For example, Wendy Brown notes that in a seemingly post-national world in which borders are increasingly porous, several nations have demonstrated a keen interest in re-asserting their sovereignty with walls and barricades. Indeed, Spain plans to construct more barricades to supplement current walled enclaves in its North African territory. These barriers symbolize an aversion to rampant immigration, despite Spain's multicultural, post-national fantasies.

I examine how these fantasies arise in Etxebarria's 2009 collection of short stories *Cosmofobia* and in Manuel Gutiérrez Aragón's film *Cosas que dejé en la Habana* (1996). In the former, fantasies of the Other function to divide the residents of a Madrid neighborhood. In the film, on the other hand, fantasy works to unite the immigrants with their Madrid neighbors, yet only when they perform and behave in a way that Spaniards think Cubans ought to act, thus stereotyping them and affirming their alterity within Spanish sociality.

Chapter two investigates the forms of representation customarily used to depict immigrant life. While most of the texts studied in this chapter are purportedly true or rooted in real events, they manifest a noticeable degree of fantasy that subverts their

claims to authenticity and veracity. The wholly fictional texts I analyze in this chapter employ photographs to substantiate the realistic nature of the texts, thereby asserting that mimeticism is their primary aim. Many of the photographs that accompany these texts, furthermore, display the suffering and trauma that immigrants experience. This chapter, thus, is primarily concerned with the forms of mimesis reserved for the Other and questions the purpose of this re-presentation of reality that increasingly focuses on suffering and violence.

Another trope I identify in immigrant narratives is tragedy. Specifically, the tragic denotes the several reversals of fortune experienced by the protagonists and a remarkable lack of agency in determining their fates. In *The Death of Tragedy*, George Steiner posits that tragic drama demonstrates that the human spheres of reason, order, and justice are limited, and that no progress in our science or technical resources can improve our limited human faculties. Thus, human endeavors to improve our stations in life or to modify our destinies are often fruitless. In these transnational narratives, the initial decision to migrate, which suggests a considerable degree of power over one's life and its direction, often unleashes a series of events over which the protagonists have no control. This paradoxical representation of agency structures these narratives and increases the sense of tragedy in them. Like tragic heroes of the past, these protagonists are portrayed as following courses of action—in these examples, migration—which lead to their demise.

Chapter two also examines how the shipwreck has functioned in Hispanic literature; in colonial literature, the shipwreck suggested discovery and individual drive and innovation. This paradigm has been inverted in the contemporary context. The

shipwreck now, both literally and figuratively, signifies an inability to navigate. The primacy of the *patera* in the Spanish cultural imagination, evident in its prevalence in the Spanish press, as the vessel that transports immigrants to Spain is highly significant. These precarious, often dilapidated boats convey both the desperation and determination of Spain's new residents. Sinewy brown bodies strewn across the Spanish shore are the ultimate tragedy of the immigrants' odyssey to Europe. When the *patera* capsizes, although the protagonist may survive, a number of similarly unfortunate "turns" ensue, which customarily culminate in a disaster. Even when the *patera* does not capsize, those contained within it still experience tragedy during their trajectories in the Peninsula, either subjugated to this initial traumatic experience of arrival, or later construed by others in light of this primal moment.

While most immigrants, such as those from Latin America, do not arrive in *pateras*, their trajectories in literature and in film are still marked in terms of the shipwreck trope, an inherently ill-fated venture. Usually, several harrowing events follow an initial scene of trauma. Hence, even without a literal *patera*, their experience continues to bear the mark of desperation and suffering that these boats connote. In contrast to narratives that suggest that migration ought to create a new situation in which immigrants exert agency over their lives and futures, these narratives seem to convey that migration actually inculcates new forms of marginalization that calls attention to the global scope of the migrants' plight, which cannot be easily remedied through relocation.

Chapter three identifies the specific experiences that occur in the female protagonists' lives that convey startling reversals of fortune and a lack of control over their lives. In the texts, violence and suffering mark immigrant women's existence, in

remarkably “feminine” modalities. Protagonists in the films *Princesas* (dir. Fernando León de Aranoa 2005) and *En la puta vida*; the novels *Esperanza y otros sueños* (2006) and *Ramito de Hierbabuena* (2001); and the short story “La piel de Marcelinda” (1998) work as prostitutes in order to survive. Thus, in this chapter, I explore the figure of the prostitute and her construction.[1] Indeed, prostitution is employed to signify the culmination of a tragic, markedly feminine existence.

The prostitute as a character crystallizes in nineteenth century naturalist novels; in Spain, Eduardo López Bago, inspired by Emile Zola’s naturalism, writes medico-social novels that purport to study the prostitute as the result of circumstances intrinsic to urban life in Europe’s increasingly populous metropolises. The prostitute also manifests a preoccupation with “otherness” useful to this analysis. The prostitute is represented as possessing an excessive sexuality that constitutes a threat not only to the moral fiber of society, but also to social stability. The preoccupation with hygiene in nineteenth century cities reflects collective concern regarding prostitutes’ ability to infect the public sphere. The prostitute’s lustful, wanton ways serve to rupture not only her own body, but also the social body and, thus, she requires regulation solely for the maintenance of civil society. The *lupanar* novels, which narrate life in urban bordellos, increase in popularity as public interest in issues of hygiene, insalubrities, eugenics, and the debilitated institution of marriage garner wider attention (Fernández 47). These novels serve as cautionary tales and thus convey to the reader that excessive work, modest income, illness, and painful death are the principal characteristics of prostitutes’ lives (Fernández 116).

In the twentieth century, the scarcity of resources following the Spanish Civil War compelled some women to sell their bodies. At the same time, Francoist discourse re-

asserted a cult of true womanhood inhering in woman's social contributions as wives and mothers. Women who worked, especially in prostitution, were deplorable and, hence, antithetical to the normative construction of Spanish womanhood. Contemporary portrayals of immigrant prostitutes contain traces of these tendencies. In addition to the factors mentioned above, a cultural imagination fascinated, in Anne McClintock's terminology, with the colony as "porno-tropics," (22) is also instrumental in contemporary constructions of prostitution. Excessive sexuality, otherness, and contagion converge on both the prostitute's body and the immigrant's body, providing a stark contrast to traditional symbolization of national women.

The national homeland or *la patria* was conceived in ideal terms as a vast family, both in nineteenth century medical-moral texts and in twentieth century nationalistic Francoist propaganda; in such a paradigm, certain groups of women, such as immigrants and prostitutes, are explicitly omitted from that patriarchal family owing to their ability to penetrate and poison this ideally pure unit with moral and physical infirmity, degradation, and criminality. Protitution resonates with question of national identity raised in chapter one and illustrates chapter two's issues of tragedy in a frequently feminine form.

Chapter four engages putative "solutions" to the problematic of feminine migration as elaborated in the primary texts. Two axes of resolution seem most pertinent. The first is a model of domestication, articulated through marriage or friendship with a Spaniard. Such is the case of the character Patricia, who marries a Spanish farmer in *Flores de otro mundo* (dir. Iciar Bolaín 2005) and Olga, who befriends a Spanish coworker in *Agua con sal* (dir. Pedro Pérez Rosado 2006). In these characterizations, the feminine immigrant typifies ambivalence as a subject who is both inside yet positioned at

the margin, exemplifying Patricia Hill Collins's notion of the "pet." The "pet" signifies the ideal model of domesticated, manageable "otherness" that the nation seeks to sustain with certain populations, particularly with regard to women. The "pet" model is useful in explicating the wide spectrum of processes of "othering" and the ambivalence of the outsider within, the domesticated alien, or the familiar stranger.

The second model of resolution is expulsion. *Princesas, Agua con sal,* and "Fátima de los Naufragios" conclude with the protagonist leaving Spain, yet in distinct contexts. Some of these women are portrayed as containing a level of toxicity that makes their presence in Spain dangerous for nationals. Zule, the Dominican prosititute in *Princesas,* is infected with HIV; she decides to return home after surviving several traumatic episodes in Madrid. In this chapter, I refer to the work of Julia Kristeva who argues in *Power of Horror: An Essay on Abjection* (1982) that bodies thrive in releasing the death within via processes of abjection; this is the case of both the individual and the social body. In this vein, Zule must return to her nation so that Spain may thrive. In *Agua con sal* and in "Fátima de los naufragios," the feminine immigrants depart after edifying Spaniards with which they have interacted during their respective journeys. Again, their departures indicate resolution more for the Spanish *pueblo* than for the migrants themselves.

These two models of domestication and/or expulsion are related to the extent to which the protagonist is able to assimilate. The protagonists' actions simultaneously suggest the notion of increased agency immanent to migratory projects and negate this agency. These denials of agency, subsequently unfurled following the decision to migrate, suggest that a contemporary notion of the tragic structures the transnational

narrative. While the initial decision to migrate may seem libratory, upon arrival in the West, immigrant women experience novel modes of exploitation. As Solé and Parella observe, women who immigrate and leave their families in the nation of origin are not experiencing any sort of "liberation." On the contrary, they become involved in a new mode of exploitation often unmentioned in Western feminist discourses (4). Hence, transnational narratives must also consider the customary conflation of the site of origin as a monolithic site of oppression and the West as one of freedom must also be considered in composing the ideas of suffering and mechanisms to remedy this suffering in these texts (Alicea, qd. in Solé and Parella 16). This notion also relates to the peculiar position of women within society, their level of assimilability upon migrating, and the manner in which they are depicted in transnational narrative, both in the nation of origin and in Spain.

This chapter engages Spain's new concern with multiculturalism, as tenuous as the Spanish project of integration and multiculturalism may be. While the previous chapter addressed who is admitted symbolically into Spain in deconstructing assimilability, this chapter considers how immigration has modified the Spanish cultural landscape. How does immigration fit into current projects of nationalism and in resultant notions of Spanish identity? While the majority of my dissertation focuses on the *forms* of representation used to depict the experience of women immigrants, this chapter addresses the contexts of these representations as well. I situate these representations within the broader project of creating a pluralistic society and evaluate their impact on multicultural nation-building.

Chapter four also identifies new articulations of Spanish identity and the significance such representations have for Spanish literature and film. I read the work of Moroccan-born writer Najat el Hachmi and analyze the transformative effects of immigration both on the destination and on the immigrants themselves in *Jo també sóc catalana* (2004) and *L'últim patriarca* (2009). El Hachmi's narratives exemplify both the convoluted nature of identity and the rather quotidian nature of even drastic change. She grapples with her son's simple and perplexing question, "Am I Catalan, mother?" considering both Maghrebian-Spanish relations and the unique position of Catalonia within Spain. Indeed, contemporary Spanish literature and film presents a society of peoples in flux, with shifting relationships to history and national identity yet a national and cultural tradition whose traces are remarkably present.

In a seemingly post-national world with fluid borders, many of women immigrants are able to cross borders, demonstrating a literal will to change their station in life. Yet, the representation of this act repositions these women not as subjects with agency, but as objects to be represented who serve to revisit historical experiences with alterity in Spain, contrast with nationalistic subjects, or foment multicultural fantasies grounded in stereotype and superficiality. While borders may be crossed and boundaries transgressed, the scope of significations available to these women remains limited. This makes plain the firm refiguring of them in a manner deemed verisimilar in the destination, a manner in align with the universalizing and neo-colonial tendencies of European modernity.

[1] I do not discuss non-female prostitutes in this dissertation. Yet, I mention situations in which immigrant men's promiscuity is considered, such as a Cuban gigolo in the film *Cosas que dejé en la Habana*. There are representations of immigrant men who work as prostitutes, one example is Eduardo Mendicutti's novel *Los novios búlgaros* (1993); however, I will not address these in this dissertation.

CHAPTER 1: Women, Mobility, and Fantasies of National Space

From the 1990s on, immigration becomes a visible and unprecedented issue in Spain, compelling the nation to re-imagine itself in light of its sudden entry into a seemingly post-national world in which globalization and de-territorialization pose a threat to the concept of the closed, homogenous nation-state. Transnational narratives that engage the immigration question situate the immigrant protagonist between two cultures: that of the place of origin and the destination, Spain, thereby assessing not only Spain, but also Spain's relationship to other world nations and its particular role as the protector of Europe's borders.

The border is pivotal to this dissertation: how borders are imagined with regard to geography, ethnicity, and gender. When the Spanish nation is imagined, borders are drawn that delimit where Spain ends and where the rest of Europe and the African continent begin, and consequently, where cultural practices ought to differ, how national subjects ought to act, and how gendered behavior ought to occur. Nonetheless, in the new millennium, when migration blurs boundaries and crafts new subjectivities, what Cristián Ricci terms a "poetic space of in-between" increasingly portrays the hybridization of twenty-first century Spanish cultures (208). This chapter analyzes what happens when these imagined borders and concomitant identities are complicated through the contemporary phenomenon of immigration. In particular, feminine immigration allows for a re-conceptualization of home, of gendered citizenship, and of Spain's permeable borders with regard to the rest of the world and global culture.

According to the Association for Borderlands Studies, this field has gained new vitality and urgency in the twenty-first century. Border Studies as a form of inquiry is in itself "on the border" and consists of several theoretical approaches that converge to examine

identity and cultural politics in the United States. Border studies emerged from issues relevant to the Mexican-United States border, such as immigration, transculturation, cultural hybridity, and national identity, yet has expanded to include similar cultural exchanges at other borders. While Spain is not geographically contiguous to Africa, its separation from this continent by only 14 kilometers places Spain in a unique position. This position facilitated African entry into Europe in the Middle Ages; today, Spain's position is still discussed in debates about how to secure Europe's borders at the closest point of entry for African immigrants. In addition, Spain's intimate relationship with Latin America often effaces the differences within a Hispanic world separated by national boundaries, but united in language and culture. As in American border studies, questions of national identity, cultural hybridity, and transculturation circulate in the construction and imagination of Spain's border with its multiple neighbors.

The falseness of the border is also pivotal to its imagination and prevalence. In her *autohistoria* or self-history, *Borderlands – La Frontera: The New Mestiza*, Chicana feminist theorist Gloria Anzaldúa defines herself in light of the cultural hybridity manifest at the border as opposed to allowing one particular identity to be imposed on her by these borders. Anzaldúa defines the borderlands as "physically present wherever two or more cultures edge each other, where people of different races occupy the same territory, where under, lower, middle and upper classes touch, where the space between two individuals shrinks with intimacy" (19). Anzaldúa's statement could be applied to the situation in Spain today, as a nation in which several ethnicities, classes, and social groups are brought together, yet also distanced through various types of borders.

For Anzaldúa, the ideological and emotional investments in borders outweigh their physical importance; she states that they are "vague and undetermined place[s] created by the emotional residue of an unnatural border" (25). Similarly, Georg Simmel observes that "the border is not a spatial fact with a sociological impact, but a sociological fact that shapes spatiality" (in Dittgen 166). And Parvati Nair affirms that the border not only creates division, but knowledge about this division and those who inhabit the ambiguous space on either side of it; it is this separation that animates Anzaldúa to theorize the geographical and ideological imagining of the border in *Borderlands – La Frontera.*

In this chapter, I examine the union and fragmentation of the Spanish nation through borders. As Parvati Nair affirms, "the border, as a site of demarcation and as a point of contact and cultural exchange, selectively facilitates or obstructs passage. Located on the border are the symbols of power" ("Europe's 'Last' Wall" 22). Following her paradigm, I specifically question how borders are maintained through successive discourses on national identity; such discourses inevitably exclude certain groups, restricting their passage or mobility and creating privileged classes typified as ideal citizens while denigrating others. Spanish cultural productions provide a rich terrain on which to analyze and assess conceptualizations of national identity since Spain has a long history of incorporating and excluding certain groups through nationalistic discourse and praxis. Spanish cultural productions allow us to chart not only how some groups are idealized while others are marginalized, but also to perceive the ways in which gender combines with national discourse to create gendered, sexualized citizens, an issue that is fundamental throughout *Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins.*

A significant dimension of the border is *fantasy*, the imagination and propagation of an Other, imbued with an alterity and inassimilability that strengthens the idea of the border and galvanizes the national discourse that defends it. Nair cites Homi Bhabha who avers that contiguity calls our attention to the "jurisdictional unsettlement" that characterizes the contemporary context ("Europe's 'Last' Wall" 19). Yet this unsettlement only arises from the prior fantasy of national space, which is imagined as fixed and impenetrable, affirmed in fiercely guarded borders. This element of fantasy is exemplified in the historical fluctuations present in the seemingly arbitrary shifts in discourses of national identity and in the expansion of nationalistic discourse to include groups as nationals who were once marginalized and reviled.

Alterity and Nation-Building in Spain

Constructions of alterity are multilayered and contain traces of Spain's numerous encounters with difference throughout the nation's history. Discourses of national identity which often further the idea of Spain as European and Catholic have had to negotiate medieval Conquest by the Moors , the Jewish presence in Spain, the colonization of the Americas by Spanish conquistadors, the presence of the *Roma* or Gypsy populations in Spain, and contemporary immigration. In addition, these nationalistic discourses are complicated by Spain's peculiar relationship of exoticization and Orientalization within Europe.

In his widely cited *Orientalism,* Edward Said asserts that during imperialism, the Orient existed for Westerners primarily as a foil to their own culture, complete with a set of values that did not take into account the East's modern realities (85). Said states: "European culture was able to manage—and even produce—the Orient politically, sociologically,

militarily, ideologically, scientifically, and imaginatively during the post-Enlightenment period" (3). This discursive production of the East accentuates the power paradigms intrinsic to imperialist relations. Said affirms that "The scientist, the scholar, the missionary, the trader, or the soldier was in, or thought about, the Orient because he *could* be there, or could think about it, with very little resistance on the Orient's part" (7). The ability to *be there* both literally and figuratively allows a myriad of Europeans to explore the Orient and to allow their ideological backgrounds to bear upon this exploration without questioning the privileged position imperialist relations affords them. This position of authority facilitated a defining and delimiting of the Orient and its characteristics but also served to further nationalistic ideas at home. Said notes that for Ernest Renan, author of the seminal essay "What Is a Nation?" and his contemporaries in the fields of languages, cultures, and religions, the Orient was a necessity (137). Studying this region and its culture provided them the opportunity to structure and outline their own nations, languages, cultures and religions in opposition to the Orient.

Reina Lewis charts critiques and revisions of Said's work, citing theorists such as Anne McClintock, Lisa Lowe, Gayatri Spivak and Homi Bhabha who "stress the heterogeneity and instability of Orientalist discourse, demonstrating that its force was rarely hegemonic and uncontested" (3). In *Rethinking Orientalism*, Lewis attends to the problematic of women's experiences and writing in the Ottoman Empire, arguing that Said omitted the central role woman played to the formulation of Orientalism. For Lewis, "oriental women," owing to gender and ethnic difference, exemplify the center's desire and also highlight the concept of the exotic as erotic (7). Lewis's paradigm is further complicated by Spain's unique position, both literally and symbolically.

Orientalism is a very peculiar phenomenon in Spain. In her recent work on discourses of Moroccan immigration in contemporary Spain, *The Return of the Moor*, Daniela Flesler cites Lou Charnon-Deutsch and José Colmeiro in positing that a double-bind exists in articulations of Spanish identity (21). This paradox stems from Spain's repressing the Moorish and Semitic elements of its historical identity, othering these groups, while existing as a proximate-Orient for the rest of Europe (Flesler 21). In *Exotic Nation*, Barbara Fuchs examines Spain's development into a nation-state during the early modern period. Fuchs analyzes how Spain negotiates its Moorish past and highlights the constructedness of Spanish exoticism for political purposes by the rest of Europe (viii-x). She notes, "Spain's very success in its consolidation as a nation was accompanied by a pronounced European denunciation of its Moorishness, particularly as northern Europeans came to rule and administer Spain" (22). Fuchs's approach to Orientalism in Spain reflects the particular location and history that allows Spain to be exoticized by its European neighbors. She writes:

> Spain complicates the generalizations of *Orientalism* on two fronts. First, Spain's hybridity makes Moorishness a habitual presence in Iberian culture, so that Andalusi elements are intimately known and experienced. Second, Spain itself, though the westernmost part of Europe, is orientalized by its European rivals in a deliberate attempt to undermine its triumphant self-construction as a Catholic nation from 1492 on (3).

Fuchs later observes that Spain's European neighbors utilize Moorishness and the Black Legend to suggest that Spain is somehow beyond Europe (4).

Fuchs alludes to the term "playing Indian" to refer to numerous practices, such as Iberian chivalric practice which employed Moorish equestrian forms, in which Spaniards impersonated Moors, situating such practices as cultural transactions at the frontier that shaped national identity (88). The fact that Spaniards performed in this Moorish manner for foreign audiences also serves to inaugurate a new national identity. This identity could signify the conquest of the Moors for Spaniards or the ostensible exoticism of Spain for the visitors (101). Through such nationalistic performance, Spain's position with regard to both Europe and North Africa becomes difficult to fix. The expulsion of the Moors, the Jews, and the converted Moriscos, and their erasure in nationalistic discourse aimed to establish Spanish ethnic and religious purity. This expulsion also crafted a symbolic border that negated the presence of the expelled Moors and Jews in Spanish sociality in which cultural forms existed that confirmed their prior presence. Similarly, Susan Martín-Márquez asserts that Spain's Andalusi past results in both Spaniards and foreigners Orientalizing Spain (*Disorientations* 8). Referring to the nineteenth century, post-Enlightenment fascination with the Orient, Martín-Márquez states: "while some of the Spanish elite reveled in self-exoticization, others responded anxiously by projecting their 'own' alterity onto the 'usual suspects' in Africa and in the Middle East" (*Disorientations* 8).

George Mariscal identifies the primacy of the *indiano* in Spanish culture during the early modern period. The representation of the *indianos*, or the colonists who returned to Spain, primarily from the Americas but also from Africa and Asia, underscores the primacy of racial difference in the nation-building process. The displaced *indiano* who has attained wealth in the colonies destabilizes conceptualizations of both class and national identity. Mariscal states:

> Peninsular texts suggested that an essential part of the *indiano*'s physiognomy was a tanned face, presumably the consequence of having spent time in hot American, Asian or African climates… The double coding of the *moreno*, then, carries with it the long-standing prejudice against darker peoples even as it functions as a sign of potential wealth ("Indiano" 57).

As this quote shows, racialization, suggested in the darker skin of the *indianos* is also central to their depiction and to their marginalization, even when this dark skin symbolizes potential wealth.

The most salient feature of the *indiano* is the narrative form that permits this character to emerge in Spanish sociality. Mariscal observes, "Because he escaped all traditional categories, the *indiano* had to be invented through writing. Because he was figured as the embodiment of multiple vices, he was a corruption of 'nobility' itself and in a variety of writings was figuratively removed from the symbolic space of culture" ("Indiano" 59). Such narrative permits nationals to imagine the nation and stirs a sense of belonging to this "imagined community," as postulated by Benedict Anderson. In other words, as Anderson affirms, "culture creates the nation" (19). In the forms of cultural signification described above in early modern Spain, separation from the Moor, the Jew, and the *indiano*, who represents the colonies, is paramount. Borders are constructed to further nationalistic fantasies without reflecting the pluralistic nature of identities in Spain. For literary theorist Homi K. Bhabha, the nation itself is a space of ambivalence; in "Narrating the Nation," he posits that the nation must negotiate "the *unheimlich* terror of the space or race of the Other; the comfort of social belonging" (*Nation* 2). This negotiation and stabilization of the nation

and its borders often occurs through narrative which securely defines the nation and concomitant national identity. The borders between nations and even between nationals—with regard to class, ethnicity, gender—is highlighted in narrative to foment the collective imagination of national characters and archetypes.

Lou Charnon-Deutsch also interrogates alterity and national identity in Spain, through the figure of the Gypsy, observing the Gypsy is central to "ethnic identity and state formation" (*Spanish Gypsy* 11). For neighboring nations such as France and Britain, Gypsies come to symbolize Andalusia, and Andalusia, in turn, comes to symbolize all of Spain. Gypsies, moreover, exemplify the worst elements of Spanish culture for the French and British, who employ Spain's Gypsy identity to disparage Spain and to assert their own cultural superiority. Nonetheless, in the late nineteenth century, Gypsy culture was increasingly assimilated into the Spanish state through *flamenquismo*, which Charnon-Deutsch describes as "the flaunting of Gitano-identified activity and dress" (*Spanish Gypsy* 181). The figure of the Gypsy crystallizes around Gypsy as feminine, which for Charnon-Deutsch, appeals to Orientalist vogue and not only exoticizes but also feminizes southern Spanish cities (*Spanish Gypsy* 184). Mirroring some of the current discourses of feminine alterity that I explore in this dissertation, the Gypsy woman was depicted as a vagabond and often associated with dance, music, and money (Charnon-Deutsch *Spanish Gypsy* 85). Fascination with the Gypsy woman was also linked to her perceived dedication to family; unlike "Europeanized Spain," tainted by an excess of civilization, the Gypsy woman was devoted to her husband and children (Charnon-Deutsch *Spanish Gypsy* 189). This paradigm evinces the nationalistic dimension of discourses on Gypsies, which are akin to discourses of alterity formulated earlier in Spain's history. These constructions serve to Other these groups

and to fabricate a particular model of "Spanishness" that contradicts this Othered group and, again, following Anderson, allows culture to build the nation.

Today, in representations of immigration in contemporary Spain, borders are again erected to emphasize the immigrant's difference; these borders not only separate the immigrant from the society she inhabits, but also circulate a host of fantasies about the immigrant and her experiences. As in earlier texts, these fantasies of national purity and alterity are at the root of cultural productions and secure national identity. Traces of these processes of racialization in the early modern period reemerge in nationalistic discourse throughout the twentieth century. Indeed, beneath the representation of immigrant women, a matrix of factors serves to reveal Spain's history with alterity.

Isabel Santaolalla observes that immigrants are often employed as a trope to symbolize other times and spaces. Indeed, these figures constitute a component of the "projective past" (Foucault qtd. in Santaolalla "Ethnic" 67). This crafts a symbolic space in which the historic Other solidifies the collective notion of Spanish identity through difference and contrast ("Ethnic" 67-68). Such is the case with the North African Moroccan immigrant who, according to Flesler, often serves as a textual mechanism to facilitate allusion to Al-Andalus and the Reconquest of Spain (3). The Muslim conquest of the Iberian Peninsula serves as the origin of Spain's historical trauma; current encounters with Moroccan immigration draw on this experience to craft a space described as the "disadjusted now" which entangles the past and present (Flesler 56-7).

In a similar fashion, Mariscal charts the modes of racialization in Spain and situates these processes within the larger context of contemporary race theory. His primary aim is to investigate Spain's role in the genealogy of racism and to establish Spain's significance in

modern forms of racism, thereby developing a theory of race and culture (Mariscal, "Role" 9). He teases out the racial elements of persecution of Muslims and Jews in early modern Spain, which is often facilely described under the auspices of religious marginalization, citing Kim Hall who views such collapsing as an oversimplification (11). He refutes the notion of one formation giving way to the other in a neat or consequential manner:

> 'Race' is a field of practices and discourses that provides a conceptual repertoire from which specific groups draw in order to consolidate privilege and further their political projects. If we accept this formulation, nineteenth century European theories of scientific racism are less the product of an epistemological break with earlier practices than they are an articulation of residual and emergent elements in a new register ("Role" 14).

Following Flesler and Mariscal, the construction of alterity in Spain is a phenomenon with connections and disconnections to Spain's past with race, as opposed to a chronological formation that is assembled over time. Hence, the appearance of immigrants unleashes a host of memories, extending, but also complicating past constructions of difference that take into account Orientalism, the colonial experience in Spain, and Spain's proximity to Africa.

Women, Mobility, and National Space in 20th Century Spain

Racial difference serves to create boundaries, even between individuals occupying the same "national" space. Like race, gender constitutes a field through which women are defined and often oppressed by their male counterparts. This compels feminist historian Joan Wallach Scott in her widely cited essay "Gender: A Useful Category of Analysis" to encourage a gender analysis that goes beyond the study of women and that instead examines

gender's role in constituting sociality and social relationships steeped in power. Like race, gender helps to structure the fantasy of national space and national belonging allowing for the imagination of national space, the borders that determine it, and the bodies permitted to inhabit the nation. Philosopher Kwame Anthony Appiah puts it this way: "Racial and ethnic identities are, for example, essentially contrastive and relate centrally to social and political power; in this way they are like genders and sexualities" (*Race* 117). He also establishes the body as central both to race and gender, an issue that I shall explore throughout this chapter in how bodies are represented and imagined in nationalistic discourse (*Race* 124). Nonetheless, gender and race have unique histories of fostering inclusion and exclusion and should not be forced into facile equivalence. For feminist philosopher Judith Butler, racism, homophobia, and misogyny cannot be set up as analogical relations; she contends that such a conflation "delays the important work of thinking through the ways in which these vectors of power require and deploy each other for their purpose of their own articulation" (*Bodies* 18).

Like racial and ethnic approaches to national identity, gendered discourses of citizenship have been significantly transformed, and these shifts mark how power structures have incorporated and utilized various forms of alterity, perhaps to further the marginalization of some Othered groups, in the construction described by Butler above. Two twentieth century Spanish novels written by women, among others, engage the numerous ways in which women have been constructed as citizens in distinctive moments in Spain's history and reflect my concern with women's mobility, a key dimension of recent representations of immigration.

The first novel is Carmen Laforet's novel *Nada* [*Nothing*], published in 1944 in the aftermath of Francisco Franco's victory in the Civil War. This novel interrogates internal

difference in featuring a protagonist from the Canary Islands who travels to Catalonia to attend the university. This novel also depicts the hope that marks the anticipated journey to the destination, a trope also present in today's narratives of immigration, and its obliteration upon the arrival. The second is Lucía Etxebarria's *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes* [*Beatriz and the Celestial Bodies*] (1998), a novel that aims to cast a dissident gaze upon roles traditionally ascribed to women. Like *Nada*, in which Andrea breaks with the forms of femininity that her elderly aunt and her peers embody and impose on her, Etxebarria's novel forges new identities for women at the dawn of the twenty-first century. And like *Nada*, travel, in this case to Scotland, facilitates the process of subject formation for the central protagonist. *Nada* and *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes* received wide critical acclaim, both winning the prestigious literary prize awarded by Ediciones Destino, the Premio Nadal, in 1944 and in 1998, respectively. Both authors also received a tremendous amount of criticism for receiving this prize, for works of literature that several scholars opined did not merit such acclaim.[1]

Laforet's *Nada* begins in the Barcelona train station; Andrea has arrived and anticipates the new, free life she will live as a college student in the capitol of Catalonia. This fantasy of liberation is destroyed upon her arrival at her grandparents' home on Aribau Street. She is greeted by strange women occupying an apartment much smaller than she remembers; this transformation signals her family's diminished fortune. She sees her feeble, ghost-like grandmother; Antonia, a grim servant dressed in black followed by a black dog; and her aunt, Angustias, who is authoritarian and informs Andrea that she will not let her out of her sight. Andrea's dreams of freedom dissipate with this initial encounter and with her position in the house. She sleeps in the living room, without any privacy; in addition to this

physical position of being "in the middle" in the house on Aribau St., Andrea must take sides in the heated arguments that regularly occur. Her uncles, Juan and Román, argue bitterly, often threatening to murder one another. Juan's wife, Gloria, only worsens the situation; both men call her names, and Juan either defends her from Román's accusations or abuses her because of her questionable background and her perceived failures in moral rectitude. At one point, Román offers Juan his gun so that he can rectify his situation with Gloria. Román's wielding of his weapon in intimate family space in this moment and when he cleans his gun at the dinner table symbolizes his "menacing, masculine power over the family" (Amago 68). Andrea's rejection of Román and this hostile, masculine space speaks to a homosocial tendency in *Nada* noted by theorists like Samuel Amago and Barry Jordan. Amago also observes that Andrea calls Román a *diablo* or devil repeatedly and suggests that his menacing nature stems from his masculinity (69).

The women in the household map out the roles that women were allowed to play in postwar Spain. Angustias echoes this sentiment when she tells Andrea, "Es verdad que sólo hay dos caminos para la mujer. Dos únicos caminos honrosos…" [There are only two paths for a woman. Two honorable paths…] (Laforet 94). She refers to marriage or the convent, specifically explaining her personal decision to choose the latter. The grandmother, an abnegated wife and mother who makes sacrifices and eats hardly anything so that her adult children will not starve, also seems to live according to this code. With this statement, Angustias also alludes to Gloria who is repeatedly taken to task for her problematic origins as an orphan, her desire for freedom, and her having gotten pregnant by Juan before having a religious wedding.

Angustias draws a parallel between Andrea and Gloria and their illusions of liberation; she also refers to the national climate in her critique of their behavior. Angustias chides Andrea for suggesting that she can leave the house alone, "Parece que hayas vivido suelta en zona roja y no en un convento de monjas durante la guerra. Aún Gloria tiene más disculpas que tú en sus ansias de emancipación y desorden. Ella es una golfilla de la calle, mientras que tú has recibido una educación" [You act like you lived in a red zone and not in a convent during the Civil War. Even Gloria is more excusable than you. She wants freedom and disorder because she's a street tramp, but you have an education.] (Laforet 96). With this statement, Angustias links the women's desire for freedom and liberation with the regions controlled by Republicans in the Civil War. Later in the novel, when Román reminds his brother's wife of their brief love affair, consummated with only a kiss, he mentions that it occurred "en plena guerra" [in the middle of the war] (Laforet 209). Again, in the context of the war, in the progressive Republican zones, women are portrayed as able to live freely, which poses a danger to the established order of Francoism.

Once Angustias leaves the house for the convent and Andrea begins her classes at the university, she comes into contact with women who contrast with the scary residents of the house on Aribau Street and reflect an idealized form of femininity for Francoist Spain. Her friend Ena, who is beautiful, blonde, and rich, is very well-liked by their peers. Ena often treats Andrea when they go out, kindnesses that call attention to the narrator's intense poverty. Ena wants to visit Andrea's home to meet Román, claiming to be interested in his music; this proposal horrifies Andrea. She states that she wants to keep her two worlds separate, her public life at her school with her kind friends and the dirty, poor, violent atmosphere she experiences at home.

The bifurcation of Andrea's world also speaks to the splitting of Spain during the Civil War and in the postwar years. Francoist rhetoric accentuated the concept of a Spain and an "anti-Spain" that threatened the values, norms, and traditions of the former. This anti-Spanish contingent had to be eradicated or threatened into submission in the mass violence that occurred during the Civil War and in the postwar period. In a recent talk, historian Helen Graham posited that this violence, often public in nature, served to reconstruct the idea of national space and the nation as home. The violence marked the home and, hence, personal space as a potential site of violence, where citizens were coerced into cooperation in order to avoid the severe punishments the government inflicted on dissidents. The men in her household experience this violence firsthand. The arguments emerge from betrayals that took place when Román worked as a spy during the war and Gloria's denouncing of Román, which led to his incarceration. On the other hand, Andrea's well-to-do friends at the university constitute the sort of people included under the umbrella of "Spain."

Andrea is unable to find a comfortable place in the gendered role that society compels her to play. When her friend Pons insists that she attend a party thrown by his family, Andrea begins to dream again. She fantasizes that she will transform into a princess from a fairy tale, specifically comparing herself to Cinderella. She imagines that after being ignored for so long, she will finally be loved and desired at Pons's party. Upon Andrea's arrival, however, Pons's mother turns a disdainful gaze to her old, worn shoes. Andrea reveals that at the party, "No me divertía nada. Me vi en un espejo blanca y gris, deslucida entre los alegres trajes de verano que me rodeaban" [I didn't have fun at all. I looked at myself in the mirror, pale and gray, drab among those joyful summer dresses that surrounded me.] (Laforet 203). The dresses, the wealth, and the atmosphere of the party contrast with the gray and dismal dress

and life that envelop Andrea, represented in the sad house on Aribau Street, a vestige of a distant era of economic prosperity and social grace for her family (Higginbotham 17). The party scene becomes even sadder for Andrea when Pons admits to her that he is in love with his cousin. With this admission, Andrea's exclusion becomes more acute as a family member is presented as the recipient of Pons's affections.

Amago's analysis of this scene as the failure of fairy tale opens up new spaces to consider women's relationships; he writes, "in the absence of romance, the party at Pons's house becomes a parodic inversion of the Cinderella story. Andrea is unable to return his affections, and the Ball becomes not an opportunity for salvation from a life of misery and poverty, but an instance of brutal disillusionment with her surroundings and a return to her squalid origins" (71). Like several of the women protagonists I analyze in this dissertation, Andrea's fantasy of belonging hinges on the concept of the princess. In this novel and in other narratives, the protagonists long to be desired and sought after by those who encounter them like fairy tale princesses. Andrea shares many characteristics with Cinderella. As her aunt often reminds her, she is an orphan; she is also poor; and she lives in a home with women who are strange and/or cruel. Yet, the princess fantasy extends beyond these similarities. Collette Downing identifies the "Cinderella Complex" as something that women are taught at an early age which compels women to submit to others' will and, thus, impedes their success in society (in Higginbotham 19). In the end, the princess is saved by a prince as opposed to working for her own success.

The princess as symbol speaks to a desire to belong in both a nationalistic and in a gendered manner. The princess sets the standard of beauty and femininity, which serves to explain her public adoration by her subjects. In addition, the prince has recognized in the

princess, even if she is exotic, that she is an ideal form of womanhood worthy of his royal persona. Thus, the princess fantasy that Andrea and others share speaks to the fantasy of national space in a gendered manner and the articulation of an identity that is rooted in cultural specificity. As Andrea admits as she gets dressed for Pons's party, "Contemplaba, temblorosa de emoción, mi transformación asombrosa en una rubia princesa—precisamente rubia, como describían los cuentos—inmediatemente dotada, por gracia de la belleza, con los atributos de dulzura, encanto y bondad" [Shaking with emotion, I pondered my surprising transformation into a blonde princess—precisely blonde, as they are described in the stories—immediately blessed, by virtue of my newfound beauty, with the attributes of sweetness, charm, and goodness.] (Laforet 199-200). This image of herself as beautiful and blonde sharply contrasts with the gray reflection she faces at the party, after being painfully derided by the hostess. The blonde princess character, best represented through Ena, also contrasts with the darkness and the dark figures that mark the house on Aribau. Andrea herself, somewhat racialized in contrast to the fair princess, is one of these dark characters incapable of being a princess. The princess fantasy reveals the desire to be accepted into the national space and to be held in the highest regard that contradicts the apathy or loathing, in some instances, these women inspire in their day-to-day lives.

Central to *Nada* is the notion of women and mobility. For Ioanna Lalioutou, "mobility as concept is used to refer to the freedom of movement and the dissolution of political, family, social, and economic constraints" (45). Andrea comes from the Canary Islands to the Catalonian capitol. Upon her arrival, her dreams of freedom and her mobility are restricted by Angustias. This mirrors a trope often manifest in narratives of women immigrants today, whose dreams of Spain upon arrival are crushed with their real

experiences in this nation; the political, familial, social, and economic constraints imposed on them, in other words, negates the possibility of mobility. Andrea's desire for mobility reflects a dis-identification with her family and the literal desire to occupy a new place, or, figuratively, to assume a new subject position. Like the narratives I examine in more recent years, the move from the Canary Islands to Barcelona only underscores the difference and exteriority of Andrea when compared to her bourgeois friends and the blonde, princess-like Ena. A similar process of removal and repositioning occurs in contemporary texts in which women immigrants, despite their attempts to dis-identify with the origin and to assimilate into Spanish culture, are firmly repositioned as Others within Spanish sociality. These restrictions on women's bodies curtail their mobility, in terms of the spaces they may occupy and the subject-positions they can inhabit. Feminist philosopher Elizabeth Grosz has noted the fundamentality of how the body is imagined and represented, affirming, "the body is crucial to understanding women's physical and social existence, but the body is no longer understood as an ahistorical, biologically given, acultural object… It is a signifying and signified body… an object of systems of social coercion, legal inscription, and sexual and economic exchange" (8). Andrea's body is subject to limits imposed on her by her aunt and by some of the bourgeois characters she meets in *Nada*, which tend to reflect Francoist discourse.

Andrea's lack of mobility results from the difficult position in which women found themselves in 1940s Spain and the manner in which their bodies were regulated by Francoist discourse. Hence, *Nada* presents a microcosmic national history played by the characters that Andrea encounters in Barcelona, yet the novel also sheds light on how gender operates at a key moment in nation-building in Spain. Francoist discourse, surmised in Andrea's aunts

proclamations on acceptable womanhood, lauds devout, abnegated wives and mothers. Graham indicates that in 1940s Spain, this image was typified in the figures of Queen Isabella and St. Teresa of Ávila and idealized in the figure of the Virgin Mary (184). This socially conservative project aimed to "turn the clock back" and to reverse Republican policies that purported to change women's role in society and give them higher visibility and agency. Indeed, the March 1938 *Fuero del Trabajo* [Labor Charter] made women "free" from the workplace and the factory, and labor regulations from 1942 on called for the dismissal of married women (Graham 184). This ultraconservative nationalist discourse contrasts with the actual lives of women in the 1940s, which Graham observes were complex, conflictive, and plural. Wealth, age, and class structured women's lives, evidenced in *Nada* and in Andrea's numerous difficulties. In the 1940s, during the years of hunger, many women found themselves in much worse circumstances and had to work to survive. As this work was discouraged, women often turned to illegal activities, finding employment on the thriving black market and in prostitution.

Andrea is positioned on the fringes of hegemonic femininity and desires to occupy another position, evident in her princess fantasies and her desire for mobility. When the novel ends, and Andrea anticipates mobility and freedom, she is again filled with hope about a new life in Madrid that Ena's family's wealth and influence will make possible, the reader sees the uniqueness of Andrea's trajectory in its fullness. In addition, the reader feels that, as Virginia Higginbotham suggests, the Cinderella myth has been redefined for Spanish women (24). Or as Barry Jordan states more explicitly, the novel is a cautionary tale that instructs its readers to eschew childish notions of romance (108).

Andrea's sole opportunity to leave Aribau Street and the misery that she experiences there comes to pass through the figure of Ena, whom she has adored since their first meeting. Andrea's special relationship with Ena forges a strong homosocial bond that forecloses the possibility of her rescue by heterosexual love. If she is to attain any mobility and reposition herself, it will be through Ena's interventions, not those of a desired fairy tale prince. Amago writes, "If there is a critical consensus as to Andrea's sexual identity, it must be that she is heterosexual. Yet the most affective and sensual of her relationships are shared with Gloria and Ena" (Laforet 71). Several moments in *Nada* demonstrate this idea. For example, when Andrea learns that Ena has clandestinely met with Román, she says that she feels more betrayed and humiliated than Ena's boyfriend, which conveys the intimacy and love that undergirds their relationship, an intimacy trespassed by the menacing, masculine Román.

Andrea's journey in *Nada* is very much impacted by the women she meets and the relationships they share. Amago, citing and extending Jordan, asserts that Andrea's negative reactions to men and her exceptionally caring, erotically charged relationships with women not only suggest a rejection of heterosexual relations in favor of homosocial friendship, but also a repressed lesbian identity (68). This repression seems to characterize all the women she meets, except Ena, whose mobility and daring are often noted in the novel. Margarita, Ena's mother, remarks that she lamented when Ena was born a girl, but later, she changed her mind, "Me hizo maravillarme con su vitalidad con su fuerza, con su belleza… Mi hija es como una irradiación de fuerza y vida…Comprendí, humildemente, el sentido de mi existencia al ver en ella todos mis orgullos, mis fuerzas y mis deseos mejores de perfección realizarse tan mágicamente" [I marveled at her vitality, her strength, her beauty… My daughter radiates strength and life… Humbly, I understood the reason for my existence upon

seeing all of my best satisfactions, strengths, and desires come to life magically in her.] (Laforet 223). Margarita's observation shows that a new form of womanhood is inaugurated in the figure of her daughter.

Ena's mobility throughout the novel suggests that she contradicts the forms of womanhood typified in nationalistic discourse; nonetheless, this freedom is only possible owing to her class privilege. Andrea's desire to emulate the progressive, princess-like Ena or to have a life like hers is only made possible through Ena herself. This replacement of the male prince for a progressive princess of sorts sets out a singular set of parameters for Andrea's salvation, if it is to occur. Indeed, as Jordan notes, Andrea's hope at the end of the novel recalls her naïve optimism upon her arrival to Barcelona, establishing a pattern of "stasis, circularity, repetition, and entrapment" (111). While *Nada* presents familiar crises that women face, symbolized in restricted mobility and the princess fantasy, the novel may also present a novel solution. As Jordan indicates, Andrea's freedom from the house on Aribau Street occurs through homosocial bonds often eschewed in the national discourse articulated by her own aunt that extols matrimony and motherhood for women or the convent (106). Previously excluded from Pons's family, confirmed with his mother's condemnation and his confession of love for his cousin, the orphan Andrea finally finds hope in Ena and her family, which can symbolize the national family touted in Francoist "Spain" and "anti-Spain" discourse. And perhaps in this family, she will attain the mobility she so strongly desires.

Over fifty years later, Etxebarria develops stories about women's romantic quests and personal journeys in a new light. And like *Nada*, which allows personal histories to serve as a microcosm for a national situation, Etxebarria's narrative allows readers to contemplate how national identity and gender converge in Spain at the end of the 20th century. Mobility also

highlights how women's bodies are imagined and represented in *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes* as the title character, Beatriz, travels to Scotland to attend the university, moves freely throughout Madrid, and embodies a number of subject positions and sexualities. Beatriz falls in love with her wild best friend Mónica whose unbridled sexuality profoundly contrasts with her own moderated desires. As in *Nada*, Beatriz and Mónica live in worlds that vastly differ in their viewpoints from those of their mothers and seem to instantiate a new era of womanhood marked by amplification in the ways in which women and their sexualities can be portrayed in democratic Spain.

Carmen de Urioste observes that both Beatriz and Mónica's mothers are disconnected from their bodies: Beatriz's mother is a former member of the Sección Femenina of the Falange, a women's institution that served to further the ultraconservative goals of the party through feminine discipline, while Mónica's mother is an editor at a high fashion magazine who converts women's bodies into decorative objects to attract men (Etxebarria *Beatriz* 134). Beatriz's mother also has a form of epilepsy that leads to unexpected seizures, further accentuating the disconnection from her body. The primary disconnection from their bodies seems to foreclose their mobility and speaks to a form of restricted womanhood reminiscent of Francoism. Beatriz's mother, through rigidity and illness similarly portrays a limitation akin to the body encumbered by fashion, displayed for the male gaze. Their daughters break with these forms of womanhood and inhabit new spaces within sociality; they also embrace sexual identities that allow them to "inhabit" their bodies in previously discouraged ways.

This inhabiting connotes mobility, both to move through various places in society and to assume several subject positions. For example, Beatriz both repudiates and embraces her womanhood at will in the novel. To reject womanhood, she does not eat in order to maintain

a body that resembles that of a child. She admits, “No quería ser mujer. Elegía no limitar mis decisiones futuras a las cosas pequeñas, y no dejar que otros decidieran por mí en las importantes. Elegía no pertenecer a un batallón de resignadas ciudadanas de segunda clase. Elegía no ser como mi madre” [I didn’t want to be a woman. I chose not to limit my future decisions to little things and let others decide the important ones. I chose not to belong to a battalion of citizens resigned to form a second class. I chose not to be like my mother.] (Etxebarria *Beatriz* 36). This decision constitutes a rupture with her mother’s form of womanhood and with the restrictions imposed on women’s bodies. And while Beatriz credits herself with this radical project of selfhood, the reversal of conservative laws that restricted women’s citizenship and contribution to society under Francoism also bear upon this decision. Despite this decision, Beatriz is still admired and pursued by men who pass her on the street. She wonders, “quizá yo no sea tan poco *femenina* como mi madre pretende. Es posible que haya que redefinir la acepción de semejante término” [Maybe I’m more feminine than my mother claims. It’s possible that it’s time to redefine that term.] (Etxebarria *Beatriz* 54). Indeed, this phrase encapsulates what Etxebarria sets out to do in the space of *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes*, redefine femininity, taking into account the shifting borders and the elision of conservative norms with regard to gender and sexuality. Beatriz’s mobility is exemplified in her ability to cross these borders, in both rejecting womanhood and assuming it to attract and to seduce men when she wants.

Mónica’s separation consists of unbridled sexual experimentation and freedom. While Mónica’s family’s has wealth and influence, and she seems to embody an idealized femininity reminiscent of Ena in *Nada*, she participates in an abundance of shady affairs—allowing drug dealers to live with her at home while her parents summer in Mallorca, having

sex in exchange for drugs, theft, and other crimes. Her wanton ways eventually lead to a grave addiction to heroine that evidences her inability to restrain herself. Mónica and Beatriz are friends throughout adolescence during *La Movida*. As in *Nada*, their personal histories parallel the national history of progress, counter-culture, and openness that characterized the first years of democracy following Franco's death. Under Mónica's influence, Beatriz begins to move through the sordid parts of Madrid, serving as a drug deliverer and even committing murder. Mónica seems to exaggerate the characteristics of virility and daring deemed ideal for a man. Her unbridled sexuality and simultaneous aloofness negate the docility and propriety that structure women's sexuality, as suggested by both Mónica's and Beatriz's mothers.

Beatriz learns to desire without regard for gender, again allowing her body to move freely to others. Her first love is Mónica, whom she adores silently, despite her wanton ways. She goes to the university in Edinburgh, where she meets Caitlin, whose beauty and goodness seem to be an antidote to Beatriz's fascination with Mónica. Later in the novel, she suddenly begins a relationship with Ralph, who provides her the passion and intrigue lacking in her relationship with Cat. Nonetheless, Beatriz is not able to identify with anyone completely and appreciates each lover for the varied types of pleasure they bring to her life. The circulation of several sexualities in *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes* without the explicit privileging of one over another for the title character opens up a space to consider the new modes of being in the world afforded by democracy. Urioste notes that the representation of lesbian desire in the novel counters the normativization of heterosexuality in Spanish society (123). Or as Judith Butler has shown, sex is constructed vis-à-vis a process of the reiterations of norms, and can be both produced and destabilized in the course of this reiteration (*Bodies*

10). In accentuating new modes of womanhood that break with older traditions, as did Laforet in *Nada* several decades before, Etxebarria contributes to the creation of a dynamic space in which a range of gender and sexual identities can circulate.

Yet, both women are ultimately thwarted in their freedom and their ability to occupy a litany of subject positions. Beatriz moves from body to body, and ends up disappointed with each of her relationships. Mónica, moreover, succumbs to drug addiction. These consequences of mobility may serve to voice concern for the ways in which Spanish women inhabit their bodies and move through space in modernity. Their mobility allows them to interact with the growing and multiple forms of Otherness present in the young democracy, perhaps in ways contrary to the social norms articulated by hegemonic discourse. In addition to the unsavory characters who populate the places they visit, in one scene, a Gypsy attempts to exchange drugs for sex with Beatriz, which she vehemently opposes. Both Mónica and Beatriz's openness to alterity in the young democracy evince an interest in forms of living that run counter to the traditional models espoused by their mothers. For Lalioutou, such mobility fuels new forms of citizenship and new forms of subjectivity in the age of globalization (49). Indeed, both Beatriz and Mónica reject the closed, autarkic version of Spanishness that impinged upon their mother's bodies and embrace a seeming cosmopolitanism that marked the young democracy in the late 1980s and early 1990s.

Etxebarria's writing itself speaks to a particular historical moment in which certain subjects and themes were no longer taboo. Silvia Bermúdez writes, "Talking about sex and sexuality had already been taking place in Spain since the early seventies as part of the emergent literary, critical, and theoretical practices that were to flourish in the twilight years of Francoism, and that were somehow further unveiled by the *destape* years of the

transición" (223). Bermúdez also draws parallels between *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes* and *Nada*, observing that in both novels, the central protagonists aim to understand how to be women and their journeys toward womanhood take place within a homoerotic bonding (226). While Beatriz and Mónica have attained greater mobility in a democratic, postfeminist Spain, they still face tremendous difficulty emerging from gender and sexual identity, evincing how, "it is still very difficult to be one's own woman" (Bermúdez 226).

Cosmopolitanism in Contemporary Spain

The cultural phenomenon narrated in the work of Etxebarria is made possible by Spain's rapid transformation following Franco's death in 1975. And beginning in the early 1990s, this transformation was reflected in Spanish women's greater mobility and in Spain's increasing immigrant population as the nation attracted people across the world searching for new horizons. Graham and Sánchez indicate that 1992 marked the end of a period of political transition begun in the 1970s (406). This year celebrated the 500th anniversary of Columbus's voyage to the Americas. For Estrella de Diego, 1992 was a "missed opportunity" for Spain due to the political policies that maneuvered to align Spain more closely with Europe and celebrated a history of colonization (184). Indeed, a neocolonial logic seems to be at work, which Diego describes as a "re-founding of the Spanish empire" (185). This revival is fueled by a staunch identification with Europe and simultaneous repression of alterity within the nation.

In addition, in 1992, the Olympics were celebrated in Barcelona, the World's Fair occurred in Seville, and Madrid was designated a "European City of Culture." This international distinction marked the culmination of a plethora of policies that provided Spain

remarkable economic, political, and social advancement. Graham and Sánchez note the rapidity of these developments and observe: "This seemed to be a part of a new, 'modern', democratic national identity as if it were built on a *tabula rasa,* thus avoiding confrontation with the cultural, social, regional, and political tensions that have plagued Spain since its emergence as a nation-state" (407). Yet, behind this display of progress and transformation, several historical tensions existed, disrupting the recent and fragile construction of a seamless transition to a new society. The question of alterity and Spain's negotiation of this alterity continually emerged during this dynamic period. Diego examines the proliferation of ethnic performances in the 1990s through musical groups like *Azúcar Moreno* [Brown Sugar] and the "moda de España" [Spanish fashion] campaign that availed itself of flamenco and bullfighter costumes and the performance of passion (180). For Diego, unpacking the goal of these ethnic performances of Spanishness shows Spain's complex relationship to alterity (180). She considers the possibility that the young nation sought to convey to the outside world that it possessed a "pinch of ethnicity, and a pinch of modernity" (182). Yet, as Fuchs reminds us, these cultural practices at the border of assuming the identity of the Other can also symbolize control of that alterity, manifest in the ability to embody it and deploy it at will. Such practices, thus, could confirm that "since Spain's incorporation into the European Union, its southern border has been transformed into a *European* frontier—a frontier re-marked and reinforced" (Driessen in Nair "Europe's 'Last' Wall" 23). At any rate, these ethnic performances evince a reshaping of Spanish national identity in the interest of a new, unquestionably European identity.

Ethnic Others within Spain were also implicated in this reshaping. In addition to continued discrimination against Gypsies, discrimination and violence against Spain's new

migrant community also came to pass. While attending to the economic situation in Spain and immigration policies throughout Europe, Graham and Sánchez situate this violence within Francoist rhetoric on Spain and anti-Spain and Spain's own complicated history with alterity (415). As mentioned above, racist discourse in Spain fluctuates with time, creating a matrix of factors that influence how certain groups are portrayed within society. Spain's eagerness to align itself with larger European policies, moreover, manifests that: "In spite of its own long and painful history of underdevelopment, economic emigration, and otherness, far from recognizing a commonality and attempting to integrate the experience of the marginalized into its own self-proclaimedly pluralistic culture, [Spain] has instead assumed the stance of 'First World' Europe" (Graham and Sánchez 415). Spain also embraced the role as the protector of Europe's borders as the nation with closest proximity to Africa. The emphasis placed on this border confirms Spain's own inclusion within Europe after a long history of exoticization and marginalization.

The prominence of the border in separating not only Spain, but all Europe from the other parts of the world, moreover, shows the degree to which that border is false as borders are most often guarded and protected when they are in danger of collapse. In her forthcoming book *Walled States, Waning Sovereignty*, political theorist Wendy Brown interrogates the establishment of rigid, physical borders and the proliferation of walls and barricades to delimit national space. This walling occurs at a moment when national borders and boundaries are increasingly difficult to enforce.[2] Globalization and immigration create tension resulting from the indeterminacy of national space occupied by suddenly mobile, foreign bodies. These physical structures allow for the imagination of a sealed off community that counters the reality of a weak national border easily penetrated by immigrants.

The walls in the Spanish enclaves in Morocco, Ceuta and Melilla, evince this phenomenon. In 2005 when the walls were charged by thousands of immigrants, the government, headed by José Luis Rodríguez Zapatero, reconstructed new walls or reinforced them to impede—or to appear to impede—later intrusions. Nair cites Juan Goytisolo who observes "neither the wall, with its sophisticated video cameras, halogen lights, and sensory system, nor the highway from Morocco that is constantly patrolled both by the Spanish Army and the Civil Guard, nor the barbed wire fencing off Ceuta can deter the entry of migrants into this European threshold" ("Europe's 'Last' Wall" 31). The wall's aim, thus, is more symbolic in permitting nationals to imagine themselves as the sole possessors of national space, if they desire, and to figure immigrants as illegal trespassers who have transgressed the law. The wall and also the collective imagining of immigrants, serves to Other this group and distance the national self from foreigners.

The issue of immigration takes on new dimensions when the element of gender is taken into account. At the turn of the century, immigration became increasingly feminized. Most available jobs in Spain are connected to the service industry, especially in labor niches long deemed "traditionally feminine" and related to domesticity and reproductive work: cleaning, cooking, and the care of young children and the elderly. As mentioned above, Spanish women have progressively abandoned this work, and have been replaced by immigrants. The increasing demand for domestic work has made it the main source of employment and way of entry for immigrant women, as Spanish legislation in the 1990s, through the policies of annual quotas, privileged the admission and regularization of female immigrants who worked in this sector (Parella Rubio 165-68, Oso Casas 457-60).[3] Through what Shu-Ju Ada Cheng calls an "international racial division of reproductive labor" (643),

immigrant women, many of whom have left their children in their countries of origin, allow middle-class Spanish women to work outside of the home without having to share domestic and care work equally with their husbands, thus maintaining a patriarchal structure in which "reproductive" work is always assigned to women (Parella Rubio 127-28).[4] Hence, the mobility narrated by Etxebarria is often made possible through the atavistic restriction of foreign women who migrate to Spain.

Recent narratives that treat women immigrants address many of the issues described above and express the tension that has emerged in Spain, historically a nation of emigrants now faced with unprecedented immigration. Representations of immigrants hinge on what Santaolalla describes as the reconstitution of external allegiances and identifications which aimed to breathe new life into relationships with Europe and Latin America that had perished under Francoism ("Representation" 44). Yet, as Diego avers, this reconstitution consists of several flaws that suggest the neocolonial logic at work in contemporary Spain with regard to foreign immigration.

Etxebarria again treats the dynamic experience of life in contemporary Madrid with her collection of interconnected short stories, *Cosmofobia*, published in 2009. The characters, united by their proximity in their Atocha neighborhood, allow the author to explore gender, race, and the limits of cosmopolitanism in this seemingly pluralistic space. The author seems to want to convey that the twenty protagonists are all connected, yet their actions and their comportment tend to belie this fantasy, thus demonstrating the difficulty of intercultural relations. Indeed, at numerous moments in *Cosmofobia*, the protagonists aver that their neighborhood is *multicultural*, but not *intercultural* since both nationals and various ethnic groups tend not to mix. Even when grouped together, therefore, the fantasy of national space

allows the multiple groups living in the Atocha neighborhood to cling to imaginary borders and to distance themselves from others.

The issue of postcolonial identities in relation to both the colonizers and the colonized emerges in the character of Susana, in a short story entitled "La Negra." Postcolonial Europe is a critical term that reassesses Europe not only in its past imperial pluralities and contemporary divergent multicultural scenarios, but also in its re-articulation of migration as an integral part of its territorial indeterminacy. The story exemplifies the notion that "late capitalism and globalization have led to a complex web of economic, political, and cultural connections between the global dominant powers and their postcolonial others" (Nair "Europe's 'Last' Wall" 18). This web both connects and disconnects with previous encounters of colonialism and actualizes this history with today's particularities.

Those who encounter Susana read her racially and incorrectly deduce that she is an immigrant. As Susana states, "Mi madre es guineana, mi padre es guineano y yo me empeño en decir que soy española porque lo soy" [My mother is Guinean, my father is Guinean, and I insist on saying I'm Spanish because I am.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 65). Her parents come from a former Spanish colony, and this serves to craft a postcolonial identity in which Susana views herself as Spanish. In several instances, characters refer to her as an immigrant and must be corrected. Susana is a Spaniard of African descent.

Susana's identity recalls similar issues explored by Martinican psychoanalyst and philosopher Frantz Fanon in his 1952 book *Black Skin, White Masks,* a foundational text that unpacks the identities formed under colonial subjugation. Fanon, echoed by Said later in *Orientalism*, constructs an oppositional paradigm of subject formation in which he posits that the category of white relies heavily on its negation, the category black, and that these two

categories enter into a profound relationship at the moment of the imperial conquest. Achille Mbembe observes that colonization aims to discipline bodies in order to make better use of them, fostering docility and productivity and forcing a submissive identity upon the colonized (*Masks* 19). Fanon similarly asserts, "If there is an inferiority complex, it is the outcome of a double process: primarily, economic, subsequently, the internalization—or, better, the epidermalization—of this inferiority" (*Masks* 11). The colonized, thus, are made painfully aware that their oppression extends beyond their economic poverty and is internalized as a reflection of the self and the self's position within sociality. Like Susana, Fanon becomes aware of his difference once he travels from Martinique to Paris, the colonial metropolis. He affirms, "The black man among his own in the twentieth century does not know at what moment his inferiority comes into being through the other" (*Masks* 110). This is analogous to what takes place in the short story, except that Susana is born and raised in a nation that marginalizes her owing to her distant origins in a former colony.

Susana's experiences in the story mirror those of Fanon. Fanon describes the marginalization he experienced in France and the horror his body produced within French sociality; "'Look, a Negro!' I came into the world imbued with the will to find a meaning in things, my spirit filled with the desire to attain to the source of the world, and then I found that I was an object in the midst of other objects. Sealed into that crushing *objecthood*" (*Masks* 109, my emphasis). Fanon realizes that his presence as a black man in France unleashes past encounters with the black man, specifically through colonization, often articulated through horror. This cultural imagining of the black man, which transforms him into an often reviled object, undergirds his relationship to the Parisian community that objectifies him and contrasts with his own image of himself. As in *Nada* and in *Beatriz y los*

cuerpos celestes, in which women protagonists negotiated their own perception of themselves with that of the world at large, the racially marked must also engage a self-representation that is not aligned with their portrayal in sociality. Susana has several episodes that mirror Fanon's racist encounters. She works as a salesperson and experiences difficulty both in finding employment and in dealing with her customers because of her racial identity. One manager refuses to hire her outright explaining, "Mira, es que tú eres demasiado oscura y las clientas se me van a asustar" [Look, you're just too dark, and you will scare my clients.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 69). When Susana does find a job, several customers scream upon seeing her in scenarios that speak to Fanon's experience decades before in neighboring France. These scenes also highlight the traces of colonization, impressed on certain bodies and imprinted in racist ideologies in postcolonial Europe.

Susana's situation is complicated by gender and the peculiar ways in which gender, race, and national identity connect to form a matrix of marginalization. The source of one of the most strident critiques of Fanon's is his universalizing of the masculine and his elision of gender. Gwen Bergner inserts the question of gender into her reading of *Black Skin, White Masks*, extending his insights to affirm the oppression of both women and the colonized as constitutive of white, colonial male privilege. I cite her at length to illustrate this idea:

> Sexual difference may operate in a visual field, but men and women are accorded disparate positions in that differentiation. The image of woman comes to symbolize lack, psychoanalytic feminist film theory has shown. The masculine gaze displaces the anxiety of lack onto women by objectifying their images, silencing their voices, rendering their sexuality spectacular, in sum, excluding them from occupying a place as subject within scopic systems of

> signification. Like the objectified woman, the black man signals difference or castration and threatens lack. In Fanon's example, the black man, not the white woman, is seen by the frightened boy-child. (79)

While the gaze serves to objectify both black men and white women, the gaze marked by terror is reserved for the racially marked subject. This manifests Bergner's position that "race and gender are mutually constitutive and reciprocally informing" and "multiple subject positions are produced through a dominant gaze." (85). In the short story "La Negra," Susana experiences a sort of double objectification, as a horrific monster owing to her racial identity by the women in the stores that she serves and also as a woman desired by the men who encounter her, such as her boyfriend Silvio and other men in their neighborhood. Susana is not exoticized by these men, including Silvio who defends her when his mother complains that he should find a Spanish woman. In this short story, it is primarily other women who denigrate Susana as a woman of African origin, while men hardly ever refer to her racial identity.

Amina is a Moroccan character whose trajectory shows the complexity of representing alterity in contemporary Spanish sociality. She also shows the strict borders that guide and determine life in Spain. One of the characters informs the narrator, "Los padres de Amina son marroquíes, pero ella nació aquí; tiene carnet de identidad y todo. Vamos, que es española" [Amina's parents are Moroccans, but she was born here; she has papers and everything. She's Spanish.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 160). Amina corrects this initial assertion, telling the narrator that she was not born in Madrid, but in Algeciras. Amina describes their neighborhood, noting the aversion to mixing among the residents. She observes, "Los diferentes grupos se toleran, pero no se relacionan… Hay convivencia, no

intercambios, no hay mestizaje" [Different groups tolerate one another, but they really don't relate to one another… There is coexistence, not exchange, there is no mixing.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 163). Amina invokes the idea of *convivencia*, or peaceful coexistence reminiscent of the tacit medieval pact between Christians and Moors. Fuchs points out that the notion of *convivencia* primarily entailed coexistence through objects, spaces, and practices as opposed to real people (13). In today's context, in which multiculturality is touted as an ideal but often hinges on superficial interactions, a parallel form of *convivencia* exists.

In this story and in several others, the narrator allows her characters to speak, showing how communication and knowledge about the Other tends to be partial, fragmented and flawed. At one point, Amina addresses the author about an unexpected encounter in which she believes her former Moroccan employer bewitched her, an event that leads her psychiatrist to believe she is suffering from a nervous crisis. She says, "Ya sé que usted no juzga y que no lo contará nunca, que es como si se lo contara a un médico… Además usted es mujer, es diferente, claro" [I know that you don't judge and you won't tell anyone ever, it's like I'm telling a doctor… Plus, you're a woman, so it's different, of course.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 169). The authority of the narrative, as evinced in Amina's correcting the other characters who misinform the narrator about her birthplace, supposedly lies with Amina in this short story. Her trusting of the narrator, implicitly Etxebarria, rests on the fact that she is a woman and that she is an authority, like a doctor. Hence, it is Etxebarria who cedes authority to her in allowing her to transmit the story. This issue of documenting the Other will be explored in greater detail in the following chapter, yet, it is imperative to note that

this fact-based approach to attaining knowledge and presenting the Other is often deployed to negate the element of fantasy often present in such texts.

Amina reappears in *Cosmofobia* in the short story "La Sihr," in which her psychiatrist, Isaac, provides his detailed observations on her based on their group therapy sessions. In this instance, Isaac's medical-style notes provide information about Amina and her alleged bewitching by her neighbor Yamal. At the very beginning of his analysis, Isaac states, "El caso de Malika G—la llamaba Malika porque había decidido ocultar el nombre real de Amina—evidencia cómo los síndromes psiquiátricos mayores, si bien son fenomenológicamente universales, están determinados en su expression clínica por factores culturales" [The case of Malika G—he called her Malika because he had decided to conceal Amina's real name—provides evidence that the greatest psychiatric syndromes, while phenomenologically universal, are determined in their clinical expression by cultural factors.] (Etxebarria *Cosmofobia* 234). In this example, the cultural difference serves to explicate the clinical difference that he believes Amina experiences due to her crisis. The border now divides the sane from the mad in addition to separating cultures from one another. The medical notes transmit a significant degree of objectivity. Yet, despite their seeming transparency, they are motivated by Isaac's infatuation with his Moroccan patient. He visits Yamal at the bar he owns to try to learn more for his article about Amina. In an interesting twist, the borders so meticulously constructed through scientific discourse and cultural differentiation are razed during this encounter. Yamal, the elegant Moroccan artist, is able to enchant Isaac just as he did Amina, pushing the incredulous Isaac to see the world from Amina's point of view after this extraordinary encounter. In this episode, the reader observes

an encounter that negates the characters' assertions that the neighborhood is multicultural rather than intercultural.

Like *Cosmofobia*, Manuel Gutiérrez Aragón's *Cosas que dejé en la Habana* shows a cosmopolitan Madrid in which national identity and gender intersect to complicate the lives of numerous Cuban immigrants (1998). Gutiérrez Aragón homes in on the concept of the performance to critique the way in which immigrants are compelled to play ethnic roles in Spain that putatively furthers the cause of multiculturalism. For Appiah, "collective identities… provide what we might call scripts: narratives that people can use in shaping their lifeplans and in telling their life stories" (*Race* 127). For immigrant characters, however, collective identities hinge upon the fantasies that inform how they are perceived and imagined by the dominant community and nationalistic discourse propagated by that community.

Cosas que dejé en la Habana narrates the lives of three sisters who migrate to Madrid from Havana following their mother's death. Yolanda Molina Gavilán and Thomas J. Di Salvo state that the initial airport scene, in which the girls are cursed by an immigration official, portrays Spain as a "paternalistic country that receives immigrants begrudgingly." Despite his disdain, they smile and present their documents, a paradigm of appeasing and performing that will continue throughout *Cosas que dejé en la Habana*. As they arrive in the airport, another Cuban immigrant, Igor, picks up his friend Bárbaro who has also just arrived from Havana with his family. In this instance, too, the law emerges, as Bárbaro is looking for someone who is supposed to meet him with money, and Igor warns that the airport is not a good place for this transaction as police are detaining more immigrants and watching them more closely. Throughout the film, the immigrants face the specter of legal authority and

must do their best to fit in and to collaborate with Spanish authority, even if this same authority denigrates them, like the customs official, or asks them to play a specific role as Cubans in Spanish sociality.[5] Finally, as Molina Gavilán and Di Salvo observe, the Cubans' arrival reopens the colonial encounter between the nations. Bárbaro affirms that Spain is not a foreign nation, but the motherland to which Igor replies the motherland is now a bitch.

The sisters live with their Aunt María, who gives them numerous lessons and instructions on how to live and how to assimilate into Spanish culture. In one of these stern exchanges, she scolds one of the sisters for eating grapes during the second course of lunch, when grapes are reserved for later. While this is one exaggerated example of her rigid adherence to Spanish norms, another, more profound example is brought to the fore when she must assist her nieces with finding work. While the youngest two, Ludmila and Nena, will assist her in her fur shop, the eldest sister, Rosa, is expected to marry the gay son of María's business associate. The aunt explains this obligation by averring that immigrants must work harder and expose themselves to situations that better their station as opposed to fulfilling their own personal wishes.

The immigrants' desire often crystallizes around the figure of another person in *Cosas que dejé en la Habana*. The sisters, upon arriving in Spain, talk about the sort of men they hope to meet, mentioning several stereotypes of Spaniards. They extol the fine features of bullfighters and soccer players, saying that these are the sorts of Spaniards they hope to meet and marry. This conversation reflects the notion that "the proposition advanced in the plot line… is that for their female immigrant characters, their opportunity for success comes through their personal relationships, as long as they possess certain attributes that identifies them as ideal cohorts in a heterosexual partnership within the dominant society" (Song 54).

This paradigm evinces traces of the princess fantasy through the ultimate goal of settling down with modern-day Spanish princes who will fall in love them and save them. While the three sisters do not mention princes outright, they refer to men who are heroes in contemporary Spanish culture and who represent an idealized form of masculinity also embodied by the prince.

The question of desire emerges early in *Cosas que dejé en la Habana.* Not only the girls' desire, but also Igor's fuels much of the plot in the film. When he picks up Bárbaro, he informs him that Cubans do very well in Spain and that they are able to survive by keeping Spanish women happy. Nena and Igor meet at a salsa club and both claim to want Spaniards to ameliorate their situations and to ease their difficult lives in Spain. While they both desire one another, their financial necessities compel them to seek other partners. Igor advises her to forget her memories of Cuba and Cubans and that while he likes her, he is only searching for some money and a bed. He enters into a relationship with Azucena, Aunt María's neighbor and her only friend in Madrid. Even after he sleeps with Nena, Igor must return to Azucena's house as he cannot go anywhere else. Rosi Song points out that the club scene showcases the immigrants and accentuates their "palatable and colorful presence within Spanish society," creating "a voyeuristic experience with displayed exoticism as just another object of consumption" (51). Their multiculturalism, both in the nightclub and in society, must be superficial and consumptive, a trope that will continue in *Cosas que dejé en la Habana*.

Igor complains about having to play the Cuban role for his Spanish lovers, always dancing salsa and available whenever his women want him. He must embody a Cuban form of masculinity to seem interesting to his Spanish girlfriends who allow him to survive. Igor is one of many immigrant lovers that Azucena had. She states that "en dos noches [Igor] me ha

hecho más feliz que el serbo-bosnio, el marroquí, pues que todos" [in two nights, [Igor] has made me happier than the Serbo-Bosnian, the Moroccan, well, all of them]. This statement alludes to the stereotype of Cubans as romantics and lovers, a stereotype that comes to life in her relationship with Igor and the emotional investments, rooted in nationalistic fantasies, that she projects onto it. Further, she repeats the very words Igor used to describe his relationships with Spanish women, that he makes them happy through these relationships from which he benefits financially. As in the characters in Etxebarria's works, Igor alludes to Spanish women's unhappiness and disillusion with their lives, which they attempt to rectify with dysfunctional relationships.

In a similar fashion, Nena grows tired of the literal performance she realizes in a play by a Cuban director exiled in Madrid. The play draws on a litany of stereotypes about Cuban culture and Cuban immigrants. In the first rehearsal, Nena is surrounded by other Cubans who are selling food. Cuisine often serves to represent a facile interaction with the Other that putatively foments multiculturalism; and in this scene, the naming of several types of Cuban fruits, vegetables, and dishes similarly allows for a stereotyped presentation of the island. In another rehearsal, they are bargaining in the market, showing how Castro's communism forces them to barter with milk, magazines, stockings, and other everyday goods. The representations of Cuba in the play underscore the stereotypical way in which Cuba is often imagined. In each scene, as they barter, as they describe the array of Cuban food in the market, the actors do traditional Cuban dances. They enact a performance for a Spanish audience that transmits to them the situations they imagine to characterize Cuba.

The last rehearsal shown depicts the Cubans leaving their island for better opportunities elsewhere. The Cubans clamor at the immigration desk on stage, in a

performance that reminds the viewer of the girls' arrival and the angry official who swore at them. The Cubans on stage plead: We're refugees, exiles, whatever you want. Just let us in. And Nena appeals to him as the lead, affirming, "Yo lo que busco es una vida bonita." [I am just in search of a nice life.] After their numerous performances of Cuban identity for the Spanish audience, their final performance consists of playing their role as immigrants. After singing, dancing, showcasing their food, and making light of an unfortunate political situation in which many Cubans do not have basic necessities, the play turns toward their current role of pursuing a livelihood abroad. Nena complains to Igor about the superficiality of the play, and Igor responds, reflecting María's previous statements, "las personas que enmigran tienen que hacer cosas que no les gusta." [Immigrants must often do things they don't like.] Central to this idea is playing the role, either figuratively or literally in Nena's case, of the Cuban immigrant for the Spanish audience. In the end of the play, as the immigrants realize that their lives must continue on elsewhere, Nena ruminates: "Habana no existe; ¿yo la inventé?" [Havana doesn't exist; did I invent it?] This final statement alludes to the fantasy of national space and concomitant national identities. The behaviors and traits deemed so fundamental to daily life in Havana disappear and reappear among migrating. While she is no longer in Havana, again, she must play the role of the Cuban when necessary.

The roles that the sisters and Igor play differ with regard to gender. Igor is a petty criminal who falsifies passports with an older Spanish man. He lives in a tiny, filthy apartment in a building full of immigrants who are also crammed into tiny, unsanitary spaces. The girls, on the other hand, work in service, helping their aunt in the shop and live in their aunt's modest apartment. Rosa, who is singled out for marriage, is presented as an ideal wife and mother. María notes that her niece has characteristics deemed ideal for women that

women in Spain no longer consider important and will be a good wife and mother. María contrasts Rosa's Cuban form of womanhood, depicted as traditional, with a form of modern, undesirable femininity that putatively characterizes the majority of Spanish women. Aunt María insinuates that if Javier were to wed Rosa, as a "real woman," she would be able to counter or to eliminate his aversion to women. Later in the film, when Javier rejects Rosa and the girls are uncertain what their future will be in Spain, Ludmila, the middle sister, resolves not to return to Cuba. She claims she refuses to give Fidel Castro that pleasure, while Nena logically notes that Castro does not even know she exists. While Ludmila believes that she forms part of a larger national history of which the leader is aware, Nena returns their story to the personal realm. Ludmila surprises Javier and seduces him, again suggesting that as a Cuban, she possesses more profound feminine charms than Spanish women, who have led Javier to avoid them and seek out men instead. This fantasy of the Other as devoted wife and mother was also present in portrayals of Gypsies, as mentioned above, in the late 19th and early 20th centuries when Spaniards were seen as excessively civilized and Europeanized.

The film presents a cosmopolitan Madrid in which many types of characters circulate in the urban metropolis. In several scenes, the viewer sees an array of immigrant characters. As Nena and Igor fight in a metro station, an African man extends a sheet on which he places pirated CDs and DVDs for sale. As Nena walks to her aunt's shop, a South Asian man attempts to sell her a pashmina shawl. And in Igor's apartment building, immigrants of a plethora of ethnic backgrounds bustle to and fro. While immigrants abound in the film, they appear in ways that mirror their reality within Spanish sociality at the beginning of the 2000s.

The film *Cosas que dejé en la Habana* points to a new Madrid emerging owing to changing roles in gender norms and ethnic changes that result from immigration. While the

title and numerous conversations suggest that the characters ought to leave part of their "Cubanness" behind in order to assimilate into Madrid culture, the girls' Cuban identity is pivotal in their respective successes as a shop attendant, a loving wife, and an actress. In fact, their Cuban background and identity facilitates their entry into these positions. The dose of multiculturalism the three women bring to Madrid seems to be a healthy one that results in a marriage, in continued business success, and the removal of a Cuban *Don Juan* from Spanish sociality once Igor decides to settle down with Nena and stop seeing his Spanish lovers. Rather than leaving pieces of their identity behind in Havana, they can enrich Madrid and help transform it into the sort of cosmopolitan capitol celebrated at the onset of the 1990s. Indeed, both Martí-Olivella and Kathleen M. Vernon in their analyses of Spanish transatlantic films concerned with Cuba and Cubans affirm that Spain seems to attempt to "recover," through Cuba, a lost part of itself, a better and bygone Spain (Vernon 198). Hence, this cosmopolitan fantasy is rooted in a neocolonial logic. In addition, this cosmopolitan fantasy is rigidly guarded by multiple borders, borders that migratory patterns and postcolonial realities redefine and reshape daily.

Border and Hybridization in "Fátima de los naufragios"

The final text I analyze speaks to the issue of Spanish hybridity. Lourdes Ortiz's short story "Fátima de los naufragios" depicts the ambiguous, hybrid nature of the immigrant and reflects what can increasingly be considered a border literature emerging in contemporary Spain. The title character oscillates between a Catholic and a Muslim identity that the townspeople seem comfortable not to fix, thereby demonstrating the radical hybridity of the protagonist for those who encounter her. The story primarily consists of descriptions of

Fátima, who is revered by the Spanish residents of a southern fishing village. The protagonist does not say anything to the townspeople and spends her days weeping on the beach. The story begins with the statement: “Fátima de los naufragios la llamaban” [They called her Fátima of the Shipwrecked.] (Ortiz 7). This seemingly trivial act of naming this woman has greater implications of bringing her into creation for the Spaniards, of crafting her within Spanish paradigms, while simultaneously recognizing her Maghrebian identity. The townspeople utilize her own name as a point of departure, but owing to her suffering and ostensible devotion, they compare her to the Virgin Mary.

Fátima’s apparent goodness is lauded by the other characters, despite the fact that she has not learned any Spanish and is incapable of speaking to her neighbors. Statements like “parece buena persona” [she seems like a good person] and “No es mendiga tampoco. Vive como los peces, casi del aire” [She isn’t a beggar either. She lives like the fish, she practically lives off the air] indicate her goodness (Ortiz 8). For those who encounter Fátima, her refusal to seek shelter or to enter in any activity other than weeping by the sea indicates human compassion and selflessness. This trait translates into religiosity and sacralization in the text.

The first sentence likens the protagonist to Our Lady of Fátima, the title that refers to the apparition of the Virgin Mary in Fátima, Portugal. During these appearances, Mary revealed religious secrets and the Catholic Church’s stance on political issues, such as the conversion of atheist Russia. Fátima of the shipwrecked is described in analogous terms. When she is given a new shawl to replace the tattered, filthy one she possesses, a bright light radiates around the Moroccan woman, similar to the light described surrounding Our Lady of Fátima. Just as the vision of Mary in 1917 addressed concern over the European political

milieu, the townspeople affirm that their Fátima is sent to protect the countless immigrants who die attempting to enter Spain illegally: "Demasiados muertos, muchos muertos; el mar se los traga, pero el mar nos la ha devuelto a ella, para que sepamos que las cosas no están bien" [Too many deaths, several deaths; the sea swallows them, but the sea has given her back to us, so that we know that things aren't right.] (Ortiz 14). As in other discourses of multiculturalism that I analyze throughout *Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins* Fátima's presence is instrumentalized as a tool that will aid the townspeople in comprehending contemporary immigration, and hence, make them better global citizens.

Fátima is also called Macarena of the Moors, the Virgin of the boats, the sainted Moor, our lady of the shipwrecked, and piety personified, names that allow the townspeople to identify with her as a religious figure and as a fellow human being who has experienced loss. Her pain is often likened to the sorrows of Mary, venerated and commemorated within the Catholic Church in homage to Mary's profound loss of her son. Angustias, another character in the short story whose name invokes our Lady of Anguish or the Macarena, observes: "Tiene la mismita cara de la Macarena, una Macarena tostada por el sol" [She has the same face as the Macarena, like a Macarena toasted by the sun.] (Ortiz 7). Angustias associates the Moroccan woman not only with Mary, but also with herself since she is named after this form of devotion to Mary. As in the paradigm Said outlines in *Orientalism*, the self is able to define itself against an Other. Fátima is sacralized, like Mary, who is beyond the ken and human experience of Angustias. Yet in creating an equivalence between Mary and the Moroccan Fátima, the mirrors through which the self attempts to perceive itself, exemplified in relatable figures like saints and other religious persona, become blurry. In other words, forced religious equivalence allows the townspeople to read Fátima's presence

and to relate her to themselves. Fátima is also compared to Our Lady of Carmen, the patron saint of the sea, a figure of significance in a fishing town where losing loved ones to the sea is common.

Communication is another significant component of "Fátima de los naufragios." Flesler asserts that Fátima's refusal to speak constitutes a mode of resistance against the call for the Other to realize an "ethnographic performance" that conveys the particularities of their existence for the majority population (14). Similar notions of ethnographic performance structure *Cosas que dejé en la Habana*, in which the Cubans are often called to "play the Cuban role" for their Spanish interlocutors. Fátima's silence gives her a certain degree of agency. Whereas the Other's speaking is often modified to conform to norms and conventions of the dominant society, Fátima's silence forces the townspeople to construct her within whatever paradigm they find apt. In this case, they sacralize her, blending their own Catholic beliefs with their ideas about her origins.

When a sub-Saharan man's body washes ashore on Fátima's beach, the story reaches its climax. The two immigrants form a new millennium configuration of Mary and Jesus for the town. Fátima places his dead body in her lap and prays over him, washing him with her tears. The scene captivates the townspeople, who watch Fátima care for the seemingly deceased man with much interest. Several women kneel and pray to Fátima, as she weeps for the man they baptize "el Cristo africano" (20). A voice from the sky states: "This is my beloved son" (21). This sentence is found in Luke 9:35, when Jesus convenes his disciples and asks that they go out and preach and heal in the name of God. In the Bible verse, a voice is heard from the sky; it says, "This is my beloved son, *hear him*" (my emphasis).

Ironically, the townspeople do not hear Fátima or the dead man. He cannot communicate, and Fátima refuses to speak to them. Instead of hearing them, they observe and interpret them. The story ends with a scene reminiscent of the Assumption in which Fátima walks into the water and is absorbed by the ocean waves. According to Catholic dogma, during the Assumption, "having completed the course of her earthly life, [Mary] was assumed body and soul into heavenly glory" (Pius XII, par. 44). Fátima's suffering culminates with her burial of another immigrant who faced a difficult trajectory perhaps similar to her own. They both return to the sea, having inspired the townspeople to reflect on the immigration they experience on a daily basis in a new light.

As Tabea Linhard asserts, Fátima concretely signifies both a desired hybridity and a ghostly presence (21). Her presence reflects the ghostly, not only because she is deemed a sort of paranormal phantom, but also because she lacks an identity independent from the one the townspeople bestow on her and is, thus, a shadowy presence difficult to explicate. Haunting, like Fátima's own ghostly presence on the beach, compels those who are haunted to contemplate the boundary between life and death and the traces of histories that remain unresolved in the collective imaginary and, hence, bear upon the present. As Avery Gordon asserts, the ghost only lives because those living *recognize* life in it (179). That is, the ghost demonstrates aspects of the uncanny or constitutes a familiar stranger to the living; in this case, the specter is a paradoxically saintly moor, a Muslim strangely reminiscent of the most honorable woman in the Catholic Church. Haunting indicates the materiality of the past and present; Fátima's body reminds the townspeople of the millions of immigrants living and working in Spain, and, in turn, the townspeople's reading of her presence takes into account

Spain's centuries-old history with Morocco, their own beliefs, and the idiosyncrasies of contemporary globalization.

This fierce attachment to Fátima, coupled with the distancing of mis-recognition, reveals what Linhard terms, "the messy layers of representation" (401). The aforementioned desire for hybridity that Fátima represents evinces melancholia, indicative of a culture grappling with the ghosts of its convoluted past (Linhard 401). The ambivalent figure of the Moor, whose return, according to Flesler, is feared in the collective imaginary, is thus reconfigured by the townspeople, or as Sara Ahmed states, "each encounter reopens past encounters" (*Strange* 9). In articulating the vague indeterminacy of the border through the figure of the ghost, Ortiz's short story shows the possibilities of intercultural exchange at the Spanish frontier. In allowing the border to fade away rather than assume a definite shape that separates the immigrant protagonist from the townspeople, Ortiz portrays the importance of formulating new modes of being in the world rooted in communication, identification, and intercultural exchange at the Spanish borderlands.

Immigrant bodies are inscribed into narratives in ways that suggest the cultural hybridity of postcolonial Spain and speak to the tremendous change that Spain has evinced in recent history. This change, marked by the mobility of women's bodies and foreign bodies has the radical potential to alter the cultural landscape of Spain. In this environment of flux, immigration narratives in Spain elucidate the creation and the defense of a Spanish border. The border is clearly observable in the ways in which the other is envisioned and portrayed. Nestor García Canclini describes hybridity as those socio-cultural processes within which structures of identity and power fuse to generate new structures, subjectivities, objects, and practices, or "the cultural reorganization of power" (212). With the proliferation of border-

conscious discourses about the immigrant Other, often intent on emphasizing the difference and separation between nationals and immigrants, the possibilities for these new structures and subjectivities seem rather limited in the Spanish postcolonial cultural landscape which often reifies difference and eschews intercultural exchange. With these texts, the reader sees the possibilities of intercultural exchange, historical reconciliation, and re-conceptualization of national space opened up in the encounter with the foreign immigrant once the fantasy of the border is razed. Nonetheless, these opportunities are often lost in texts that reflect the political climate of walling and opposition by underscoring alterity and difference to secure the fantasy of national space.

[1] Both controversies are attributable to gender. As Bermúdez indicates, Carmen Laforet's novel was not deemed worthy of the prize in the 1940s and 1950s male-dominated literary establishment; similar responses occurred when Etxebarria's novel, deemed of low quality, ostensibly because of the primacy of gender and sexuality in the text, won the award (226).

[2] Brown also notes that as walls came crumbling down amidst cheers in Berlin and in South Africa, dozens more were erected without public outcry for similar purposes in the United States, Israel, Saudi Arabia, and India.

[3] Gil and Domingo provide detailed statistics about the jobs that have been progressively abandoned by Spaniards and occupied by Latin American immigrants. Among them, they highlight the case of domestic work, one of the clearest examples of substitution. This work occupies the first place in terms of Latin American women's employment: 52% of them worked in the domestic sector in the year 2000 and 43.5% in 2005. Although there has been a relative decrease, the percentage of those employed in domestic work is still much higher than the percentage of those employed in other jobs. The second on the list is the work in hotels and small businesses, which employed 24.7% of Latin American women in 2000 and 29.8% of them in 2005 (Gil and Domingo 444-47).

[4] Despite the profound transformations occurred in Spanish society since the 1970s, especially women's entrance into the public sphere and the accelerated aging of the population, the State has not provided any alternatives. Parella Rubio explains how the family, organized centrally in the home around a woman's reproductive work, is still expected to be the principal welfare provider (235).

[5] This specter of violence appears in multiple immigrant narratives, which seems to convey the hostility the immigrants face at the hands of nationals who feel they have usurped the proper authorities and illegally entered their national space.

CHAPTER 2: Strait Tragedy: The Reality of Otherness

In this chapter, I analyze documentary-style narratives of feminine migration to Spain. I study documentary films, such as *Princesa de África* (dir. Juan Laguna 2008) and *Extranjeras* (dir. Helena de Taberna 2003); works inspired by and grounded in real events, such as Gerardo Muñoz Lorente's novel *Ramito de hierbabuena* (2003) and Beatriz Flores Silva's film *En la puta vida* (2001); and fictional texts that utilize authentic, often graphic, photographs of immigrants, like María García Benito's collection of short stories, *Por la via de Tarifa* (1999). While the latter texts are works of fiction, these narratives are contextualized and articulated through the use of events and images grounded in reality. The propensity to authenticate the narrative with the likeness, speech, and the experience of the immigrant Other and the resultant form of narration ascribed to transnational narratives comprise the focus of my analyses.

Several of these transnational narratives tend to have a concern for "the real," specifically with presenting their Spanish audiences with an "accurate reflection" of the gritty truth of immigration. As shown in the previous chapter, collective ideas about the Other foment a particular narrative of the Other that inheres in stereotypes and compels the other to realize a sort of ethnic performance for the majority audience. Documentary style narratives seem to undermine this fantastical Other. This tendency toward realism, achieved through the very form of the transnational narrative, would seem to negate the construction of a fantasy about the immigrant Other in favor of veracity, accuracy, and transparency. This chapter analyzes the peculiar types of mimesis reserved for rendering the Other in terms of race and gender in contemporary Spanish transnational literature and film, questioning the relationship between reality and realism. How do contemporary authors imbue these texts that depict an

unknown Other in a verisimilar, accurate, and convincing manner? What forms of representation facilitate this endeavor? How does this realistic form undermine or bolster collective fantasies about immigrants and their existence?

The Role of Documentary Narratives

Authors and filmmakers increasingly opt to represent the phenomenon of immigration through testimonial narratives. I believe that such testimonies mirror the practices of Latin American *testimonio*, which gained wider appeal and notoriety in the 1980s. Specifically, Latin American *testimonio* emerged as a hybrid genre that melds autobiographical and novelistic forms and draws on political concerns in social movements in Latin America during this period. *Testimonio* is an umbrella term used to refer to a plethora of discourses in Latin American literature, including oral accounts and people's history that propose to give voice to the voiceless: for example, the testimonial novels of Miguel Barnet, and documentary-style works of fiction such as Augusto Roa Bastos's *Yo, el supremo* (Yúdice 211).[1] Miguel Barnet first employed this term to describe the ethnographic novel *Biografía de un cimarrón*, which tells the story of Esteban Montejo, a slave who fled to freedom in the mountains of Cuba and eventually participated in the War of Independence, which ended Spanish colonial rule. As in this example from Barnet, the narrator of the *testimonio* is usually an illiterate person excluded from literary and/or journalistic institutional apparatus. Hence, the text is usually recorded, transcribed, and arranged by a professional writer, journalist, or ethnographer who functions as the narrator's interlocutor (Beverley 9). The protagonist of the testimonial narrative is usually part of a marginalized social group or a subaltern group, the most oppressed and invisible constituencies; hence, *testimonio* as a genre

is usually linked to narratives of the Third World, of national minorities, or urban subcultures.

In its autobiographical style, orality, and politically motivated subject matter, the testimonial narrative is linked to truthfulness and authenticity. Testimonial literature also complicates the reader's relationship to truth in terms of official history. The disjuncture between the protagonist's narrative and historical narratives of the past are central to the experience of *testimonio,* revealing the literariness intrinsic to each account. Elzbieta Sklodowska puts it this way:

> Sería ingenuo asumir una relación de homología directa entre la historia y el texto. El discurso del testigo no puede ser un reflejo de su experiencia, sino mas bien su refracción debida a las vicisitudes de la memoria, su intención, su ideología. La intencionalidad y la ideología del autor-editor se sobrepone al texto original, creando ambigüedades, silencios y lagunas en el proceso de selección, montaje y arreglo del material recopilado conforme las normas de la forma literaria. Así pues, aunque la forma testimonial emplea varios recursos para ganar en veracidad y autenticidad–entre ellos el punto de vista de la primera persona-testigo—el juego entre ficción e historia aparece inexorablemente como un problema (in Beverley 11).
>
> [It would be ingenuous to assume a homologous relationship exists between the history and the text. The witness's speech cannot be a reflection of her experience, and is instead, a refraction due to the vicissitudes of memory, her intention, and her ideology. The intentionality and the ideology of the author-editor superimposes itself on the original next, creating ambiguities, silences

and lapses in the process of selection, editing, and organizing the compiled material, akin to the norms of producing literature. Thus, although the testimonial form employs various techniques to attain veracity and authenticity—among them, the first person eyewitness point of view—the interplay between fiction and history appear inexorably appears as a problem.]

Despite these issues in fixing a notion of historical accuracy in testimonial narratives, the genre ironically emphasizes its authenticity and its claims to truth.

Testimonio is not like an autobiography or a sworn testimony in the juridical sense; rather, it is a collective, communal account of a person's life (Arias 76). Beverley asserts that while testimonial works do not explicitly reflect historical truth, the "truth effect" of the testimony is of interest (in Arias 76). The "truth effect" disrupts the collective notion of truth fixed by official discourse. Indeed, the realistic nature of the *testimonio* combines with the reader's grasp of the narrator as a real person to create an affective bond between the reader and the narrator (Beverley 13). In recounting the stories of those historically marginalized and silenced, the testimony widens the reader's worldview and *reality*; the truth effect ought to lead to questioning the dominant cultural institutions and their idealization and legitimation (Beverley in Carr et. al. 79). The *testimonio*, thus, gives rise to a new relationship between the First and Third worlds, between the voiced and the voiceless. Beverley asserts that *testimonio* creates a space for the intellectual and the oppressed to converge, creating a new dialectical relationship between the historically oppressed and those who belong to the oppressor-group (15). The truth intrinsic to *testimonio* engenders a dialogical relationship with the Other, acknowledging the injustice the Other experiences. This relationship does not result from knowing the Other or having proverbially walked in

the Other's shoes through the text, but calls the reader to enter into solidarity with the oppressed and to embrace their struggle. Yúdice argues that this is not the only function of *testimonio*, stating, "hay una doble historia del testimonio, por una parte el testimonio estatalmente institucionalizado para representar… y por otra parte el testimonio que surge como acto comunitario de lucha por la sobrevivencia" [there is a double story of testimony, on the one hand, state-institutionalized testimony to represent… and on the other, the testimony that arises as a community act in the struggle for survival] (214). This introduces the question of representation, and the fantasies that often undergird such representation, into the issue of alleged truth in *testimonio*. Subalterns are presented by the authors who share an account of them with the world, yet their speech is presumably their own. Adapting their speech to the hegemonic discourse, in addition to the potential of misinterpretation of their speech, allows for possible slippages that reinstate hegemony as opposed to disrupting it with the very act of speaking.

Staging Alterity in *Princesa de África*

This issue of truth and authenticity is central in representing immigration in Spain, which often purports to transmit the truth and reality behind immigration, a truth often unknown to the Spanish audience that receives and consumes transnational narratives. Daniela Flesler notes that testimonial narratives often "construct immigrants as subalterns to be interviewed, analyzed, and written about by Spaniards, in an attempt to represent an 'accurate picture' of what their lives are like" (161). The ethical relationship inherent to *testimonio*, thus, takes on new characteristics, directly related to the re-presentation of the Other. The representation of feminine immigrants and the forms such representations

assume, often analogous to those deployed in Latin American *testimonio* and other forms of documentary narrative, are of primary interest in this chapter.

Juan Laguna's 2008 documentary, *Princesa de África* presents Marem, a 14-year old girl from Louga, Senegal who gives an account of her lineage while dancing in the opening scene. Her father, Pap Ndiaye, a celebrated musician, is the most important relative in this lineage. He has traveled to Spain and taken a third wife, Sonia Sampayo, who, like Marem, is a dancer. Marem hopes to travel to Spain and become a dancer, but recognizes that "Europe is a dream, not an easy dream." Similarly, Sonia dreams of voyaging to Louga to learn more about her husband's origins and culture. Unlike other transnational narratives, this film focuses on Marem's time in the nation of origin and in showing this nation's life and customs as experienced by Marem in her Senegalese village. She lives in a small, dilapidated compound with numerous siblings, Pap Ndiaye's two wives, and grandparents, all of whom collaborate in narrating this segment of the film. Hence, the director allows the speaking Other to describe and to recount themselves. While Pap Ndiaye's wives, children, and in-laws speak throughout *Princesa de África*, the film nonetheless contains numerous scenes that seem to stage and highlight the protagonists' alterity.

Accounts that detail the experiences of the Other are generally viewed as inaccurate or lacking in verisimilitude if there is a significant degree of mediation. The Other's ethnicity and related identity, as imagined by dominant groups, must be self-referential and self-evident. Following this paradigm, in *Princesa de África*, the speaking Other embodies the alterity that hegemonic discourse ascribes them. During the first scene in Senegal, the viewer sees the courtyard of Marem's home in Louga. Several naked babies stumble about and Fama, Pap's second wife, exposes her breasts as she prepares to feed her children. This

sexualized image encapsulates what many project on to Africa, a place with unbridled sexuality, symbolized in Fama's uncovered breasts and the abundance of children. This representation is extended as she describes the polygamous marriage of which she is a part. She indicates which house is hers and which belongs to Pap's first wife, Kine; she also explains that they are aware that Pap has a third wife in Spain, and that he can take five wives. Pap spends the majority of his time with Sonia in Spain and visits his other wives and children, often for months at a time. The visual image of the women's dilapidated houses combines with their explanations to suggest the deprived and antiquated lives these women lead in Senegal.

Fama's testimony shows how the presentation of the testimonial narrative within a dominant discourse complicates the Other's speaking.[2] As Arias affirms, the subaltern's 'authentic' discourse is a suppressed or hidden 'truth' because of the Westerner's inability to comprehend it in its own terms; thus, subaltern subjects are forced to use the discourse of the colonizer to express their subjectivity (75). The subaltern must also conform to modes of representation considered legitimate by the dominant discourse. Gayatri Spivak views speaking as dialogical. She equates the Bakhtinian notion of *otvetstvennost*, "answerability," with "responsibility," signifying that the exchange between speaker and listener forms an ethical relationship that creates a discursive space for the other to exist (Landry and MacLean 5-6). Spivak revisits her seminal essay, "Can the Subaltern Speak?" nearly ten years later in *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason* proposing that the more critical question would ask if those who are privileged can even hear the subaltern? (Landry and MacLean 5).[3] Indeed, the subaltern must drastically tailor his or her speech to conform to dominant discourse and even in this scenario, once the speech has been uttered, it must be decoded and encoded by an

interlocutor who may be resistant to the message conveyed. Thus, while the subaltern may appear to speak, s/he does not attain a dialogic level of utterance.

In addition to "self-reporting" by the Senegalese women, primarily Fama, Kine, and Marem, the film foregrounds the African Other's music and dancing establishing this particular group within a field of signification based on exoticized spectacles and entertainment.[4] While Marem is a dancer, and she is part of a remarkably musical family, the entire village is most often portrayed through song and dance. She says that her little brothers like to dress up like lions and dance around; the lion symbolizes Senegal, although they are extinct there. The people themselves, in embodying this animal, seem to re-create a fundamental dimension of African culture for the Spanish viewer. Marem's brother and his friends dress up like lions and dance through the courtyard wildly. During another scene, which has no explanation, the village men dress up like lions and other beastly characters using seemingly traditional African dance and present an eerie, folkloric dance that consists of wrestling one another and chasing and frightening the town's children.

These scenes in which the Africans sing and dance convey their ethnicity for the viewer. Arturo Arias explains: "Ethnicity is constructed performatively and functions metonymically… It is an assemblage of a multiplicity of perceptions without a center or verifiable data other than its own reiteration as a truth effect" (80-1). The reiteration of ethnic performance, therefore, allows dominant groups to attempt to know the Other. Culture, thus, like gender, is constructed through a "stylized repetition of acts" which "founds and consolidates the subject" (Butler *Gender* 140). In *Princesa de África*, the African subject is established through dance and cultural rituals deemed authentic. Authenticity is central to testimonial narratives as a literary mode that has as its primary aim the revelation of the

experiences of an Other heretofore silenced owing to oppression and marginalization. The film suggests that the dances and entertaining the Africans perform constitute a fundamental part of the quotidian in Senegal, making these scenes "real" to the viewer. This question of authenticity extends from the testimonial narrative to a collective imagining of the group the protagonist Other represents. In this case, the viewer situates the smiling, dancing Senegalese as emblematic of Senegal, if not all of Africa.

The title of the film, *Princesa de África*, also elucidates the value placed on Sonia, who, I would argue, is the ambiguous princess that is the film's focus. While the movie begins with Marem, her two mothers, and her brothers, the focus inevitably shifts to Sonia. Marem's initial enunciation of her desire to move to Europe is firmly planted within the desire to continue her father's legacy of music and song there and to have a wonderful partner in Sonia, thereby establishing the Spaniard as a fundamental component of Marem's dreams of Europe. Further, Sonia is often articulated in terms of her strong connection to Africa. When Sonia is initially presented in the film, she is doing an African dance alongside Pap, who plays the drums, while her troupe dances behind her. The troupe exits the stage and at the end of the show, she dances energetically as Pap creates rich and complex rhythms on his drum. The Spanish audience fervently applauds, and the couple embraces in a scene that seems to symbolize Spanish multiculturalism. Pap describes Sonia as the best of his three wives and looks forward to their voyage to Senegal together. Shortly after, Pap's wives are seen chatting in their courtyard in Louga. They deviously remark that Sonia will arrive soon and that she will have to live "like we do." They say that Sonia will have to go to the market and cook daily, like other women in the town. They expect the Spaniard will be incapable of growing accustomed to life in Louga. Sonia herself seems apprehensive about experiencing

life in a Senegalese town in a polygamous household. The viewer joins Pap's wives in anticipating what will transpire upon the Spanish woman's arrival, and the Senegalese girl's story fades into the background.

Sonia's arrival in Senegal is welcomed with much more dancing. She and her Spanish troupe will present an African dance show, and the townspeople engage in a host of impromptu dances to convey their excitement. Prior to her show, Pap praises Sonia in front of the entire town, creating a hierarchy of women—specifically involving his other two wives—in which Sonia is firmly situated at the top. Pap affirms that Sonia is a white woman, but she is "better than a *wolof*," or a Senegalese. He admits that most white women are selfish and therefore, bad partners, but Sonia is different; she shares all she has with him, she never bothers him and stays with him because she loves him. In an extraordinary twist for contemporary narratives of immigration, it is the European who mimics the colonized, through her dancing and her seeming adhesion to Senegalese culture evident in her special relationship with Pap and her willingness to do his bidding.

Sonia is paradoxically placed on a level of equivalence with the African women and singled out from this group. The juxtaposition of Sonia and Pap's other wives, as bodies bound up in the shared marriage indicates her seeming similarity yet also evinces immense difference from the Senegalese women, difference most accurately explicated through culture and national identity. This mirrors Elizabeth Grosz's claims that bodies are signified and signify, and the presentation of these bodies on screen, differentiated in race and dress become more and more divergent as Sonia's visit progresses (18). This difference will also have important implications for Marem as a future migrant to Spain and hints at her inassimilability as a woman entrenched in this culture which Sonia visits and later repudiates.

Sonia does not, in fact, cook or clean as Pap's other wives expected. She stays in a hotel and visits their compound on occasion. She does not move to Senegal with Pap, although another house is being added to the compound, presumably for Sonia. She and Pap both decide to return to Spain together. Sonia's triumphant arrival in Louga solidifies her centrality in the film and positions her as the African princess described in the title. Her stay in Louga and her return to Spain with her husband reiterates her difference from Pap's other wives.

After several years, Marem says that she is able to travel to Europe because of her father's work and "Sonia's strength." Marem does not stay in Spain long, because she finds it boring and is disillusioned by the poverty she sees in the supposedly developed world. Upon her return to Louga, she says that she will not share her husband and she will continue to dance; she "will always dance with Sonia." Sonia's centrality to the film is thus solidified in Marem's new Western perspective, coupled with her desire to continue to be inspired and encouraged by the Spaniard.

Princesa de África presents a mobile, liberated Spanish woman and contrasts her with the African women to whom she is linked through marriage. The documentary form allows for stereotypes of Africans, manifest in portrayals of wild animals, wild sexuality signaled in polygamy, and dance spectacle to seep into the film surreptitiously without propagating a notion of marriage relatable for the Western audience. In addition, the film highlights Sonia's movement: both her ability to mimic the Africans' dancing and her journey to Africa for Pap. Her relationship with Pap remains grounded in a European multiculturalist context that does not compel her to live as the Senegalese women do. Sonia can embody this position at will and engage in a performance of "Africanness" that sheds light on her own freedom and mobility. Such performances, as mentioned in the previous chapter, serve to highlight the

reshaping of national identity. In this instance, it solidifies the notion of a putatively multicultural Spain that abides by a neocolonial logic, manifest in Sonia's openness and mobility and in the Senegalese women's stasis and marginalization.

Sentimentality and Stereotype in *Extranjeras*

Helena Taberna's documentary *Extranjeras* (2003) presents various immigrant women living in the Spanish capital, "allowing" them to recount their own circumstances. Taberna divides the film into segments, presenting Asian women from China alongside women from the Asian subcontinent, specifically, Bangladesh; Eastern European women from Poland and Romania; Latin American women from South America and the Caribbean; Arab and Maghrebi women who share in their adherence to Islam; and sub-Saharan African women. In some instances, Taberna incorporates music to suggest the region of the world that a particular section visits. The format of *Extranjeras* purportedly reflects the tenets of *testimonio* in encouraging the voice of the Other without the intervention of her interlocutor. Yet, Taberna's apparent arrangement of the segments and her emphasis on the women's domestic capacities makes plain the film's focus. The Other's speech thus, is subsumed under this rather dominant theme of the immigrant women's domesticity encouraged by the filmmaker.

Directors who utilize the medium of film specifically to create documentaries contribute to and build upon these collective notions of identity, complicated by alterity. This leads several filmmakers to eschew representing femininity altogether. Feminist film theorist Mary Ann Doane observes that the resistance to theoretical and filmic portrayals of femininity stems from the feminist critique of essentialism, that is, the notion of an essential

femininity not yet altered by patriarchy (26). Even in this seeming resistance to patriarchal social relations, patriarchy is at the root. Doane continues this line of reasoning to affirm, "from the point of view of essentialist theory… film practice must be the production of images which provide a pure reflection of the real woman… And this body is accessible to a transparent cinematic discourse" (33). Again, a parallel can be drawn that extends this point about gender to race and ethnicity. Filmmakers that do represent the Other often succumb to dominant modes of representation and signification, often legitimized by the putative authenticity of the genre of documentary.

In *Extranjeras*, Taberna attains this sense of authenticity in filming the women in their homes, at their work sites, at school, etc., allowing them to show their existence and to contextualize this visual image with their spoken explanations. Yet, as Cristina Martínez Carazo suggests, this transparency is founded on ethnographic performance and hegemonic articulations of the Other's identity. Martínez Carazo outlines her argument in this way: "Subrayaré las limitaciones que encierra el documental como género a la hora de desvelar la realidad tanto por lo que tiene de *performance* como por la problemática autenticidad de los productos culturales centrados en el *otro* pero construidos por voces hegemónicas" (267) [I will outline the limitations that documentaries as a genre face when revealing reality, through its performative dimension and the issue of authenticity with regard to cultural productions centered on the Other constructed with hegemonic voices]. Indeed, the Other often acts as she believe their interlocutor desires in order to seem credible and gain recognition from the dominant group. The women feature in *Extranjeras* consciously engage in an ethnic performance for their interlocutor. Martínez Carazo perceives this to be the case in *Extranjeras*. She says: "Varias de estas mujeres [en *Extranjeras*] exhiben una plena

conciencia de su protagonismo como actrices en este film… representan un papel creado por ellas mismas, un guión individual que les permite proyectar la imagen elegida" [Many of the women [in *Extranjeras*] exhibit consciousness of their role as actresses and protagonists in the film, complete with an individual script that allows them to project the image of their choice] (271). The speaking Other, thus, is not necessarily as groundbreaking as imagined when she must conform to certain ideological constraints the dominant culture imposes on her and perform her identity as dictated by this culture.

With the proliferation and popularity of Latin American *testimonio*, moreover, several theorists have specifically framed questions of speaking for others and representing alterity or even subalternity within this literary phenomenon. Yúdice identifies three modes of representational discourse: the description of the state of things, the replacement of one or more people with another who speaks for them, and the example that a person or thing gives to others (213). Testimonial narratives must negotiate these issues of representation, specifically when selecting a person to represent a community and in analyzing the impetus to speak or to represent a group of others. Linda Alcoff also examines the desire to speak for others, calling for those compelled to represent others to analyze the power relations and discursive effects involved (11). In establishing interrogatory practices for those who desire to speak for others, she states, "One cannot simply look at the location of the speaker or her credentials to speak; nor can one look merely at the propositional content of the speech; one must also look at where the speech goes and what it does there" (11). For these reasons, not only the discourse itself, but also its reception and impact on the public and the collective imagining are central to the conceptualization of alterity.

Similarly, Martínez Carazo, in her analysis of *Extranjeras*, says: "Como espectadores observamos que el punto de vista narrativo, a pesar de la intervención directa de las inmigrantes, pertenece a una observadora inscrita en una tradición cultural ajena a la vivida por las protagonistas de este documento" (272) [As spectators, we observe that the narrative point of view, despite the immigrants' direct intervention, belongs to an observerinscribed in a cultural tradition that differs from the one lived by the documentary's protagonists]. Despite the immigrant women's interventions in the film, dominant modes of portrayal of immigrant women foreground their narratives. Indeed, they are depicted as the director chooses and figure into a larger project of presenting Madrid in a particular fashion. Martínez Carazo observes that the serenity of the women in the film is intentional and serves to contradict a more prevalent iconography of Madrid as a site of conflict, a city significantly altered owing to waves of global immigration (268). Taberna, while not seeming to speak for others, does structure and orchestrate their speech around a plan and modes of signification that she considers useful.

Representations of women immigrants in transnational narratives increasingly avail themselves of certain stereotypes to convey both femininity and alterity. Such portrayals not only craft a dominant perspective on the marginalized female protagonists that are the central characters of these texts, but also the Spanish women for whom they serve as a counterpoint. In *Princesa de África*, this phenomenon occurs at an individual level between Marem and Sonia and in *Extranjeras*, these stereotypes contrast the foreign women as categorized in the groups described above with their Spanish counterparts. The putative authenticity and self-referentiality the Speaking Other suggests is nonetheless situated within dominant discourse

and modes of representation, thus subverting the testimonial truth claim while upholding collective fantasies of alterity.

In "How to Look at Television," T.W. Adorno analyzes the inner-workings of television and the processes that allow the mass media to function as a representational economy. While the novel highlights inwardness, inner conflicts, and psychological ambivalence, this form of representation has given way to the unproblematic, cliché-like characterizations that saturate television (217). Furthermore, he states that "the typing of shows [into comedies, dramas, romances, etc.] has gone so far that the spectator approaches each one with a set pattern of expectations before he faces the show itself" (227). Similarly, in the texts that are increasingly considered immigrant literature and cinema in Spain, various stereotypes are employed that the reader or viewer increasingly expects. Stereotypes like this example and others of cultural backwardness, feminine subordination, and sexual promiscuity abound in portrayals of migrant women. The stereotype, thus, in its elaboration and articulation, confirms Richard Dyer's point that it is not the stereotype in itself which is supposedly "wrong," but the manner in which they are constructed and the interests they serve (in Chow 60). As Jameson stated, these interests most often serve as a counterpoint to the self that contrasts itself with the stereotyped Other. In these instances, the immigrant Other's backwardness, subordination, and promiscuity serves as a counterpoint for discourses on Spanish femininity, typified as "liberated," although with interesting complications as I will later analyze.

Essentialism and stereotyping, especially with the visual medium of film, must be negotiated by the author or filmmaker. With texts that have a particularly realistic theme, moreover, this issue is paramount. Often, the author or filmmaker's goal is to portray the

essential “reality” of the protagonists’ gender or culture, while concurrently demonstrating how this individual is distinct in terms of gender and culture. The latter process is most often achieved through stereotype. With the question of the stereotype, the tension between the individual and the collective reemerges. The stereotype requires that one person stands in for a collective. This representational process, analogous to the one outlined earlier regarding *testimonio,* hinges on the erasure of individual differences. Whereas the *testimonio* claims to utilize this erasure to create a dialectical relationship between the narrator and the reader, the stereotype specifically forecloses open interaction. The viewer or reader who encounters the stereotyped Other views the collective in that stereotype and can deduce that the members of this group are *all alike*. The representation of the group in an individual other, falls along a continuum of creating communication or causing it to cease and thus, surreptitiously encourages marginalization.

The realistic nature of the testimonial narrative and the documentary, thus, can serve as an impetus to disorient hegemony in aligning the Other with her would-be oppressor in the space of the text. Kimberly Nance states that the narrators of *testimonio* raze the external, governmental containment strategies that determine what they are permitted to say, when, how, and to whom (570). Despite this potential, the realistic nature of these texts can be employed to reinforce stereotypes and to perpetuate the marginalization of certain social groups. In the case of Spain, Isolina Ballesteros observes that in the late twentieth century, immigrants remained largely invisible in the social sphere; in Spanish cinema, specifically, she notes that immigrants are either nonexistent or stereotyped (“Screening” 50). The desire to grasp the immigrant “as is” and to present her world without mediation veils a more profound fantasy. This realistic turn, in fact, often allows the author to perpetuate stereotypes

and to insinuate that the lack of mediation constitutive of the realistic genres they use demonstrates their veracity. In narratives like these, the political purposes of Latin American style *testimonio* are also undermined in representational processes that sentimentalize or sensationalize the immigrant experience, while simultaneously alleging the representation's transparency. Sentimentality allows for a comfortable interaction with the immigrant character that eschews political collaboration while sensationalism allows the reader/viewer to feel wholly detached from the protagonists, thus furthering their marginalization.

Taberna's segmentation in *Extranjeras* evinces such characteristics of the stereotype. The groupings insinuate that due to prior geographical proximity, these women will share experiences in the destination. This results in the juxtaposition of Andean immigrants who sell wares in Retiro Park with others that work in the private sector and have advanced university degrees. Taberna disregards their class divisions, both in the nation of origin and in Spain, for the sake of presenting each group as a seamless totality. The stereotype of domesticity is most often employed for the Latin Americans. This mirrors the dominant legal and social discourse that embraces Latin American feminine migration as a means to counter the scarcity of domestic workers in Spain.[5]

During one segment on Latin American women, the Oyola family is presented at home; three generations of Peruvian women describe their lives and their work in Madrid. The mother, a political exile, owns a restaurant and bar, while her daughters work in law and private administration. Both generations of women emphasize the importance of the girls' grandmother, which elicits a discussion about family values. The women criticize the treatment of the elderly in Spain, saying that the way grandparents are "abandoned" in the *pueblos* by themselves, without people to take care of them, is "inhuman." The film also

shows several Dominican women who gather on Sundays to cook Dominican food, do one another's hair, and enjoy one another's company. The film then shows us one of them, Lala, the following day, while she does domestic work. She is filmed in her employers' home, with their infant son, describing her day of chores: cleaning, cooking, washing, ironing, taking the baby out, etc. She, too, engages in the ongoing critique of the Spanish working mother by denouncing her employer's treatment of her child. She observes that on Mondays, the child she cares for is dreadful owing to his mother's spoiling and bad care during the weekend. She says: "su madre lo mima demasiado los sábados y domingos; entonces cuando me lo encuentro el lunes me lo encuentro… muy mal. Que no quiere dejarme hacer nada los lunes." [his mother spoils him too much on Saturdays and Sundays; when I return on Mondays, I find he is in a very bad way. He doesn't let me do anything on Mondays.] This comment highlights the collective consensus, even among immigrant women who are working outside of their homes—albeit in domestic capabilities—, that Spanish working mothers are deficient in their nurturing and mothering skills.

The topic of food preparation, one indicator of domesticity, reemerges in an interview with an Ecuadorian woman who owns a *locutorio*. One of her daughters explains how much more complete breakfast is in Ecuador, with fruit, bread, juice, instead of, she says, just the coffee Spaniards usually have. Once again, the statements about the more nutritious and wholesome quality of food prepared by Latin American women is established as a positive way of stating the superiority of their reproductive work. Another segment featuring Latin American women again emphasizes cooking as an activity that fulfills and unites women: it shows a large group of women from several different countries who meet regularly to participate in a cooking club. While the club is simply dedicated to cooking, not women who

cook, there are hardly any men in the group. Several of the participants agree that cooking together establishes a sort of group identification and comradeship that is difficult to find elsewhere. The women share their tales of the trials and tribulations of immigration, yet affirm that cooking is an agreeable and somewhat therapeutic distraction. They proclaim that despite the racial, ethnic, and class divisions that separate them, they are united in their culinary interests.

The final scene of *Extranjeras* presents several African women. The transition from the previous group of women—Middle-Eastern Arabs and Maghrebians—to the sub-Saharan Africans is signaled by melodious African music, which organizes and orchestrates Taberna's segment on the sub-Saharans. Again, Africa is stereotyped as a place of music, dance, and song, of throbbing musical beats and promiscuity. The first Africans presented are two young women who take care of children and cook. They sell this food out of the small apartments in which they live since they do not have the resources to purchase a restaurant. Sheer poverty also typifies the African experience, obvious in the worn pots and the humble apartment in which the women sell their food. Music comes to the fore in the very last group of African women presented, who are part-time musicians. One of the women remarks outright, "No vivo de la música," [I don't live off music] yet this is the only forum in which Taberna chooses to present them. They speak about love, relationships, and children, and allude to the difficulty in finding a decent partner with whom to settle down, especially as foreigners. Thus, in addition to music, sexuality is also fundamental to the portrayal of the Sub-Saharan women. During the film's last moments, these women sing and dance, while the other foreign women enjoy their show. Again, the stereotype of dance emerges in the portrayal of the African immigrants. The immigrant women, regardless of their varied

national and cultural origins, are again united; this time, instead of culinary interests, music and song, hinging on the African spectacle, allow them to come together.

Domesticity is the locus around which foreignness and femininity are articulated in *Extranjeras*. Isolina Ballesteros observes: "Most women are filmed by Taberna inside the kitchen and interviewed by preparing lunch or dinner. Taberna wants to emphasize the strong connection that still exists between immigrant women and domestic chores not necessarily as a negative aspect but rather as an alternative route for women in the adopted society" ("Embracing" 8). Feminine domestic capabilities are depicted as the primary mechanism that permits women to enter and remain in Spain. According to Ballesteros, Taberna equates culinary traditions with other major cultural components like language (8). Yet, as Mariagiulia Grassilli states, superficial forms of cultural relativism, such as music and cuisine, tend to foment a facile interaction with the Other that ritualizes ethnicity, commodifies culture, and undermines the politicization of ethnic groups on the grounds of their oppression and exclusion from dominant society (74).

Rey Chow investigates the stereotype as a representational device rooted in processes of duplication and repetition (54). These repetitions echo Butler's aforementioned theory of gender as a "stylized repetition" (*Gender* 140). These repeated performances also serve to constitute the subject, often in a manner that consists of another group's fantasies about that subject. Chow draws on the work of Frederic Jameson to assert that cross-cultural contact tends to be a superficial, "brush against the Other," which illuminates the struggle intrinsic to this representational process (55). For Chow, the stereotype exemplifies this superficial encounter. The stereotype, in creating a boundary between two communities, is often deployed as a way to project on to an Other that which is considered alien (Chow 59). In the

case of the documentary *Extranjeras*, the domesticity of the foreign immigrants suggests an atavistic form of femininity currently shunned by Spanish women. These superficial encounters also mirror Chow's arguments on the stereotype. In various scenes in *Extranjeras*, immigrant women are presented completing domestic work or singing and dancing in a manner deemed characteristic of the nation of origin.

Visual culture circulates representations and concomitant discourses about social groups, which in turn, mold collective notions of identity. Visual culture, in representing reality even more transparently via real images must also consider the representation of the Other. Laura Mulvey posits that "film reflects, reveals, and plays on the socially established interpretations of sexual difference which controls erotic ways of looking and spectacle" (833). Mulvey is primarily concerned with gender and the distinction in male presence and female presence in film. An obvious parallel can be drawn with regard to culture, and how those Othered in terms of race or ethnicity are depicted on camera. Mulvey continues, stating that cinema is founded on scopophilia, or the pleasure that results from looking, specifically looking at another person as an object (835). In this vein, there is an active male looker, who is the obverse of the opposite of the passive/female looker (Mulvey 837). This paradigm structures the form of the film, in which women characters are considered a spectacle, marked by "to-be-looked-at-ness," while men serve to carry on the narration and significant elements of the plot (837). Film theorists have complicated Mulvey, and Jane Gaines, specifically, proposes the notion of "looking relations" which acknowledges the role race and class play in the objectifying gaze (61). Similarly, Frederic Jameson acknowledges the power paradigms attributed to "the right to look" (in Kaplan xviii). Historically, men have looked at women, and colonizers have looked at the colonized. Thus, visual culture mimics and reifies

social divisions in focusing the camera and the audience's gaze on certain characters and on attributing particular roles to characters based on gender, race, and/or ethnicity.

These representations become more acute in the case of the documentary, which, like the testimonial narratives described above, suggests that a significant degree of truth and authenticity structures the filmic representations. Bill Nichols considers documentary film a "discourse of sobriety" that describes the real and tells the truth (in Shapiro 80). Ann Shapiro argues that "there's unmediated truth here [in documentary films] because this was not scripted-because the materials are 'found in nature' thus, the text built out of them is truthful as well" (84). This form, thus, is ideal for representing gender and race as many believe it exists "in nature," a problematic assumption as these categories are often constructed in alignment with social norms and conventions. Further, this lack of mediation presupposes the objectivity and neutrality of the camera which subjects those it captures to a particular, often problematic gaze, as theorists have shown.

Film poses questions about the ways the unconscious structures ways of seeing and pleasure in looking (Mulvey 834). Gender, ethnicity, and class converge to position these immigrants firmly within domestic roles traditionally assigned to marginalized women. Seeing these women continually engaged in domestic activities in *Extranjeras*, for example, reifies a particular image of feminine immigrants for the audience. Moreover, these scenes depoliticize these immigrants, while simultaneously demonizing Spanish women who have seemingly abandoned their domestic and feminine responsibilities for other endeavors. The political value intrinsic to testimonial narratives is weakened in *Extranjeras* through the fundamentality of domesticity, which sentimentalizes the immigrant experience and

minimizes the space for empathy and solidarity initially made possible through the very concept of testimonial narrative.

Sentimentality is a component of the private sphere and domesticity, allowing for a comfortable interaction with the immigrant character that eschews political collaboration. As Sara Ahmed describes it, "If we rethink domestic space as an effect of the histories of domestication, we can begin to understand how 'the home' depends on… appropriation… as a way of making what is not already here familiar or reachable" (*Phenomenology* 113). Yet this familiarity, achieved through sentiment and recognizing an emotion, must also uphold difference. This is why Mary Louise Pratt asserts that sentiment, coupled with science, serves as the foundation for imperialist social relations (in Howard 72). For Joan Copjec, sentimentality "reveals and confronts the absence of ethical foundations in the world" (in Berlant *Female Complaint* 21). In *Extranjeras,* during one scene, women who are not a part of the documentary turn to Taberna for sympathy after they are expelled from Retiro Park where they are illegally selling food that she has prepared. This moment encapsulates the sentimentality at root in several of the women's exchanges. Unable to gain recognition from the *guardia civil* who insist that the vendors leave the park immediately, the women look to the filmmaker for emotional support and a different form of recognition.

Lauren Berlant's extensive work on sentimentality is also useful. Berlant defines the female complaint as: "an aesthetic 'witnessing' of injury. Situated precisely in the space between a sexual politics that threatens structures of patriarchal authority and a sentimentality that confirms the inevitability of the speaker's powerlessness, the female complaint registers the speaker's frustration, rage, abjection, and heroic self-sacrifice, in an oppositional utterance that declares its limits in its very saying" ("Female" 244). Berlant

reads the female complaint as the failure to achieve a legitimate public female presence in American culture. A similar process is at work in Spanish culture and in its representation in the documentary *Extranjeras*. Berlant, alluding to the context of American women, states that, "in modern liberal democratic societies, most inequality is partial, contradictory, and contested: it is more informal [in behavior] than formal [law or policy]" (*Female Complaint* xi). Most of the Latin American and African women featured experienced more overt, policy-based inequality as illegal immigrants. Illegitimacy defines their very presence in the Spanish public sphere. Their complaints, brought to the fore through a Spanish interlocutor, the director, are indeed articulated in the paradigm Berlant elaborates above. The act of hearing in witnessing and in testimonial narratives is exigent and difficult. As Spivak indicates, speaking is in turn a question of the powerful being capable of listening to and hearing the Other's complaint.

The paradox of the immigrant women's ostensible defiance of Spanish authority and simultaneous powerlessness within that authority resonates in the final scene of the sub-Saharan women in *Extranjeras,* who desire to settle down and live "normal" lives in Spain, yet experience continual marginalization and invisibility within Spanish sociality. The repeated turn toward domesticity in this and in other moments in the film also erodes the radical potential of the *extranjeras*'s speech. As stated above, sentimentality is the recognition of an emotion and its social construction. Hence, sentimentality, articulated in the female complaint, slides between fantasizing fulfillment, witnessing disappointment, and engendering transformative events (Berlant *Female Complaint* 12). According to Berlant, tears, like those shed by the last generation of Peruvian women in *Extranjeras* when speaking about the sacrifices their mother and grandmother endured for their betterment, illuminate "a

scene of heroism and pragmatism authorized by *fantasy*" (Berlant *Female Complaint* 12, my emphasis). The potential political empowerment ensues not from a commitment to change the world despite oppression and hindrance, manifest in the very act of migration, but in the emotional response to this oppression. The Spanish viewer, who ought to share in this emotional response, is now provided a more convenient register with which to contemplate social relations.

Photography: Capturing the Other

Both Nieves García Benito and Gerardo Muñoz Lorente utilize press photographs to lend their narratives a realistic perspective. I analyze photographs as a device intended to enhance the level of realism in their narratives. These photographs also frame the narratives, providing visual evidence of "real" immigration and how this phenomenon will be framed in the resultant fictional tales about the images; hence, the stories seem to be less designed by the author who invents the story, than engineered by virtue of the truthfulness of the situation captured in the photograph.

The narrative of immigration finds ample supplementation in photos of deceased or detained foreign bodies shown regularly in the daily news. The photographs complete two functions in the text. First, as Andre Bazin asserts, photography, like cinema, satisfies society's obsession with realism (240). Yet, while the photograph satisfies our desire for unstaged reality, it simultaneously requires interpretation. Walter Benjamin states, "In photography, one encounters something strange and new… something that is not to be silenced, something demanding the name of the person who had lived then, who even now is still real and will never entirely perish into *art*" (202). The photograph demands

contextualization and explanation, evident in captions, conversation bubbles, or other devices that tend to explain the circumstances of the image. In “The Rhetoric of the Image,” Roland Barthes argues that “in every society various techniques are developed intended to *fix* the floating chain of signified in such a way as to counter the terror of uncertain signs; the linguistic message is one of these techniques” (274). This creates a rift in photographic and cinematic production for Barthes who differentiates between the spectatorial consciousness of photographs and the fictional consciousness of films. The photograph’s significance lies in the ability of the viewer to move the literal image from its pure state to one of contextualization and mediation. Affixing a narrative to these images of reality, hence, impedes free interpretation or doubt as to the meaning underlying this captured moment of reality. It is the meanings that secure what is signified in these transnational narratives that are of particular interest.

Barthes also posits that because photography always consists of representation, it provides the very raw material of ethnological knowledge (*Camera* 28). In addition, unlike language, the photograph grounds itself as fact and authenticates itself (Barthes *Camera* 80, 85). According to Barthes, the presence of the thing in the photograph is never metaphoric; even when corpses are photographed, they are made to be “alive as corpses” (*Camera* 78-9). The horror from viewing a photograph of a corpse emerges from the vitality with which the corpse is infused, and the call to witness the death of another human being.

Owing to their visual accuracy and presumed objectivity, photographs are often used as tools to document the new and the exotic, and have historically been frequently used to attain information about and to represent the “Other.” Parvati Nair notes that, “The mere language of photography — to ‘frame’, to ‘shoot’, ‘to capture’ — speaks of alienation,

domination, and even violence" ("Autography" 185). Indeed, the staging, framing, and shooting in photography often presupposes a power differential manifest in those being photographed and those on the other side of the lens. In the case of Spain, however, photographs of immigrants often serve as testimonies of the trials and tribulations they face in attempting to migrate to Europe.

African immigrants were first picked up in *pateras,* small precarious boats, in Tarifa, the southernmost point of both Spain and Europe in November 1989 (Kim "Bearing Witness" 301). Since then, thousands of immigrants have died and thousands more have been detained attempting to enter Spain illegally. The group Pro Derechos Humanos de Andalucía reports that nearly 1,000 died in 2007 alone attempting to cross the strait. Yeon-Soo Kim notes that since the 1990s, photographs in national and regional newspapers have been fundamental in raising the issue's political relevance (*Family Album* 207). Kim states that "the role of the press in Spain has been vital in the dissemination of information regarding the scope of the calamity African immigrants face" (*Family Album* 207). The press response countered the political reaction which sought to render the Spanish and European border impermeable despite the human losses. These photographs, like *testimonio,* utilize real people and events to widen the Spanish public's reality, and to raise consciousness on a grave issue and to bear witness to the Other's plight. Parvati Nair observes that such photographs forge a vision and shape a documentary narrative rooted in the social about the marginalized ("Autography" 184). These narratives comprise the building blocks of representation and identity.

In the collection of short stories, *Por la via de Tarifa*, Nieves García Benito interweaves black and white photographs with narratives of immigration. In several of the

stories, the protagonists react to the same photograph the reader has viewed. This grounds the stories as impressions that result from the experience of the photograph as text of immigration versus the contextualization model pursued by Muñoz Lorente in *Ramito de hierbabuena*, in which the entire novel consists of the author's interpretation of how the event depicted in a photograph comes to pass. The first short story in García Benito's collection, "Cailcedrat," features a photo of a dead man found on the Spanish shore. This photo, taken by Ildefonso Sena Rodríguez aims to save the man in the photo from oblivion. Yeon-Soo Kim puts it this way:

> Sena's photographic interpretation of the African's death is at odds with the theories concerning the representation of the Other. This is because his photographic language accentuates deference for rather than difference from the photographed, subverting the general signifying practice of a racially and culturally different Other, stereotyped and reduced to a crude biological essentialism (*Family Album* 210-11).

As in testimonial narrative, the importance of deferring to the Other and eschewing the conventional stereotype are key in this photographic representation. While the man is near the sea and the *patera* is nearby, Sena particularizes the dead man through the intimate, close stance he uses for the snapshot. This closeness compels the viewer to look at the dead man's face and to attempt to connect with him (Kim *Family Album* 213). Thus, the anonymous, deceased immigrant who often appears in the Spanish mass media is particularized and the viewer is obliged to recognize him as an individual.

The story that accompanies this representation imagines the dead man's mother's response to the photo, upon seeing it in the newspaper. By allowing the dead migrant's

mother to speak to her son, García Benito, in a sense, returns him home. This concept of home is fundamental to this short story and to both the establishment of a relationship between the migrant and the destination in which he died and to the re-establishment of a connection between the migrant and his mother and homeland.

Kim situates "Cailcedrat" within her theory on family photographs to posit that García Benito's narrative inscribes a mental scene in which the reader is called to bear witness to the suffering of others (*Family Album* 206). Like testimonial narratives already described, this text utilizes reality, the real image of a deceased migrant, to enter into an ethical relationship with the Other and to call attention to the Other's hardship and oppression. Kim observes a unity of image and voice in "Cailcedrat" (*Family Album* 215). I believe that this unity extends into the modalities of each form. Kim states that Sena avoids conventions that represent a foreign death as spectacle, loaded with violence in the model of sensationalism described above (*Family Album* 220). Similarly, the story does not sensationalize the immigrant's death, but utilizes the narrative to recognize the immigrant's death and to create a space in which to mourn this tragedy (*Family Album* 215). Kim concludes that García Benito's integration of an African perspective in immigration discourse is invigorating and by treating the photograph as family photography, García Benito adds a more intimate dimension to the immigration debate (*Family Album* 204-5, 220).

The story begins with the mother observing the physical characteristics of her son. While she recognizes his face and clothing, like the shirt she gave him, she also observes that his body and his clothes have been altered by the dangerous voyage. She laments, "No comprendo lo que te ha podido pasar en tu cara: tienes blanca la nariz, ¿o está desgarrada?"

(García Benito 15) [I don't know what happened to your face: your nose is white, or is it scratched?]. This leads her to think about his childhood and the colds her son frequently experienced; while this bothered her, her son's grandmother declared that this was the sole way to expel demons from one's body, through constant sneezing (García Benito 15). This photo of her son unleashes a host of memories in which the mother remembers key events both in African history and in her own life. Her memories serve to commemorate events for an entire community, yet bear the mark of her specific perspective.

His mother recalls attending the World Festival of Black Arts, held in Dakar, Senegal in 1966. The event was initiated by President Léopold Senghor, a notable poet and an architect of Negritude, a pan-Africanist artistic and literary movement. She recalls the long journey from her town to the capital and the dusty roads on which she and her family traveled. She also remembers the president-poet's reading of the "Preliminary Poem" of *Hosties Noires*, although she forgets several of the poem's verses and remembers them later. While this poem may seem like a trivial detail, García Benito's interweaving of the photograph, the narrative, and this poem form a unit, which critiques the social structures of subjugation and oppression inherent to colonial rule and the neocolonial paradigms underlying today's domination of certain regions of the world.

The collection of poems *Hosties Noires* outlines the grievances of the poet as a spokesman representing black peoples forced into war by Europe, his own uneasy of posture of love and hate with regard to Europe, and his search for peace and reconciliation (Dramé 13). Senghor's volume is translated as both *Black Hosts* and *Black Victims*, alluding to the sacrificial nature of black existence following colonization. The "Preliminary Poem" presents several of the dominant themes of the volume. Indeed, these themes are echoed in

"Cailcedrat," which, in a nuanced manner, addresses the conflicted relationship between Africa and Europe. The first example occurs in the first sentence of the story, in which she states, "…Te compré [la camisa] última hora en aquel mercadillo, que, me he enterado después, lo montan con la ropa que recoge Cruz Roja para los pobres—dicen—, en países como España" (García Benito 15) [I bought you [the shirt] at the last minute in the market, which I found out later, they set up with clothes that the Red Cross collects for the poor—they say—in countries like Spain]. This phrase about the origin of a shirt demonstrates the uneven relationship between the global North and South. Her son's death in the *patera* while attempting to gain access to a richer nation also exemplifies this disparity.

She remembers seeing Senghor at the festival and his inspiring speech about Africa's relationship to the white world. She says, "Contó que un sabio le había dicho que los blancos eran caníbales porque no respetaban la vida. Eso recuerdo y te lo cuento, hijo" (García Benito17) [He said that a wise man told him that the white men were cannibals because they didn't respect life. I remember this, and I tell you, my son]. This lack of respect for human life becomes acute when the reader remembers that this woman is speaking to a photo of a person who has died during the perilous trip out of Africa to a supposed life of opportunity in Europe. The mother continues, describing her rape as a pre-teen by a Frenchman, Monsieur Colbert, again deepening the reader's conceptualization of the lack of respect for humanity engendered in the processes of colonization.

The stream-of-consciousness of the mother's thinking demonstrates that seeing the photograph of her dead son has allowed her to unleash several memories that were perhaps repressed and to begin to work through a series of traumas that result from the experience of colonization. When she sees that her son's genitalia has been covered by a cloth. She

wonders what could have happened to him, while simultaneously remembering Monsieur Colbert and affirming that Senghor died several years ago. Shortly after this confluence of memories, she recalls Senghor's poem: "No dejaré—¡no!—que las alabanzas del desprecio os entierren a escondidas" [I will not let the contemptuous praise secretly bury you] (García Benito 20). This specific passage, which addresses death and forgetting are fundamental to the theme of "Cailcedrat" and reflects the ethical obligations inherent to testimonial narratives. The verse asserts that the speaker will not allow his fellow Africans to be buried furtively, that he will remember them. In a similar fashion, the photos of the immigrants who have died in *pateras* insist on commemorating the difficult journey and those who attempted it unsuccessfully. In "Cailcedrat," García Benito employs Sena's photograph to heighten the reader's awareness of the situation plaguing Africans who attempt to migrate to Spain, thus connecting him to the Spanish public via the reader. In addition, the story reconnects the dead man with his mother, allowing her to mourn the loss of her son and to begin to work through previous traumas.

In "Gabriela," García Benito again engages the *patera*, but from multiple perspectives and historical moments. The story features a black and white photo of several Moroccan immigrants in one of the tiny boats. This plurality of voices crafts a unique interpretation of the *patera* and the surge in immigration in Spain. The story begins in the future: twelve-year old Gabriela enjoys taking her grandfather's old box of photos and scrutinizing them with the relentless, childlike inquisitiveness. One night, she sneaks out of her home and goes up to the tower at Poniente, cloaked in a "manta mora" [Moorish blanket] (García Benito 43). Through her dress and her curiosity about the history of the immigrants, Gabriela evinces Spain's peculiar and intimate relationship with Morocco. The narrator describes the photos in this

way: “Habían dado la vuelta a Europa, hasta que dejaron de ser noticia y el problema se fue ignorando” [They had shocked Europe, until they stopped making the news and the problema was ignored] (García Benito 45). Gabriela’s interest in the photos reinvigorates the issues that eventually faded from public concern. Like the population at large, Gabriela’s father does not take interest in reviewing and explaining the old pictures; he tells her: “Tú míralas y te inventas una historia” [Look at them and invent a story for yourself] (García Benito 44). Following this suggestion, Gabriela studies a photograph of a full *patera* and creates a story for each passenger.

She invents Aisa, a young Moroccan woman who refuses to marry in outright defiance of her father’s wishes and must move to France. She also invents Játiba, a teenager with three children from an arranged marriage with an older man. These are the sole women passengers on the craft. Gabriela also describes the male travelers, eventually pausing to note: “su propio relato la entristecía, pero ¿qué podía hacer?, no encontraba ni una cara alegre en la patera” [Her own story saddened her, but, what could she do? She could not find one happy face in the boat] (46). Gabriela’s story of a future interpretation of the past ends, and her mother, the writer, smiles at her sleeping baby and acknowledges that the future creates an interesting vantage point to address the question of immigration. The future and present converge when a *patera* comes on shore. One by one, she sees the scene previously described, including Aisa, Játiba, the young men, the rickety Yamaha motor, and a Marlboro case. This uncanny ending demonstrates the power of the photograph and the ability of those who look to also be impacted by this act and hence, for the photograph to transform the viewer’s reality. This process is reflected in Nair’s interest in “the question of the borders through which we habitually perceive others” (“Autography” 185).

"Gabriela" blurs the boundary between self and Other seemingly crafted in the act of photography. While Gabriela contextualizes and narrates the Other's history, she commemorates the long-forgotten history of the *pateras* and the poor Africans who died during the arduous journey to this land of opportunity. The convergence of Gabriela's story with her mother's also calls attention to the transformative possibility of the photograph. Looking at the immigrants, recognizing their humanity, communicating their story to others sets in motion what I deem a shifted reality. The immigrants she sees in the end, the very ones from her imagination convey the power of the imagination to create and to transform the particularities of reality. The space of fiction, specifically, allows for a novel form of witnessing. According to Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub, "'life testimony' is not simply a testimony to a private life, but a point of conflation between text and life, a textual testimony which can *penetrate us like an actual life*" (2). In "Gabriela," stories and lives inter-penetrate one another, and the Spaniards bear witness to the suffering Other through the photograph and are compelled to share this story with others.

Gerardo Muñoz Lorente's novel *Ramito de Hierbabuena* also results from the author's experience with a photograph. His textual contextualization is very distinct from that of García Benito. He opts to write a story of immense violence and suffering that transforms the immigrant and her experience into a spectacle, now substantiated with photographic evidence. In the photo Muñoz Lorente uses, a dead sub-Saharan woman is outstretched on a beach. Her eyes are partially opened, in a gaze marked by death and its horror. One of her arms lies somewhat perpendicular to her body, and the rags of a blouse destroyed by the sea barely cover areas of this arm. The blouse does not cover her torso, revealing a black, lacy bra. Her forehead is covered with sand and bruises. The sea occupies most of the space

behind her, yet her bruised, naked body is definitely the object of the photographic gaze. The author states he was attracted by the dead woman's youth and beauty and captivated by the image, claiming she looked as though she were merely sleeping on the sand.

The visual representation of this anonymous woman's lifeless, battered, and barely clothed body compels Muñoz Lorente to question the histories underlying her demise and to construct a fictional piece that "breathes life" into this enigmatic dead woman; she is reborn Maimuna Azhar Maymum.[6] This is similar to what García Benito does in her work in which she assigns a national identity to the unknown immigrants she sees in photography; the fictional aspect of her work, however, is far more overt. On the cover of *Ramito de hierbabuena,* Muñoz Lorente describes his text as "una novela que *nos* acerca a la *realidad* de la inmigración." In addition, in a preliminary note, he states this novel is built on testimonies he gathered from immigrants in Morocco and in Spain.

Yet, the photograph of the sub-Saharan triggers a collective memory of Spain's relationship to North Africa. The anonymous sub-Saharan woman is supplanted with a figure far more accessible for Muñoz Lorente, the North African *mora,* a once autochthonous character ironically exoticized, demonized, and idealized in Spanish literature since the Middle Ages.[7] Isabel Santaolalla observes that immigrants are often employed as a trope to symbolize other times and spaces, such as Spain's colonial past. Indeed, these figures constitute a component of the "projective past" (Foucault qtd. in Santaolalla "Ethnic" 67). This crafts a symbolic space in which the historic Other solidifies the collective notion of Spanish identity through difference and contrast (Santaolalla "Ethnic" 67-68). This is also the case with the North African Moroccan immigrant who, according to Flesler, often serves as a textual mechanism to facilitate allusion to Al-Andalus and the Reconquest of Spain (3). I

apply Flesler's model specifically to feminine migration; responses to feminine immigration hinge upon questions of conquest and control that allude to Spain's Reconquest and re-assertion of political and cultural dominance over the Iberian Peninsula. While Moroccan men are represented as unwelcomed invaders, women migrants are often represented in a way that affirms Spain's economic and cultural ascendancy with regard to other spheres of the world.

The novel presupposes a positioning of subject and object with significant implications related to power, authority, and agency. The mysterious body displayed on the novel's cover will consume the space of the novel in ways the author-ity considers legitimate and verisimilar. This echoes Arias's and Spivak's theories of subalternity and representation. Arias argues that the speaking subject must enunciate the language of reason of their Western interlocutors, hence the subaltern only becomes a subject when s/he can mimic the oppressors' discourse (75-6). While the woman on the novel's cover is obviously not a speaking subject, for Muñoz Lorente, the deceased immigrant only gains significance as a Moroccan, which presupposes a centuries-long relationship that he can deconstruct and assess in his novel. The novel's purported mimeticism rests on the racial politics underlying the dynamics of the Spanish imaginary and Spain's conflictive relationship to Maghrebian migration. Indeed, while the photograph captures a moment in the life—or death—of the anonymous Other, the text accompanying it demands that she conform to tropes of alterity and representation as the author's Maghrebian protagonist.

The novel's central protagonist is Maimuna, who migrates to Spain in order to be with Habib, the man she loves. After several hindrances in Morocco, Maimuna finally makes the journey to Spain. Upon her arrival, she is immediately drugged and raped by Tony, a

member of the organized crime ring that facilitates illegal voyages for desperate African immigrants like Maimuna. The attack begins with a seemingly friendly inquiry in which Tony says, "Digo que siento curiosidad por algunas cosas que me han contado de vosotras, las moras" (Muñoz Lorente 197). Tony, like several other Spaniards who encounter Maimuna, refers to her as a *mora*, hence, confirming an ahistorical characterization of Maimuna that reflects Spain's relationship to North Africa more so than the "reality of immigration."[8] This is the first of several scenes that aim to stir an affective response of disgust in the reader. The men who rape her are punished in an equally violent manner that culminates in castration. The mob boss, el Americano, explains his violent reaction somewhat, stating, "¿No pensaste ni por un momento en que estabas tomando lo que no es tuyo?, ¿en que estabas desobedeciéndome, ¿en que estabas maltratando un material muy especial?" (Muñoz Lorente 199) [You didn't think, for one moment, that you were taking something that wasn't yours? That you were disobeying me? That you were mistreating very special material?]. El Americano not only suggests that Maimuna is his property, but also that she will have a special purpose in Spain. The reader correctly intimates that this singling out will not have a favorable outcome for Maimuna.

Maimuna is given a tattoo on her chest and presented to a man who, upon seeing her for the first time, only smiles and says "Laila" (Muñoz Lorente 208). Following the unexpected meeting, Maimuna wakes up in a place called "el inferno," a sort of basement-dungeon where she is chained to a bed. Her kidnapper is a mentally ill man named Lalo (Muñoz Lorente 209). He visits Maimuna regularly, alternating between abusing her physically and sexually or pretending to be a child and begging Maimuna to care for him. There is a language barrier between Maimuna, who speaks hardly any Spanish, and her

captor, who speaks some *amizage*. When she asks how he learned this language, he replies, frustrated, that she has been teaching him. Lalo confuses Maimuna with Laila, a Moroccan woman who was his caregiver during his childhood. He continually seeks illegal immigrant women with a lazy eye, like Laila, gives them a tattoo identical to hers, and then, attempts to recreate his past experiences with her in his basement. This experience and the repetition of it evince the asymmetrical relations between Spain and Morocco throughout the 20th century. As the mob boss el Americano and Lalo suggest, Maghrebian women are their property and can be used for a plethora of unsavory purposes with little or no consequences.

Unlike her predecessors, Maimuna manages to murder her kidnapper and flees his home. Her freedom is brief, and she is deported and must return to Morocco. Despite all that has transpired, she remains determined to reunite with her lover in Spain. She plans to return to Spain with her friend Yasmina, a former prostitute. The two do not have the money to return. Maimuna cannot find work, and she refuses to sell herself. She affirms that she would prefer to die. Yasmina, who has a debilitating sickness and has given up prostitution returns to the business to earn the money they need to pay for their trip. The novel ends with the women undertaking a final trip via a *patera* toward Spain. The boat is thrashed by waves, and Yasmina, severely weakened and feeble, cannot hold on and goes overboard. Maimuna demands that the pilot search for Yasmina. He refuses, but she insists. He takes a sharp turn and Maimuna, who is too distracted to have a firm hold on the *patera* also falls out of the boat.

The suffering the Moroccan characters experience in *Ramito de hierbabuena* organizes and structures the novel. Habib's despair upon seeing Maimuna's dead body, Maimuna's dying mother's courageous journey to ask for forgiveness after she has wronged

her, Maimuna's multiple assaults, and Yasmina's sacrifices to earn money for the voyage to Spain exemplify incredible suffering and trauma.

It is necessary to question the deployment and the effect of these images of suffering and violence in a text like *Ramito de hierbabuena* that aims to create empathy. For Brent Staples, the modern era assumes that images of suffering stimulate sensitivity to that suffering, yet such images tend to "normalize" atrocity, transforming representations of these events into a form of brutality in themselves (in Dean 88). While the suffering human body symbolizes the violation of human dignity, showing this body does not always lead to bearing witness, but to emotional distance (Dean 90, 93). Images of suffering like the one featured on the front of the novel aim to reveal the immigrant's plight to the Spanish public. Yet, Dean questions if in the highly visual culture in which we live, where knowledge is often attained visually, if suffering even has a clear referent (95). Whereas the immigrants suffered from an invisibility in the late 20th century, the circulation of images that document the atrocities of immigration in the mass media has the potential to foment a new form of invisibility in which the public no longer notices the continual atrocities. This extends into the ethical relationship the images can possibly create; those who grow accustomed to viewing horrific photos may experience what Barbie Zelizer terms "moral habituation" (in Dean 95). In this scenario, since the public no longer notices, they do not feel compelled to act.

In *Ramito de hierbabuena*, the sensationalism of the violence and suffering generates an analogous form of distance. By the end of the novel, the reader grows accustomed to horrifying forms of graphic suffering and violence such as castration, rape, do-it-yourself abortion, assault, etc. Muñoz Lorente's election to *focus* on these scenes allows them to

dominate the text, allowing the specter of violence to become a leitmotif in the novel rather than a few disparate incidents. Indeed, coupled with the photo on the front cover, she may view this as typifying the immigrant experience.

Like other testimonial-style narratives, *Ramito de hierbabuena* attempts to change the reader's worldview and hence, may encounter resistance on the part of the reader in the form of what Nance considers "psychological defense" (572). *Ramito de hierbabuena* may bring the "reality" of immigration far too close to the reader, who may grow disgusted with the immigrant experience and the overwhelming, boundless violence that characterizes it. As Sara Ahmed observes, "disgust is clearly dependent on contact," on having that which is disgusting being brought too close (*Cultural* 89). The immigrant is further stereotyped, now under the auspices of horror and disgust. This further marginalizes the immigrant, demonstrating her Otherness in a new light and making possible a wider and sharper distinction between self and Other that the novel purportedly unhinges.

Strait Tragedy

The photographs of the dead who attempt to come to Spain via *patera*, evince the desperation and suffering often deemed intrinsic to immigrant experience. As a result, suffering and tragedy can become fundamental dimensions of the transnational narrative. This suffering is substantiated by real accounts of immigrant tragedies, such as press photographs, testimonies, etc. This makes the tragedy around which the transnational narrative is articulated, as in *Ramito de hierbabuena*, for example, seem unmediated; indeed, in this novel, as stated, the protagonists' suffering is self-evident and obvious in the beaten, battered, disrobed body impressed on the front cover.

The immigrant is grounded as a victim, a victim of globalization and of an exploitative system in which they have no agency. Like tragic heroes, their fates are often represented as inevitable, despite the protagonist's best efforts. While the reader or viewer ought to identify with the protagonist, this character is more pathetic than tragic, making this process difficult. The lofty, noble stature of the "great men" of ancient tragedy is significantly altered in these narratives, which feature the marginalized and oppressed in incredibly sad and desperate situations.

The visual image of the *patera* and the journey in it are the point of departure for the immigrant's tragedy. In her analysis of "El séptimo viaje" by José María Marino, Tabea Linhard describes the shipwreck as "the starting point, which unleashes the postcolonial specters" (404). The shipwreck represents the losses that result from migratory experiences, losses that cannot be overcome or assimilated and hence, it embodies melancholia (Linhard 416-7). For Linhard, melancholia is the underlying structure of representations of post-national Spain and migration, in constructing the lost immigrants specifically as that which cannot be overcome or assimilated (401). Or, as Ranjanna Khanna describes it, this textual melancholia is "unknown, inassimilable, interruptive, and present" (in Linhard 403). The *patera* and the shipwreck connect the current issue of immigration to Spain's historic imagining of the Other, often articulated in Spain's unique form of Orientalism or in the nation's relation to its former colonies. The dangerous journey in the *patera* and the shipwreck are dominant tropes in transnational narratives. Two of the earliest and most significant films on the question of migration, Montxo Armendáriz's film *Las cartas de Alou* (1990) and Imanol Uribe's film *Bwana* (1996) not only feature *pateras* and shipwrecks, but also demonstrate their significance as structuring elements of transnational narratives.

The shipwreck comes to symbolize the desperation and suffering of the immigrant and the inassimilability of this loss. In *Bwana*, Antonio, a Spanish taxi driver vacationing at the beach with his family, stumbles upon Ombasi, an illegal immigrant who has arrived via *patera*. Ombasi's companion, Yambo, another sub-Saharan male, has not survived the journey. Ombasi speaks no Castilian, and hence the communication between the immigrant and the family is minimal. The taxi driver's son asks the immigrant to refer to him as "Bwana," after the whites in the *Tarzan* films, while the family most often refers to him as "el negro," allowing the audience to forget the detail of his name, which is deemphasized. Colonial echoes inform this encounter, in which the Spaniards initially fear the strange, powerful foreigner, and, then, name and appropriate him within a context with which they are familiar. They define the African man while simultaneously eschewing calling him by name.

The symbol of the shipwreck illuminates both Ombasi's presence on the secluded beach and his trajectory in Spain. Most obviously, he has arrived following a shipwreck that resulted in Yambo's death. Hence, his initial moments in Spain are marked by grieving the loss of his traveling companion. The immigrant's encounter with the Spanish family largely occurs via stereotype and the Spanish family's interpretation of Ombasi and his circumstances. Antonio's wife, Dori, fantasizes about Ombasi seducing her. She invites him to swim with her at the beach and Antonio discovers the two swimming, naked. The stereotype, which has thus far facilitated a comfortable and superficial interaction with Ombasi leads to a second level of interaction, one that is ostensibly violent; seeing the pair in the water together, Antonio speaks threateningly (and inaudibly) to his wife, while glaring at

Ombasi. Both modes of interaction center on the subject-position of Antonio and the objectification of Ombasi.

The level of violence intensifies when a group of skinheads who have terrorized Antonio's family in earlier scenes catch Ombasi swimming with Dori. Both the family and the immigrant are forced to flee for their safety. Antonio and his family barely make it into their car as Ombasi runs behind them, his hand outstretched. Antonio informs him that he cannot help him with this situation, and drives off, leaving Ombasi with the skinheads who plan to castrate and murder him. Thus, the shipwreck, which inaugurated Ombasi's entry into Spain seems to continue in new forms during his brief stay in the nation. That is, once Ombasi has left the rough sea and the dilapidated *patera*, the tragedies that ensue can be seen as a series of shipwrecks. These include the encounter with Antonio's family, which had the potential to end somewhat violently and the confrontation with the skinheads, a determinative metaphor which seems to guarantee both torture and death.

Las cartas de Alou also employs several of the tropes discussed in this chapter to represent the immigrant experience. Through the title character's letters, the director maintains a documentary tone that aims to convey impartiality (Ballesteros "Screening" 52). The title of the film, *Las cartas de Alou*, also suggests that the African immigrant is the focus versus the "Bwana" or "white people" of Uribe's film. Despite the distinct loci of enunciation in these films, they share in the primacy of the *patera* and of the shipwreck to the narrative. Alou's first voyage to Spain in the *patera* is shot with a handheld camera in the small raft, placing the viewer in the position of a person traveling alongside Alou in the dangerous crossing (Ballesteros "Screening" 52). Upon his arrival in Spain, Alou travels seasonally, working in agriculture. Ballesteros states that Alou's journeys through Spain

show the "immigrant's nomadism and lack of stability" ("Screening" 52). Yet this dimension of the immigrant's experience has already been suggested in the horrific journey via *patera*. This is one initial dimension of the immigrant's suffering that the texts aim to imprint in the viewer's mind, thereby allowing the Other elements of the tragedy considered essential to the immigrant's experience to unfurl.

Even when the immigrant survives the trip via *patera*, a litany of other events occur that indicate the symbolic shipwreck even if one has not really occurred. In *Las Cartas de Alou*, Moncef accompanies the title character on his voyage around Spain after nearly dying in the craft; his life is similarly unstable and uncertain. When Alou learns that they live in a dark, exposed site similar to a cave dwelling, Moncef assures him that such a home is apt for immigrant life. He says, "Esto es nuestro sitio. Nosotros olemos mal. Vestimos sucio. Y vivimos como animales. Y aquí, mal olor y sucio. Entonces, es nuestro sitio. Venga." [This is our place. We smell bad. Our clothes our dirty. And we live like animals. And here, foul odor and dirt.] In Carlos Molinero's film *Salvajes* (2001), while the viewer does not see the *patera* in which the immigrant protagonists arrived, she can deduce the precarity that marks their life in Spain. Indeed, the film begins with a group of skinheads attacking an African migrant, a scene that conveys the danger in which many of the immigrant characters in the film exist. This shipwreck's symbolism in transnational narratives takes on a new direction in more realistic texts in which there is a disjuncture in the collective fantasy about immigrant experience and the representation of "real" events. The shipwreck as a metaphor for immigrants in Spain symbolizes the desperation and difficulty that mark their voyages and experiences in the destination.

En la puta vida (dir. Beatriz Flores Silva 2001) is based on a true story and hence, espouses the testimonial-style claims detailed above. While *En la puta vida* does address Spanish immigration, it is a co-production realized between Uruguay, Argentina, Cuba, and Spain, and the director, Beatriz Flores Silva, is a Uruguayan. *En la puta vida* recounts and denounces the trafficking of women from Uruguay to Europe. The film's central protagonist is Elisa, a single mother from Montevideo. Elisa is a prostitute, but dreams of opening up her own beauty salon with her friend Lulú. While working at the brothel, she meets Plácido, who claims to be a businessman, and she quickly falls in love. She leaves her two sons behind in Montevideo to travel to Barcelona, where Plácido tells her that there is much more business and she can earn more money selling herself. Plácido describes Barcelona in these alluring terms for Elisa: "mucho dinero, muchas cosas, gente importante, *Europa*" [lots of money, lots of things, important people, *Europe*] (my emphasis). When Elisa steps off the plane, she is wearing a bright pink, glittering outfit she deems appropriate for her new, fabulous life in a wealthy nation. She is visibly excited about the potential Spain holds for her professional and personal lives, both of which are increasingly dominated by Plácido. Upon her arrival in Barcelona, Elisa is detained by customs officials who suspect that she is involved in illegal activities. She informs her interrogators that she has arrived with her husband, and they are staying at the Ritz. This statement surmises her hopes for her relationship and her new, glamorous life in Spain. While there is no *patera* in this film, Elisa experiences a series of devastating turns upon arriving in Spain that find their equivalence in the symbolism of the shipwreck.

Still in her flashy outfit and brimming with optimism, Elisa experiences the first disappointment: she is not staying in a luxury hotel, but in a building effectively in ruins. In

addition, she and Lulú are separated and will have very little interaction. She experiences unpleasant surprises in her professional life that resemble these initial disappointments in her home. Plácido informs her she will work on the street, again, far away from Lulú, and that she is to defend her post against rival streetwalkers. Elisa suddenly finds herself in far more strange and dangerous employment than in Uruguay, without the comfort of her friends or her partner.

Following a dispute between Elisa and a Brazilian sex worker, Plácido murders one of her Brazilian competitors. Faced with shocking violence, Elisa goes to a *locutorio* to talk to her children, who are not available. Overwhelmed with sadness, she roams the streets of Barcelona, during the daytime, still scantily clad in her night clothes for streetwalking. Her body is notably out of its proper context; Elisa wears inappropriate clothing for the daytime, symbolizing her incapacity to navigate life in Spain and to find a context fitting for her existence.

Following this incident, Elisa gives information to the police in exchange for Plácido's release; learning of her collaboration with the officers, he begins to distrust her. Her once fun and adventurous boyfriend becomes physically and mentally abusive. Elisa, who had once hoped to marry Plácido, now realizes that her dreams are mere delusions. Elisa's suffering reaches a climax when she calls her sons in Uruguay and the woman with whom Plácido has left them informs her that he has not sent any money for them and as a result, they have been placed in an orphanage. This final offense leads Elisa to cooperate with the Spanish police to infiltrate Plácido's organized crime ring.

The purported veracity of *En la puta vida* is of most interest. In the film, Barcelona supplants Milan, where the real events took place, and Elisa's father is replaced by the figure

of a kind and handsome Spanish policeman, Marcelo, who assists her in returning to Uruguay, locating her children, and ensuring that Plácido is jailed for his crimes. Coproduction agreements in Spain encouraged these alterations to the real story, found in the book *El huevo de la serpiente*. These facts link both the realistic and the tragic tropes found in some contemporary narratives of immigration to Spain. Alleging that the film is based on a true story generates a certain perception of immigration to Spain typified in the characters of the wanton prostitute and the dangerous gangster. Jaume Martí-Olivella remarks on the fundamentality of the space of Barcelona in *En la puta vida*. This re-presentation of a Barcelona replete with Latin American prostitutes and other dubious characters constitute "an imagining of transatlantic national reconstitution" (Martí-Olivella "Touristic" 73). One scene in which a Brazilian sex worker and a Uruguayan one argue over a client illuminates this point. They debate which side of the street the man was on and what type of prostitute he desired. Each prostitute claims the client as her own, that he was on her territory. They debate whether he was in fact in "Uruguay" or "Brazil," making plain the street geography and its national borders while the man ends the dispute with the affirmation, "Pero estamos en Catalunya." [But we're in Catalonia.] This idea of Catalonia and its capitol Barcelona, first articulated by Plácido in the Montevideo brothel as he praises the city's money and importance and establishes it as Europe remains clear in the ample footage of the cityscape and its key landmarks in the film. In "The People in Parentheses," Elisabeth Mahoney defines the postmodern city as a site of difference, fragmentation, conflict, and plurality (168). Panoramic views of the city provide what appears to be an omniscient view of the metropolis. These scenes attach the viewer to Barcelona through these cityscapes, yet the viewer is paradoxically detached from particular areas and elements of the city, occupied by

these unsavory characters. Key to this imagining indeed is fantasy, based on stereotypes or collective notions about immigrants and the criminal lives they are feared to live. In addition to the deployment of stereotypes, like other texts in this analysis, *En la puta vida* also creates distance through sensationalism in which the immigrant and her suffering are transformed into a spectacle.

Elisa's pain and anguish are conveyed and exaggerated at multiple moments in the film. The fact that Elisa is a mother heightens the dimension of suffering in the film. Although she is excited about her life in Spain, she is visibly sad when she must leave her children behind in Montevideo. The scenes in the *locutorio,* in which she briefly speaks with her children, are bittersweet as these conversations remind her of the distance between her and her sons. When she cannot speak with them, she is dejected, resulting in the rather exaggerated show of suffering described earlier. Elisa's body, her incredible clothing, her wandering, and her breakdown connect to transform both the protagonist and her suffering into a spectacle. In another scene, a pimp hits one of his prostitutes, who, then, refuses to work. The pimp complains to Plácido, "No quiere hablar con ningún hombre," [She doesn't want to speak with any man] so he attempts to resolve the matter by bringing Elisa and Lulú to console her. Elisa encourages the woman to continue working, to make the sacrifice for her children. The woman replies she has none, but Elisa finds this detail insignificant, claiming, "No importa, vas a tener." [That doesn't matter. You will have them.] In this rather humorous exchange, the suffering and abuse the immigrant women face are not only transformed into a spectacle, but also, comic relief, firmly situating it within the realm of entertainment. This phenomenon is made possible by the incredibility of the immigrant suffering, which, as stated before has the potential to create greater distance between the

viewer and the immigrant Other and to perpetuate this subject's marginalization. The shipwreck as symbol, hence, accurately surmises the immigrant experience in several transnational narratives. This fundamental precarity, exemplified in the rickety *patera*, coupled with an inability to navigate life in Spain, delineate the immigrant experience and ground it as marked by Otherness.

Reality and Ethics

It is possible critics like me affix too much responsibility to these texts, but the authors themselves assume a great deal of responsibility in the selection of both form and content that seemingly promote and foster a particular ethical relationship to the immigrant Other. In fact, the testimonial style narratives often have political or ethical aims, calling on the reader to bear witness to that which is often made invisible in hegemonic discourse. Through sentimentalizing and sensationalizing the immigrant experience, however, these texts, in their content, undermine their political potential. Several of the texts that maintain their authenticity and veracity also reveal larger issues, specifically those of fantasy, profoundly at work. The desire to represent the immigrant "as is" often leads to the perpetuation of collective fantasies about the life of the Other. An immigrant character or stereotype emerges, maintained by the text's claim to authenticity, although this authenticity is possibly distorted. Adorno indicates the danger of the stereotype lies in the public's growing accustomed to preconceived ideas despite their own experience (229). He states that the more un-understandable the world becomes, the more inclined people are to cling desperately to clichés and stereotypes (229-30). Thus, both in the content and in the form,

these texts can generate potentially damaging representations of immigrants, despite the best intentions.

The opposition to fantasy or fiction paradoxically makes it more obvious. In texts like *Ramito de hierbabuena*, which features an abundance of violence, or *En la puta vida*, which trivializes violence, apparent fantasies of the immigrant, rooted in stereotype, emerge. Hardt & Negri describe an emergence of networks of representation of one kind or another that work together, in terms of pluralities, to construct on-going portraits of identity in the making (in Nair "Autography" 186). Immigrant identity emerges from these documentary narratives or even works of pure fiction and inform how the collective imagines the immigrant Other. Adorno jokes that most ancient Greeks, after seeing Sophocles's *Oedipus* did not expect to witness similar events on the streets of Athens (228-9). The distance between the public and the tragedy was infinite. This is not the case in pseudo-realist texts that aim to bring their audience closer to the Other, only to have this audience draw away in horror or disgust. In addition, immigrants sometimes do live in the horrific conditions narrated in these texts; yet, this portrayal comes to be *the* portrayal, instead of one type. Adorno continues to discuss pseudo-realism and its effect on the viewing public. He says: "Actually, pseudo realism allows for the direct and extremely primitive identifications achieved by popular culture; and it presents a facade of trivial buildings, rooms, dresses, and faces as though they were the promise of something thrilling and exciting taking place at any moment." (229)

There is a false proximity, reflected in the sociality in which one brushes against the surface of the immigrant, as Chow describes. Both testimony and photography enact this brushing. In describing the distance between the photographer and the photographed, Nair posits:

> Although the professional photographer seeks to portray social realities, he or she does so only through the gap that shields him or her from the realities of the subjects. This infuses the representation with a degree of irony that is at work in the heart of professional photography. Therefore, any realist depiction of social realities comes to us via the photographer's decidedly privileged lens ("Autography" 184).

The spectator, like the photographer, enjoys this distance, which s/he can negate through a false proximity engendered in the closeness of the skin of the photograph, or its superficies.

The truth claims intrinsic to *testimonio* and documentary-style narratives, in blurring the distinction between truth and fiction, allows a host of fantasies based on collective notions of the Other to enter the text surreptitiously. This undercuts the ethical relationship of the privileged reader to the oppressed Other by allowing "empathy" from afar, which ends up as a barrier to real political action to remedy the marginalization and oppression of the Other. The ambiguous representation of the immigrant reveals a more subtle dimension of empathy with those who have experienced trauma. Dean affirms that empathy is a disguised form of hegemony, rooted in recognition of an emotion in a paradigm that shares the limitations of sentimental identification described earlier. In an analogous argument, Dominick LaCapra states that an empathy that, "resists full identification with, and appropriation of, the experience of the Other would depend both on one's own potential for traumatization ... and on one's recognition that another's loss is not identical to one's own loss" (79). The content and form of transnational narratives, as described above, depict the immigrant and their trauma as the obverse of the self. The ambiguous representation of the immigrant as a close yet disgusting individual who ought to be held at a distance forecloses the possibility of

empathy as the viewer or reader cannot identify with this incredible protagonist. The false reality of these transnational narratives further ensures this ambiguous representation. The dichotomy between the real immigrant and the "realistic" immigrant portrayed in literature and film adds to the ambiguous and contingent nature of identity for the self grappling with both their own identity and that of the Other.

Notes

[1] For more examples of *testimonio*, refer to John Beverley's *Subalternity and Representation* and *Testimonio: On the Politics of Truth*.

[2] Endnote about language they speak in Princesa de Africa.

[3] This essay was originally published in the volume *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture*, published in 1988. Spivak's *Critique of Postcolonial Reason*, published in 1998 actualizes several of her original arguments.

[4] The African women's self-reporting is also mediated. They speak in *wolof*, the native language of the *Wolof* people in Senegal, and subtitles in Spanish transmit what they say to an audience that is most likely unfamiliar with this language.

[5] The increasing demand for domestic work has made it the main source of employment and way of entry for Latin American immigrant women, as Spanish legislation in the 1990s, through the policies of annual quotas, privileged the admission and regularization of female immigrants who worked in this sector (Parella Rubio 165-68, Oso Casas 457-60)

[6] *Ramito de Hierbabuena* is not entirely fictional; during the writing process, Muñoz Lorente completed extensive research in Spain, Spain's territories in Morocco, and Morocco in order to gain a deeper understanding of immigration trends between these two nations. The novel's epigraph observes, "It was my intention to conserve here the names of those whose testimonies have helped me to write this novel. Nevertheless, the Moroccans and the majority of Spaniards, both Muslim Spaniards [in Ceuta and Melilla] and those of the Peninsula, involved in the project convinced me not to do so because of possible repercussions" (10).

[7] In "The Moor in the Text," Israel Burshatin explains the various roles ascribed to Moors in medieval and Golden Age Spanish literature. Remarking on the "power of representations" at the onset of his analysis, Burshatin details how the representation of Moors in literature mirrored their social displacement, which culminates with banishment in 1609.

[8] On the cover of *Ramito de hierbabuena*, underneath the photograph described, the author establishes his text as "Una novela que nos trae más cerca a la realidad de la inmigración."

CHAPTER 3: Nation and Sexualization

This chapter analyzes depictions of prostitutes in Eduardo López Bago's fin-de-siècle texts *La Prostituta* [*The Prostitute*] (1884) and *La Pálida* [*The Pale Woman*] (1884) and in contemporary transnational narratives. López Bago's novels serve as foundational texts for comprehending the character of the prostitute in contemporary Spanish narrative and how the prostitute is often linked to questions of national identity. In recent cultural productions, the prostitute character has re-emerged with new particularities. This re-emergence serves to render mimetically the rapid shift in Spanish sociality; that is, 90% of prostitutes in Spain today are foreign immigrants. Contemporary transnational narratives increasingly engage the figure of the prostitute; examples I analyze include Lourdes Ortiz's short story "La Piel de Marcelinda" ["Marcelinda's Skin"] (1998), Laila Lalami's *Esperanza y otros sueños* [*Hope and Other Dangerous Pursuits*] (2005), Carlos Dorrega's short story "From Lagos to Lago," and the film *Princesas* (dir. Fernando León de Aranoa 2005). These texts employ nineteenth century tropes found in the work of López Bago. For example, they mark the prosittue's body as a site of corruption; following this paradigm, the ideal of the nation is figured as a pure social body threatened by the insidious, pervasive, and now *foreign* prostitute. Paradoxically, they also focus on the prostitute's victimization to present the Spanish audience with the harsh reality of immigration, a concern that is circulated in several immigrant narratives, as shown in the previous chapter. I explain this shift in the prostitute's characterization in relation to neocolonial paradigms that structure depictions of the nation in light of the histories and politics of racial sexual difference.

Prostitutes and the Concept of the Nation

David Nirenberg shows that in medieval Spain, anxieties about prostitution and social borders abounded; he notes that these boundaries constituted "the site at which dishonor threatened the Christian community" (1075). As in more recent times, community identity coheres around a sexualized citizenry who ought to behave in a particular manner and be protected from sexual practices that are considered poisonous to this community. Pura Fernández observes that nineteenth century medical-moral discourse regarding prostitution often united the social body across class boundaries by referring to the nation as a family unit, while invariably excluding the prostitute from this unit (*Lupanaria* 21). For example, in *Higiene de matrimonio, o Libro de casados* [*Matrimonial Hygiene, or the Book for Married Couples*] published in 1853, Dr. Pedro Felipe Monlau asserts that the homeland is one vast family (qtd. in Fernández *Lupanaria* 21). The role of women in this and in similar essays on collective health, such as *Elementos de higiene privada* [*Elements of Private Hygiene*] (1846) and the complementary *Elementos de higiene pública* [*Elementes of Public Hygiene*] (1847) is rooted in their function as a wives and mothers (Fernández *Lupanaria* 9). In *Elementos de higiene público*, Monlau extols the benefits of marriage, "A los ojos de la fisiología y de la higiene, el matrimonio es algo más que un contrato puramente civil, como creen los protestantes; es el ejercicio natural y legítimo de afeccionividad y del erotismo, autorizado por la sociedad y santificado por la religión" [For the fields of physiology and hygiene, matrimony is more than a purely civil contract, as the Protestants believe; it is the natural and legitimate exercise of affection and eroticism, as authorized by society and consecrated by religion.] (617). He uses similar arguments to condemn divorce as anti-hygienic and to affirm that the libertines and their depraved lifestyle are in fact a social illness (622, 642).

Marriage for Monlau is the "preservativo… y correctivo" [prophylactic and deterrent] against base passions that can ruin one's health and result in mental breakdowns, criminality, and even suicide (634). Thus, a division is wedged between those who are married and perpetuate the national family in a healthy manner as opposed to the sick and depraved who threaten to undermine the social body's wellness.

Monlau's arguments involve a nascent nationalism that imagines the nation as family. For Frantz Fanon, nationalism is a politics of visibility that implicates men and women in distinct ways (in McClintock 365). Yet, as noted in the first chapter, nationalism also entails engaging what is not entirely visible and fantasies about Others who are not necessarily present, but order, perturb, and complicate national identity. In *Race and the Education of Desire*, Laura Ann Stoler rereads Foucault's *History of Sexuality* to recover "the fact of colonialism," or the centrality of a metropolitan imagination concerned with colonial bodies to the elaboration of the nineteenth century bourgeois sexual order (6). In nationalistic discourse, the domestic sphere assumes the particular role of establishing and sustaining patriarchal dominance over multiple classes of women. In *Imperial Leather,* feminist theorist Anne McClintock explains that in the nineteenth century, middle class women were relegated to the private sphere as wives and mothers through "rituals of domesticity" (35). Those who eschewed this role were marginalized, especially prostitutes who were not only placed on the fringes of society, but also "became increasingly stigmatized as specimens of *racial* regression" (McClintock 42).

McClintock notes that under imperial rule, the colonizers sought to remove the colonized from their "natural," "unreasonable," "savage" state through processes of domestication which brought them into a hierarchical relationship with white men (35).

Discourses analogous to those elaborated on the colonized denigrated prostitutes utilizing biological-racial terms to construct them as dangerously "natural" and savage. I cite McClintock's description of the metropolitan prostitute at length to show the connection between these women and the colonized. She states:

> Prostitutes—as the metropolitan analogue of African promiscuity—were marked as especially atavistic and regressive. Prostitutes visibly transgressed the middle-class boundary between private and public, paid work and unpaid work, and in consequence were figured as "white Negroes" inhabiting anachronistic space, their 'racial' atavism anatomically marked by regressive signs: 'Darwin's ear,' exaggerated posteriors, unruly hair and other sundry 'primitive' stigmata (56).

Prostitutes, who seemed to destabilize social norms and conventions, had to be brought under control through forced domestication and positioning within the national hierarchy, if only as a boundary that delineated the limits of the national body.

Nineteenth century science availed itself of eugenics, which aimed to categorize and create a hierarchy of all living creatures or a Great Chain of Being. European society was the perfect indicator of how far mankind had come in establishing control over himself and the world at large. As George Robb indicates, degeneration represented the dark side of evolutionary progress, whereby the human species could become biologically debilitated and enter a down-ward spiral of disease, insanity, and sterility (589). Sander Gilman states such a loss of control would constitute a leap into "this dark past—a degeneracy into the primitive expression of emotions in the form of either madness or unrestrained sexuality" (230-1).

According to this hierarchy, European prostitutes, who possess a primitive sexual appetite akin to the sex drive projected onto the colonized Africans, are an "atavistic subclass of woman, throwbacks to the [African] Hottentot, if not the chimpanzee" (Gilman 228). Gilman's evolutionary model shows the scientific aspect of degeneracy, and Laura Ann Stoler builds on this idea, linking this scientific paradigm to the nineteenth century colonial imagination.

Citing Daniel Pick's *The Faces of Degenration,* Stoler indicates the discourse of degeneration presupposed "'powerlessness' within a 'seemingly self-possessed imperious discourse'" (32). While the notion of degeneracy is widely circulated in nineteenth century Europe, according to Stoler, these concepts attain wider significance from the colonial perspective and elucidate how colonized populations and uncivilized members of the European community who seemed to veer off bourgeois course enter into this configuration (32). Degeneration in this model is neither explicitly European nor colonial, but a "*mobile* discourse of empire" that helped to configure one's social position (Stoler 32, my emphasis). Pivotal to degeneration is its mobility, encapsulated in the notions of contagion and contact intrinsic to this formulation. This explains why degeneracy is often heavily debated during periods of colonization and imperialism. This also begins to answer why these discourses are reemerging in the twenty-first century when national borders and boundaries between cultures seem to have less significance and various populations come into contact with one another.

In 1836, A.J.B. Parent-Duchatelet published his compiled anthropological study of Paris prostitutes. In it, he effectively defined the prostitute as a source of pollution and equates them with the sewers of Paris (Gilman 222). In his discussion of the physiognomy of

the prostitute, he believes he provides a descriptive presentation of her appearance when, in fact, he merely reduces the prostitute to her most interesting body parts (Gilman 222). This substitution of parts for a whole results in prostitutes being portrayed as marginalized, desirable *objects* instead of integrated, "full-bodied" members of society. Linda Nochlin cites Jakobson to affirm that synecdoche is key to nineteenth century Realism (79). According to Nochlin, several artistic and literary scenes in the nineteenth century reflect this fragmentation; these scenes suggest the joys prosperous men receive from erotic encounters with lower class women (91). She signals the use of fragments in these images to emphasize the sexualized nature of paintings in which countless body parts abound to provide pleasure to male subjects in the artwork (Nochlin 91). In a similar argument, John Duffy posits that the notion of partiality is fundamental in representations of nineteenth century prostitutes (366). For Duffy, the prostitutes' *demi-monde* is a poor imitation of the *grande monde*, fragmented because their world lacks men—husbands and fathers—to provide for them (Duffy 367).

The prostitute's fragmentation, which was central to her portrayal in realist and naturalist fiction and art, was also a key to converting her into a commodity in the nineteenth century brothel. As Sharon Reeves indicates, in Madrid, "the admission of women into houses of prostitution was tantamount to slavery" (90). Once taken into a house, they were essentially the owners' property. They were stripped of their identity; using legal names was prohibited in brothels to separate prostitutes fully from their former lives, and instead, they were known by a nickname (Reeves 90). The prostitute usually received expensive clothing and other fine items, acquired through a debt system that ensured she would be tied to the

bordello for life (Reeves 91). This form of slavery was often the last option for lower class women.

Discourses regarding prostitution in the nineteenth century were also usually articulated in terms of prophylactics or ensuring that the public is safe from her dangerous, poisonous body. Hence, the prostitute's work transforms into a juridical, medical, and moral issue with socio-political ramifications, effectively bringing her seemingly private acts into the public sphere. An 1809 manual that elaborates remedies against syphilis, or "el mal francés" as it was called in Spanish—firmly establishing the foreignness of both the illness and those who bear this affliction—, observes that this personal illness actually has multiform impacts in the public sphere and is thus, a military, political, and artistic ill as well (Fernández *Lupanaria* 10). Fernández surmises that in nineteenth century Spain, the fields of physiology, hygiene, religion, the judicial system, the jail system, psychiatry; the traditional family, revolutionary workers movements, and the bureaucracy of public administration all elaborate discourses and policies with regard to controlling the body, specifically the deviant, threatening body of the "fallen woman" (*Lupanaria* 8). This concept of surveillance and control of bodies, especially those considered "deviant," resonates with Michel Foucault's theories of biopower.

With the term "biopower" Foucault designates multiple mechanisms through which the basic human biological features become the object of political strategies in modern Western societies (Foucault *Sexuality* 124). Biopower is pivotal to the emergence of the modern nation-state; this political ordering of life facilitates the creation of the permissible and the deviant, articulated through categories of health, hygiene, race, and descent (Foucault *Sexuality* 124). In Spain, the *Reglamento sobre la prostitución* or Law of Prostitution in 1858

allowed the authorities to monitor public women owing to preoccupations about public hygiene articulated through scientific certainties. As McClintock states, such regulatory measures were less a way to abolish prostitution than to place control of sex work in the hands of the male state (288). Yet, this policing of the state eventually extends to consciousness; Foucault puts it this way: "There is no need for arms, physical violence, material constraints. Just a gaze. An inspecting gaze, a gaze which each individual under its weight will end by interiorizing to the point that he is his own overseer, each individual thus exercising this surveillance over, and against, himself" (Foucault "Eye" 155). The prostitute interiorizes her alterity, as inculcated in the discourses described above, and acts accordingly, taking the necessary steps to ensure that she is within the state's prescriptions regarding her body.[1]

The issue of prostitution crystallized around larger questions of city administration as European cities grew in size and scope and attracted migrants from rural areas of the nation state and colonials returning home after trips to the nation's far-flung imperial reaches. The city's multitudes also allow for the erasure of class difference in uniting diverse individuals in the urban mass. The nineteenth century great city created a locus of contact among classes, specifically between men from good families and both men and women of lower rungs of society. Madrid, for example, was referred to as "la gran ramera," [the great whore] a term that delineates the depraved, infectious atmosphere of the Spanish metropolis (Fernández *Lupanaria* 39). Anca Vlasopolos observes the need to regulate certain bodies in this milieu, stating "boundaries are drawn more deeply and guarded more scrupulously the more they are in danger of collapse; the nexus of sex, climate, race, class… deviant sexuality and endangered/ing reproduction has been examined and unraveled [sic] again and again"

("Venus" 133). Like the permeable national borders of the late twentieth and twenty-first century, the nineteenth century's divisions between classes and genders were being effaced through the circulation of bodies that were paradoxically free-floating yet regulated in European metropolises.

Prostitution in Eduardo López Bago's Medical-Social Novels

In Spanish narrative, the prostitute symbolizes a discernable threat to the social body deemed pure yet susceptible to corruption. Mirroring French realism's preoccupation with the social, nineteenth century Spanish novels portray the burgeoning metropolises as centers of disease. In this vein, López Bago's four-part series, beginning with *La Prostituta* in 1884, deploys medical discourse to address the pollutional character of the whore, thereby literally denoting the propensity of the *mujer pública* to access and to infect every dimension of the public sphere.

Narratives of prostitution, or lupanar novels, a term which refers to the *lupanar* or bordello in which they take place, appear in serial form in Spanish narrative as early as the 1850s. Yet, this genre gains wider public appeal after the publication of Emile Zola's *Nana* in 1880. *Nana* is a courtesan likened to a golden fly. Nana's degeneracy is linked to her origins in the Paris slums; yet, like a fly, she leaves this space and penetrates every sector of the city. Like Zola, López Bago unites migrant peasants from the agrarian south, slum-dwellers living on the fringes of the metropolis, and the aristocracy in a Madrid where sex, secrecy, and sickness know no class bounds.

In the essay "The Experimental Novel," Zola establishes that truth ought to be the pinnacle of literary creation (in Fernández "Introduction" 32). Zola asserts: "Naturalism is…

the intellectual movement of the century... it consists simply in the application of the experimental method to the study of nature and of man" (44). Intrinsic to the truth Zola describes is the ugliness and obscenity of the expanding urban metropolises of late nineteenth century Europe, which ought to be revealed and explored in the text. This peculiar form of realism privileged the female character, whose environmental force was heightened by the decadent societies in which the novels take place.

Late nineteenth century scientific advancements such as Darwinism and eugenics were fundamental to this new form of literary representation and allowed authors to assess the setting of the great city, and articulate the condition of the urban poor as a symptom of the city's slums (Ledger 70). Central to this assessment was an investigation of the role that heredity plays in individual subject formation in the novel (Ledger 70). For example, Zola's *Nana* is the ninth installment in the Rougon-Macquart series, which traces the development of two families whose offspring, generation after generation, inherit their legacy of degeneracy.[2] Naturalist authors were inclined to create a quasi-photographic, documentary, scientific account of reality that allowed them to expose what often remains hidden and beneath the surface and a thorough analysis of the nature of man (Ledger 70). This realistic form is often employed in characterizing the Other, as previously shown; in this case, the Others to be portrayed with realistic horror are both the lower classes and women.

The situations and characters presented in the naturalist text must present the nineteenth century metropolis as a self-evident atrocity; following this realistic paradigm, like the texts of the previous chapter, these novels employ several mechanisms to assert the text's verisimilitude and authenticity, hoping that the "terrible picture" crafted in the text will transmit its message explicitly (Ledger 72). In his naturalist novels, López Bago creates an

urban panorama in allowing a multiplicity of characters to speak, presenting voices from an array of classes and regions and from both sexes. According to Fernández, López Bago "pastorea" [shepherds] the reader through the text, certifying the reality of the narrated events, often acknowledging that the spaces and characters visited in the novel may seem incredible for the intended reader, who is not accustomed to such scenarios ("Introduction" 68).

López Bago's novel was daring in its very title; Férnandez observes that prior to his novel, no literary work had used the term "prostitute" outright ("Introduction" 13).[3] This primary uncovering facilitates several others throughout the text, in which López Bago makes plain the secretive lives of prostitutes and their clientele. In fact, the novel was censored and marked as immoral, shameful and offensive to the public due to its repugnant subject matter (Fernández "Introduction" 41, 46, 60). Its censorship was also attributable to its form, which, according to authorities, was scandalous in making the distinction between reality and fiction unclear (Fernández "Introduction" 13).

In the appendix of the third novel in the series, *La Buscona*, Eduardo López Bago includes a Spanish translation of Zola's treatise on the experimental novel to defend his particularly scientific form of naturalism, stating: "Ignoraba seguramente el Sr. Zola, cuando escribió lo anteriormente leído, que para mayor demostración de sus asertos publicados en el año de 1881, en España tendría yo que traducir sus opiniones, para que con ellas se defendiera en el año de 1885 un escritor naturalista, contra el cual se han intentado todo género de persecuciones." [Mr. Zola was unaware, when he wrote the above that I would have to translate his ideas, published in 1881, into Spanish in 1885 to defend a naturalist author, highly persecuted for his work.] He supplements his novel with Zola's work as a

means to defend his highly criticized and censored novels and to express the potential magnitude of the medical-social novel as a tool to dissect a piece of life to study its functioning and to better the social organism (Fernández "Introduction" 36-7).

In addition to the naturalism propagated by Zola, López Bago employs the lens of the medical-social gaze. Philliph Hauser, a nineteenth century doctor, documents the intricacies of the Spanish capital in his two-volume study, *Madrid bajo el punto de vista médico social*. He links the question of hygiene to families, architecture, urban policy and planning and hence, the quotidian ventures that project the concept of the nation to the public. Hauser specifically marks spaces that are unhealthy or problematic in terms of hygiene and subjects them to medical-social scrutiny, as does López Bago in his novels that unearth murky details of life in the Spanish metropolis utilizing these scientific methodologies. The medical-social point of view that López Bago deploys is also part and parcel of the aforementioned notion of the nation as a family in proposing the measures necessary to sustain the health and well-being of the social body. In fact, López Bago asserts that the word "novel" does not suffice to define the naturalist literary work, for what he undertakes does not entail fiction or fantasy, but a complex and careful social analysis inspired by the medical field.

The descriptions and rhetorical devices employed in López Bago's tetralogy evince a preoccupation with the nation and with the prostitute as a parasitic threat to this body. Both the prostitute and her clients are portrayed as co-conspirators in the ruin and corruption of society. His novels are fundamental in circulating a host of images and tropes that continually emerge in narratives of prostitution.

La Prostituta tells the story of Estrella Sánchez, a poverty-stricken girl from the outskirts of Madrid who finds escape from a perverse, drunk father in one of the lowest-

paying brothels in the city. López Bago appropriates the biological determinism of naturalism to suggest that Estrella, like her father, will lack moral rectitude. The prostitute's difference and exclusion is elaborated at various levels in the text; this difference resonates with the concept of the national family, a family to which she does not belong.

First, there is the regional difference. Several of the prostitutes in this house are Andalusians, domestic immigrants who seek to better their situation in the large northern city, as opposed to the more agrarian south. Owing to this regional difference, these prostitutes speak a peculiar form of *castellano* from southern Spain. Throughout the novel, they place their regional accent on words like "usted" and use Andalusian colloquialisms. When describing the brothel at night, the narrator emphasizes the primacy of southern Spanish culture in this depraved space. He says, "Lanzaba un poderoso quejido andaluz, al que seguía la copla de malagueñas, de jaleo o seguidillas gitanas, copla cuya letra, siempre obscena, escuchábase en silencio, hasta que con otro quejido terminaba en medio de ¡bravos y olés!" [She emitted a powerful Andalusian cry, followed by a folk song from Malaga, Gypsy cheers and songs, songs whose lyrics, always obscene, were heard in silence, until with another sharp cry, it ended, in the midst of shouts of bravo and olé.] (López Bago *Prostituta* 123).

There is a cultural disjuncture evident in this description; the southern Spanish women sing inappropriate songs, like Gypsies, and offend polite cosmopolitan, northern culture. The narrator continues to describe the damp, dark, vomitous atmosphere of the bordello, laying bare the details of these poor, domestic immigrants' existence. These human beings are reduced to their most basic functions and hence animalized, thereby demonstrating their

primitiveness and naturalness, which positions them on the lowest stratifications of the Great Chain of Being.

In the very first chapter, Fernández notes that the act of prostitution—exemplified in the sites and bodies that produce this act—is represented as a wound afflicting the social body ("Introduction" 71). Like the city's beggars, the brothel "[expone] en medio de la vía pública desnudeces cubiertas de llagas, miembros podridos, que hacen apartar la vista para contener la náusea" [Exposes in the middle of the public avenue nude flesh covered with sores, rotten members, which make one turn one's head to avoid nausea] (López Bago *Prostituta* 119). Later, he states that the prostitutes "se encontraban cubiertas de cicatrices, como las de los inválidos de Trafalgar" [were covered with scars, like the invalids from Trafalgar] (López Bago *Prostituta* 150). The prostitutes are reduced to their bodies, specifically to the scars that suggest their woundedness.

With the allusion to Trafalgar, however, the prostitutes' fragmentation and woundedness takes on a new dimension. Trafalgar was the disastrous 1805 military defeat commonly attributed to Spain's lack of preparation and underestimation of the British naval fleets. Furthermore, *Trafalgar* is the first of the 46 National Episodes published by another literary influence of López Bago's, Benito Pérez Galdós, in 1873. While fighting in this battle, Gabriel Araceli, the soldier-protagonist, learns to refute the great mythology behind "Spanishness," and nationalism in general. In a lifeboat full of Englishmen and Spaniards, Gabriel questions: "¿Para qué son las guerras, Dios mío? ¿Por qué estos hombres no han de ser amigos en todas las ocasiones de la vida, como lo son en las de peligro? Esto que veo, ¿no prueba que todos los hombres son hermanos?" [What are wars for, my God? Why can't these men be friends in all moments of life, as they are in those of danger. What I see now,

doesn't it prove that all men are brothers?] (Pérez Galdós 186-7). He learns to privilege humanity over national allegiances and states that all men should unite as one instead of being divided into countries that venture out to war at sea. *Trafalgar* is preoccupied with the national identity and the corruption of the Spanish nation evinced in a disabling armed conflict that furthers the fantasy of nationalistic separation and the propagation of an invented Spanish national character. López Bago aligns the prostitute characters in the novel with the defeated soldiers of Trafalgar to posit that domestic forms of corruption similarly cripple and degrade the social body.

This scene also demonstrates the fantasy inherent to the idea of national space. The British and Spanish men do not go to war on their own soil, but at sea; and while waters are claimed for certain nations, their ostensible "unmarkability" makes it difficult to consider one part of the sea more Spanish than British. In addition, in the lifeboats, where they are concerned with sheer survival, the most rudimentary aspect of humanity, the gathering elides national difference and prioritizes humanity over fictitious national divisions. This union is akin to the gathering of various classes and types of individuals in the cosmopolitan city. This intermingling is condemned in the nineteenth century metropolis owing to the tendency of illicit affairs and indicates the primacy of women—especially public women, or prostitutes— in this fantasy as corruptors of the public sphere.

Estrella's journey in the novel parallels that of Luis, the son of the marquis of Villaperdida, or "lost village" in literal translation, an allusion to the Spanish *pueblo*, both the town and the people who are lost in their depravity. Estrella's primary motive for seeking refuge in the brothel is hunger. Upon her arrival, the man who manages the brothel, Arístides El Chulo, asks Estrella what she could do for work instead of prostitution. She responds that

she does not know how to do anything. Implicit in this statement is the author's critique of women's ignorance and their being impeded from actively and positively contributing to the nation. This idea of degeneracy, of being incapable of producing anything through work, through intercourse, etc. reappears in the text. It manifests itself in work that is not productive, such as stock market speculation or living off one's title and the work of one's ancestors, and in the characters' destroyed bodies, which are so unhealthy that they should not produce children.

The notion of exteriority to the homeland becomes most acute in the characters of Estrella and Luis, the heir to Villaperdida. When Estrella arrives at the brothel, Luis has recently returned from his studies in France. Luis's education has taught him to value the foreign, such as English horses and the French language. Indeed, he claims to forget his Spanish at times and mangles basic phrases like *por favor*, mixing it with French. Both young protagonists in their linguistic and more extensive characterizations evince the nation's decline: one is too starved and ignorant to think, and the other focuses primarily on frivolities and has forgotten his native language. Estrella and Luis finally meet in the brothel, when the virgin prostitute is auctioned off in a spectacle elaborated by Aristides for Luis and his wealthy friends. The author observes: "Era una diversión nueva, originalísima; una diversión propia de primogénitos de casa grande" [This was a new pastime, very, very original, a diversion fitting for first-born sons of great houses] (López Bago *Prostituta* 273). Luis likens the event to the tales of Boccaccio. Yet, when he realizes that a price is being placed on the body of this young woman, he changes his point of view. "Ahora ya no se acordaba de los cuentos de Boccaccio, sino de los bazares de esclavas en Oriente, de las ceremonias, ventas y contratos del África central entre los negreros y las tríbus salvajes"

[Now he did not think of Boccaccio, but of slave bazaars in the Orient, of the ceremonies, sales, and contracts of central African between slave-traders and savage tribes] (López Bago *Prostituta* 273). Estrella is not only distanced from the upper echelon of the vast Spanish family, but she is also racialized and likened to a slave. This solidifies her entry into the brothel, and her distinction, following Gilman's paradigm, as an atavistic subclass of woman.

Estrella's first client is Luis's father, the powerful marquis of Villaperdida whose public persona is diametrically opposed to his private life. The narrator begins the marquis's characterization in this way: "Siempre lo halló en solemnes y aparatosas ceremonias oficiales: un día en la apertura de Cortes lo vio vestir el severo frac y confundirse entre los senadores del Reino" [He could always be found in solemn and dramatic official ceremonies: once, during the opening session of Parliament, he could be seen wearing an austere dress coat with tails among the kingdom's senators] (López Bago *Prostituta* 160). The marquis meets with Arístidis, El Chulo, suggesting this seemingly upright character engages in rather sordid practices. The marquis seeks out Arístidis to establish several brothels throughout the city owing to the economic crises unleashed by risky market speculation. His plan is to invest in these brothels as the return on his investment is more certain than in other ventures. Yet, the marquis's corruption is not limited to his business acumen and his investment strategies.

Very much like the brothel described at the novel's inception, the marquis de Villaperdida is a living wound. He is gaunt and feverish, and his skin has an unnatural yellowish hue. The narrator contrasts the marquis's sick body with his dignified dress and position, describing the smell emanating from the marquis's body as "el olor infecto" [the infections odor] (López Bago *Prostituta* 162). The illustrious marquis suffers from acute syphilis and is on the brink of death. With the syphilitic marquis's help, Arístidis becomes

the manager of forty brothels. El Chulo's control of the city exhibits the gravity of the illness plaguing the national body. Now, not only do the prostitutes work as slaves to Arístidis, but the city as a whole praises the unsavory character now revered as "casi un dios" [almost a god] (López Bago *Prostituta* 163). The marquis, El Chulo, and now all of Madrid, including the famished virgin are subject to the decadence that is consuming the space of the text and those within it. His ability to permeate every aspect of Madrid life, from the sordid brothels to the upper echelons of society manifests the unhealthy proximity between national characters that will have to be negotiated in Spanish modernity.

The marquis de Villaperdida sleeps with Estrella shortly before he dies, and he infects her with the disease. Enraged by her circumstances, Estrella decides to infect as many men as possible to realize her revenge on mankind. This vengeance is characteristic of this woman, who is disinherited from society and hence, castigates her exploiters in the only way she sees fit, by inflicting the same pain on them impressed on to her, manifest in the form of disease. Her next client is his son, the heir to Villaperdida, although she has no idea they are related. Luis returns home, infected with syphilis, and learns that his father has passed away, and he stands to inherit his fortune. Aristides inherits the brothels from the deceased marquis, becomes an elected official, and promises to protect Estrella; she accepts, and the novel ends with her asking Aristides to take her to the hospital.

These final moments home in on several ideas about the communicability of degenerative practices and the notion of inheritance, which are vital to the conceptualization of the national family. The marquis is the site of origin from which Estrella and Luis contract syphilis; the young pair, thus, inherit the marquis's legacy of sickness and bodily putrefaction. There is an underlying biological component to degeneracy evinced in this act,

which creates equivalence between this act of contamination and the inheritance of other traits from relatives. Indeed, Estrella and Luis now pertain to a particular group owing to the marquis's communication of the disease. In the second part of *La Prostituta, La Pálida*, Luis's doctor advises him not to marry or have children; these things are for "gente sana," that is, the individual families who will contribute to the well-being of the national one (López Bgao *Pálida* 116). The marquis also divides his estate, both his public assets and his more clandestine ones; the riches of Villaperdida go to young Luis while Arístidis receives the brothels and increased power. The social laws that foster the transfer of patriarchal goods from one male to others further exclude the destitute and marginalized Estrella from inheriting anything other than sickness from the marquis.

La Pálida refers to the name Estrella assumes in the first brothel in which she works. As a continuation of *La Prostituta,* this novel extends concerns about the degeneration of individual bodies and the social body due to the vices plaguing the great Spanish metropolis. *La Pálida* begins with the presentation of a well-appointed and luxurious café, *La Botica*. The members of this club are described as "viciosos, [con las] naturalezas gastadas por todos los laceres, llagadas por todas las armas del sensualismo, cuerpos que empezaron andando fuertes y robustos por el cien y luego al hundirse poco a poco continuaban arrastrándose, acostumbrados ya y como complacidos al sentirse envueltos y rodeados de calor y pestilencia" [Depraved, with their bodies worn from lacerations, wounded by all of sensuality's weapons, bodies that began walking fully strong and robust and then, collapsing little by little, continued on dragging themselves, now accustomed and even pleased to feel themselves enveloped and surrounded by heat and pestilence] (Lopéz Bago *Pálida* 7-8).

Again, at the beginning of the novel, a wound is presented; unlike the wound in the first installment, found in a seedy and poor bordello, this one has been placed on the most exclusive members of Madrid society. Arístidis is convening a very special meeting for the members of *La Botica* [The Pharmacy]. Those who belong to the Pharmacy are, as the author suggests through this name, sick and in need of a drug to be cured. Their drug of choice, continued sexual escapades with prostitutes that Arístidis provides, however, implies that their sickness will not be cured. Arístidis is a parliamentary representative, staunchly and ironically aligned with the conservative party and an advocate of order, morality, family, the Spanish nobility, and the Catholic Church.

Estrella is also experiencing prosperity; she is now an affluent courtesan or *buscona* and the muse of *La Botica*. At the novel's inception, Arístidis introduces her to the voracious dukes, counts, marquises, and heads of state that form the club in this way:

> Es hermosa, estúpida y bien formada; no sabe leer ni escribir, conoce el vicio en todas su múltiples manifestaciones, su descaro no tiene igual, se viste con suma elegancia, se desnuda si es preciso a las doce del día y en medio de la Puerta del Sol, ha tenido cartilla, ha sido prostituta, y lo que es más importante para nosotros, ha estado no una, sino tres veces, enferma en el hospital de San Juan de Dios (López Bago *Pálida* 33).
>
> [She was beautiful, stupid, and had a lovely body; she did not know how t oread or write, but she was an expert in vice in all of its multiple formations. Her shamelessness in unrivaled: she dresses with the utmost elegance, and she undresses if necessary at noon in the middle of La Puerta del Sol. She's been documented, she has been a prostitute, and what is most important for us, she has been sick in San Juan de Dios Hospital, not once, not twice, but three times.]

Key to Estrella's qualifications as *La Boticaria* is her degeneration, proven through her numerous hospital visits to cure sexually transmitted infections.

López Bago again links the nation and sexualization, most clearly through the character of Rosita Pérez. Rosita's father, an admirable captain in the Spanish army, fights on the side of the progressives in the Carlist wars, and dies in battle. The narrator states that while the death of Captain Pérez is only one page of the History of Spain, this event is an imperishable page in the history of the Pérez family, whose social and economic situation becomes wholly unbearable following the Captain's death. Presenting Rosita Pérez in this matter is in alignment with Foucault's aforementioned analysis of sexuality and the discourses surrounding it, which facilitate the "formation of a class body with its health, hygiene, descent, and race: the autosexualization of its body, the incarnation of sex in its body" (*Sexuality* 124). The national body is a sexual body, aptly regulated through the practices of hygiene, marriage, and purity described above, practices that Rosita corrupts in selling her body.

The Pérez family prides itself on belonging to Spain's "middle class." Señora Pérez's fervent identification with her putative middle class way of life leads the widow to financial disaster. She spends more than she can afford on a cook, a piano, and university classes for her son to become a lawyer. Each of these small luxuries must be sacrificed eventually, and instead of working, Sra. Pérez looks to Rosita for additional income. The narrator explains the rationale behind this decision as: "Era la hija, era la hermana, pero también era la mujer. Lo explotable" [She was the daughter, the sister, but also the woman. The exploitable one.] (López Bago *Pálida* 96-7). Rosita's plight reflects the contradiction of the middle-class family, which requires what McClintock refers to as a "class doubling of gender" (236). For

McClintock, the middle class family demonstrates the conflictive nature of "female idleness and the actualities of female manual labor, between paid and unpaid domestic work, between the sexuality of the Dresden china 'madonna' and the working-class 'whore'" (236). Rosita teeters on the boundary between housewife and prostitute, a paradox made possible by her middle class values. Again, the fantasy of national space arises, yet the way women are imagined within this fantasy is poignant, specifically, the facile equivalence between the revered and idealized housewife and the reviled whore.

Rosita begins to frequent the *Café del Siglo Nuevo*, literally the "New Century Café," whose name signals the new customs that accompany the new times, in which Rosita's kindness and attention are effectively bartered to allow her family to eat a healthy meal every night. Señora Pérez encourages Rosita's subtle flirtations, while opposing her friendship with Estrella. She explains, "[Estrella] parece muy buena persona, pero no sabemos á [sic] que clase pertenece" [Estrella seems like a nice person, but we don't know the class to which she belongs] (López Bago *Pálida* 125). At this point, Sra. Pérez is fully aware that Estrella is paying their rent as a favor to Rosita, although she feigns ignorance; in addition, she engineers her nightly outings, which besmirch her reputation and solidify her image as the "novia del café" [café girlfriend] who is privately ridiculed by her numerous suitors. Utilizing funds secured through clandestine prostitution to survive and discreetly selling her daughters' charms are two *additional* actions that prove that the Pérez family have descended to a lower class, despite Señora Pérez's repeated affirmations of their middle class existence.

After Rosita becomes intimate with Estrella and her future as a *buscona* seems inevitable, the narrator suggests that her downfall is just as tragic as that of her father the Captain (López Bago *Pálida* 107). The narrator draws another comparison between the fallen

woman and the fallen soldier, alluding to both as national tragedies. Again, the nation is articulated in terms of a family, yet the multiple histories of the individuals who comprise the family are subsumed under the larger umbrella of official History. The reader learns that Captain Pérez was murdered by Rosita's first client, Father Lasoga, a conservative priest who is part of *La Botica*. This heightens the perversity of Rosita's prostitution. Not only is this poor orphan forced to sell herself, but she also must sell herself to a priest who killed her father and hence, brought about her family's ruin. He continues to ruin the Pérez family as Rosita's client and their primary source of income. The entire family in fact has fallen; Captain Pérez is murdered, Rosita and her mother participate in clandestine prostitution, and even Rosita's little brother becomes a favorite in the brothels.

Meanwhile, Estrella begins an individual campaign to bring about Luis's downfall, passing on the only legacy that sociality allows her. She resolves to "enloquecer por completo al joven: prostituirlo y pervertirlo tanto como ella estaba: viciar para siempre la naturaleza de aquel hombre que acababa de salir de la adolescencia" [to drive the young man crazy: to prostitute him and to pervert him as much as she was: to fill this man who had recently exited adolescence and his whole nature with vice] (López Bago *Pálida* 148). Estrella is successful in worsening the already corrupt marquis, much like the other members of *La Botica*; the marquis is eventually unable to control the passion he feels for her and enters into a lovesick delirium. One example of Luis's corruption is his subversion of the code of honor during a comical duel over Estrella between Luis, the marquis of Villaperdida and the Duke of Tres Estrellas, another member of *La Botica*. Their parodic interpretation of gentleman's code signals that these individuals, who ought to serve as pillars of the national family, have sunk to a terrible low, and have brought the nation along with them.

The novel ends when Luis barges in on a sexual adventure between Estrella, Rosita, and the Duke of Tres Estrellas and murders the prostitute in cold blood. This decadent scene of sex and violence is also marked with sickness. Estrella has only recently learned that her syphilis is chronic, and that she is dying from the disease. Her final acts on earth consist of spreading infection.

López Bago's novels present several characteristics that are fundamental to the portrayal of fallen women today, such as extraordinary beauty, poverty, desperation, and, sickness. In addition, it shows the particular form of treatment reserved for women excluded from the vast family of the nation. López Bago surmises this in a passionate passage in *La Pálida* in which the narrator exclaims: "¡El lupanar! ¡[El hospital] San Juan de Dios! ¡El Gobierno civil! Tres sitios en que la mujer es únicamente la hembra, en que se siente excluída de la raza humana, en que se ve tratada con el trato que recibe del hombre la animalidad" [The brothel! San Juan de Dios Hospital! The civil government! Three places where woman is a mere female, where she feels excluded from the human race, where she finds herself receiving treatment men reserve for animals.] (López Bago *Pálida* 46). Non-national women are singled out for incredible treatment and debasement; they are kept alive only for their ability to satisfy domestic needs while concurrently situated on the margins of the national body. This continues in the contemporary context in which authors attempt to represent the experiences of foreign prostitutes in Spain.[4]

The Other as Prostitute

In their portrayals of contemporary prostitution, more recent authors and filmmakers similarly elucidate collective notions about the nation, or the vast family delimited by

national boundaries and regulated by discourses of health and sexuality. Like their nineteenth century counterparts, these authors employ a multiplicity of discourses, including juridical and medical discourse, to show the alterity and exteriority of the prostitute in relation to the society that she serves. The way the prostitute is imagined hearkens back to collective notions of race, degeneration, and the structures of desire in sociality. As Nirenberg reminds us with medieval prostitutes, "the sexualized boundaries inscribed on the bodies of women… could be generalized to heighten cohesion of larger units of society" (1070). Central to this elaboration is the need to imagine the threatening other and to erect a boundary to protect the national family from this threatening body marked by racial and sexual alterity. The depictions of prostitutes in contemporary literature and film call attention to difference and exclusion in a similar fashion as nineteenth century prostitutes who were racialized and marginalized. These representations also extend this idea of difference, reflecting the neocolonial underpinnings of the relationship between Spain and the poorer nations from which these women originate.

In the nineteenth century, as Schiebinger asserts, non-European women were outliers, who like European women, did not fit comfortably into the Great Chain of Being and like black men, did not mesh well with European ideals (in Abrahams 223). Lou Charnon-Deutsch observes that images of colonized women circulating in nineteenth century Spain served not only to fuel a national obsession with the exotic, but also to unite domestic and exotic women in a "complex relation of similarity and difference" ("Exoticism" 252-3). Coco Fusco similarly states that exhibitions of colonial specimens reinforce stereotypes of 'the primitive' but they [also] served to enforce a sense of racial unity as whites among Europeans… who were divided strictly by class and religion" (41). Hence, even before these

non-European women actually arrived in the colonial metropolis, they were utilized symbolically to foment a collective notion of the national self and to structure appropriate gender and sexual roles in the colonizing nation.

Current narratives of migration share tropes with another nineteenth century literary figure: that of the tragic mulatta from American fiction. Both the mulatta and the immigrant connote the elision of a boundary and a transgression of borders established to regulate social conventions. Eve Allegra Raimon views the tragic mulatto as a literary site for writers to attempt to work through questions raised by the unique subject position of the mixed race individual (4). In these works, gender complicates the mulatta protagonists' fates. Both mulattas and immigrants experience vulnerability that arises in a specifically gendered form within their respective iniquitous systems of slavery and globalized capitalism (Raimon 5). Raimon argues that while the male mulatto is characterized by his astuteness within the unjust institution of slavery, the female mulatta is constructed in a manner that explicates her vulnerability through the few possibilities for survival available to her in the destructive slave system (6). Similarly, women immigrants are often depicted in a way that suggests analogous vulnerability and bleak chances to remain and succeed in the destination.

The tragic mulatta evinces a preoccupation with sexuality as this character is known for her unbridled passion, which has the capacity to destroy the white male characters who are enticed by her incredible beauty. As Susan Koshy affirms, the mulatta is erotically volatile and her body is not only the fruit, but also the symbol of forbidden desire (18). Similarly, Lou Charnon-Deutsch argues that in Spain, Gypsy women's racial difference is articulated in sexual difference and her seductive powers, capable of "castrating" men (*Spanish Gypsy* 240). Like the immigrant, the presence of these racially—and consequently,

sexually—different women signals a visible transgression of social boundaries, which only becomes more acute in her characterization as a similarly sexually and socially illegitimate and precarious figure. It follows that their fates are tragic, and, as Susan Martín-Márquez shows, they are called to play self-sacrificing roles that further a narrative of cultural assimilation that supplants the feminine stereotype of victimhood for these racially and sexually different characters.

The tragic mulatta, like the tragic feminine immigrant, is a textual mechanism of mediation. They represent what Balibar considers a "peoplehood in flux" (in Raimon 12). Positioned at the border between two distinct races or two distinct nations and cultures, the exoticized and sexualized tragic mulatta and the tragic feminine immigrant both speak to the limitations and the complications of hybridity.[5] While borders are crossed and divisions are blurred, the underlying foundations of oppression and dominance remain secure. One of the most basic components of this oppression and dominance is gender and the unique forms of gender oppression faced by women, particularly those who are imagined as occupying a liminal position with regard to the national body.

In the short story "La piel de Marcelinda" and in the film *Princesas*, the central protagonists are multiracial feminine immigrants from the Caribbean whose tragic fates are tied to the interlocking systems of racial, sexual, and nationalistic oppression they suffer in Spain. This nexus of oppression is a continuation of the experiences of their nineteenth century ancestors in which imperialism is supplanted by neocolonialism, neo-liberalism, and globalization.

Koshy refers to these processes as sexual naturalization precipitated by discourses of the interracial sexual contract, which promotes relationships with certain minorities while

discouraging others.[6] Culture grounds this naturalization in circulating literature and films that educate desire and direct it toward its appropriate objects (Koshy 17). In these representations, certain groups accrue what Koshy, drawing on the work of Pierre Bourdieu denominates as "sexual capital," or "the aggregate of attributes that index desirability within the field of romantic/marital relationships in a given culture and influences the life chances and opportunities of an individual" (15).[7] This hierarchy of women positions certain women at the top, ideal for marriage and family life, while others possess characteristics, such as ethnicity, national identity, class identity that exclude certain women and demonize their sexuality within nationalistic discourse. Women can accrue sexual capital, as Koshy demonstrates through her analysis the transformation of discourses of Asian sexuality, from threatening in nineteenth century American discourse to the establishment of Asian women as a "model sexual minority" in more recent years (15). I explore this phenomenon in the following chapter where I examine gender and assimilation.

As women with little or no sexual capital in the societies in which they live, immigrant prostitutes serve as antitheses of what national women ought to be and are incapable of being assimilated into the social body. The textual mechanisms that establish and highlight their exteriority are of particular interest as these works bolster popular discourses that monitor and structure collective desires and interpretations of the feminine immigrant.

Sickness and the Social Body in *Princesas*

Fernando León de Aranoa's 2005 film *Princesas* proposes to show the relationship that develops between two prostitutes, despite racial and cultural difference. The themes and

the style of the film, however, undermine the purported message of harmony, and ground the foreign prostitute as a continuation of the nineteenth century figure who threatens the health of the Spanish social body. The two main characters are Caye, a Spanish prostitute, and Zule, a Dominican who continues the tradition of both the public woman in nineteenth century Spanish literature *and* the tragic mulatta woman, evincing characteristics of beauty; pathos; and inevitable, irremediable misfortune. At the end of this film, the Spanish prostitute, Caye, is recuperated not only into her particular family unit, but also the national body while Zule remains wholly inassimilable.

An analysis of the opening and final scenes of the film encapsulates Caye's trajectory from a fallen woman to a capable and modern Spaniard who is dedicated to bettering her life. The first time Caye is presented in the movie, she is in a hospital, which as Estrella's quote in *La Pálida* reminds us is one of the sites in which prostitutes are reduced to their most base parts and are reminded of their exclusion from the social body. As in the nineteenth century *lupanar* novels, in *Princesas*, this site alludes to the sickly state of the Spanish national body, again personified in the figures of the prostitute and her clientele. Caye, however, is not physically sick; she is a birthday gift for an adolescent boy in a cast. The sickly state of the Spanish social body is also palpable in Caye's family. Caye's mother suffers from dementia owing to the death of her husband. She sends herself flowers weekly, claiming that they are from her husband, who has long left her. In the act of selling her body, which results in the continual ringing of her cell phone by her clients, Caye seems to want to be caught in the act and therefore, receive more attention and love from a very frail family unit.

Caye and Zule's initial meeting is angry and tense. Zule unknowingly steals a client from Caye, who has arrived late to her appointment. The client refuses to compensate Caye

for her trip to the café, further infuriating her. She screams at Zule, disrupting the calm atmosphere of the café; she informs the couple that this is not the way to conduct business in Madrid and tells Zule specifically that she is no longer in the jungle and ought to act accordingly. Caye deploys collective notions about black primitiveness articulated in nineteenth century science to insult and to humiliate Zule. Also, as with her home life, Caye attempts to reveal what most others try to hide, that cafes are being used as meeting places for sex workers and their clients, stripping away at the mystery which cloaks the "public woman" and her work. Zule leaves with Caye's client, and the image on the back of her shirt, "Sexy Girl 69" is impressed on Caye. She recalls the same top at her apartment building, looming above her on a clothesline. Later, Caye receives an envelope at her home with the reimbursement for her trip to the café. Despite the hurtful words, Zule opts to take the moral high road and helps her neighbor.

Zule displays a key characteristic in transnational narratives. She is able to imitate norms and customs. Homi Bhabha in the *Location of Culture* elaborates on colonial mimicry, stating:

> The *ambivalence* of mimicry (almost the same, *but not quite*) does not merely 'rupture' the discourse, but becomes transformed into an uncertainty which fixes the colonial subject as a 'partial' presence. By 'partial' I mean both 'incomplete' and 'virtual'… The success of colonial appropriation depends on a proliferation of inappropriate objects that ensure its strategic failure, so that mimicry is at once *resemblance and menace* (89).

Zule's ability to assume a degree of normalcy in Spain, therefore, constitutes clear danger to the distinction between self and other, a pillar of colonial and neocolonial relations, which

inform transnational experiences such as these, in which the formerly colonized are compelled to return to the wealthier nations that once colonized them. Zule's performance demonstrates the flimsiness of Spanish national identity and how anyone can engage in performative acts to sustain or to rupture this imaginary enterprise that is the nation. Zule migrates, destabilizing the notion of the Spanish nation, yet she adheres to its norms and customs, and seems to be assimilable into the social body. Later on in the film, Zule's exteriority will be brought to the fore, thereby re-stabilizing national identity and the concept of the nation and showing that Zule's mimicry, predicated on utilizing her body in a way that augments this exteriority, is partial and incomplete.

Caye and Zule's second meeting is similarly intense, but for different reasons. Caye hears loud music from the Spanish Caribbean while in her apartment; she ventures upstairs, intimating that Zule's apartment is the source. In the background, with careful scrutiny, the viewer perceives a man passing Caye quickly on the stairs; his face is not seen, only the lower portion of his body. The front door is ajar, and Caye enters Zule's apartment; once she turns the television off, she observes a frightening scene. A point of view shot shows broken dishes and silverware strewn across the floor. Caye finds Zule, completely naked, bruised, bloody, and shivering. The man who passed Caye on the stairs was the perpetrator; yet he is not the focus, only Zule's nude and battered body. Zule's existence is marked with the possibility and realization of violence, both in public and in private. Caye, on the other hand, transforms herself from verbal abuser to rescuer and is therefore redeemed in the viewer's eyes. She takes Zule to the hospital,where Zule receives treatment. It is there that the Dominican immigrant speaks her first words in the film, "No tengo papeles," which

heightens the vast differences between the two women and explains the precarious nature of Zule's existence in Spain.

Caye, in contrast, is far more secure than Zule. She solicits clients through advertisements in newspapers and meets them far away from her apartment. Although both engage in sex work, Caye chooses to be a prostitute, and selling herself is solely a source of income that will fund a breast augmentation procedure. Again, following Koshy, large breasts, like Zule's, form part of the matrix of attributes that determine desirability. Caye plans to have the procedure in an attempt to attain sexual capital, capital that would make her desirable as a prostitute, not a spouse (15). Caye again elects to configure herself in this way, as a sexy vixen preferred for fleeting sexual encounters as opposed to marriage and mothering.

Caye also exerts a certain degree of power over her clients, as evinced in the opening scene of the movie: despite being surrounded by men, she retains control of the situation and is never placed in danger. She tells the young men they cannot touch her, and that not even God can go near her purse. The space of the hair salon, which the Spanish prostitutes frequent, contrasts with the parks and plazas that are populated by immigrant prostitutes. Zule, like other immigrants, works in a dreary, exposed, outdoor site adjacent to the salon, where the Spanish sex workers can see all their activities. Indeed, one Spanish prostitute whose business has declined blames the immigrants; seeing them seeking out clients in the plaza, she calls the police to punish them. This demonstrates the disjuncture between the two prostitute groups, attributable to ethnicity and national identity, and the power the Spaniards exert in being able to view and harass the immigrants at will. Unlike Caye, Zule works on the street, brings clients back to her home, and has little control over the sexual exchanges,

evident in the abuse she suffers at the hands of her clients. Like their nineteenth century counterparts, both women are ostensibly excluded from the vast national family, yet it is Zule who is singled out for outright exploitation and abuse at the hands of the society she serves.

Lured by the promise of gaining legal residency papers, Zule meets her attacker who claims to be an officer in a government agency, again in a café; the camera is tightly focused on the couple, leaving the background blurred. The man grabs Zule forcefully, and a discovery shot focuses on a distraught Caye in the background, who uses her authority to frighten the attacker and rescue the Dominican again. After this meeting, Zule argues with Caye, who attempts to dissuade her friend from continuing to place herself in danger.

Following the argument with Caye, Zule meets her attacker in a hotel. He predictably assaults her and abandons her. As he exits, the camera focuses on bloodied white sheets and Zule's naked body, visibly wounded and doubled over on the floor. The abjection of this immigrant character reaches new heights in the scenes immediately following this shot. Zule is physically removed from the hotel and forced on to the street. Bruised, bloody, and hurt, she reflects death. She rides the metro, soiling herself with her own vomit during her trip home. Zule's suffering, brought into the public sphere, provides a visual depiction of the death within the national body, symbolized in the decaying, abused body of the Other surrounded by healthy, cosmopolitan Spaniards on the subway. The immigrant suffering works to confirm their alterity and to remove them from the social body. Moreover, it is the Spanish pseudo-official who causes this corruption to occur through his exploitation of the immigrant woman. This reflects McClintock's assertion that while the marginalized, such as prostitutes, the colonized, slaves, and the insane, are rejected by society, society cannot thrive without them (72). Society needs them to engage in sordid deeds deemed uncharacteristic of

nationals and to fuel the collective imagining of the self as a foil to these Others who mark the limits of their social body. Zule returns to the hospital, and Caye remains at her bedside while she recovers.

After regaining her health, Zule meets a charming young Spaniard and goes on a date. She decides to test herself for HIV before sleeping with him. In her third and final visit to the hospital in the film, Zule learns that she is infected with the virus. She decides that she must return to the Dominican Republic to spend the rest of her life with her family. The hospital as symbol intensifies the rift between the two protagonists. The viewer initially sees Caye in a hospital in a scene that affirms her control over her clients and more generally, the authority she wields over her own life, despite her profession. In *Princesas*, Zule appears more frequently in the hospital than in the park in which she works; this trend is not inconsequential.

Foucault's seminal work on medical perception is useful in analyzing the medical gaze. The medical gaze shapes discourse on science, disease and sickness, technology, political power, and knowledge. This gaze makes possible the construction of the body and the self. As Ann Kaplan observes, medicine and national identity are inextricably linked; the state and the nation are automatically collapsed into one and science, in turn, is identified with both (58). This medical gaze facilitates the political ordering of life encapsulated in Foucault's theories of biopower, with its ability to regulate social life from the interior of the individual. This film guides the viewer's gaze to the feminine immigrant's body as a site that marks difference and trespassing into the national body. The physician, like the author or director who employs this gaze, supposedly has access to some hidden truth literally below the surface. The repeated hospital trips in *Princesas* result in Zule being determined as sick

and finally, as a vessel of death. This diagnosis might have been inferred initially, owing to her illegal status and sexually promiscuous lifestyle, but it is rendered absolute through conclusive scientific knowledge furnished by the nation-state. A similar process occurs in the nineteenth century novels, particularly those of López Bago, which employ the medical-social gaze as a tool to analyze the most nefarious elements of that society and to reveal what existed underneath the prostitute's mask of astonishing beauty and her fine clothes.

Like Estrella in *La prostituta,* one of Zule's final acts in Spain is engaging in vengeful intercourse with her attacker, hopefully to infect him as well. Vengeance against the sex and society that has wronged her again emerges as a trope of prostitution, as in López Bago. Caye, unaware that her friend is dying, gives her the money for the trip back to the Dominican Republic. Ironically, the money she has been saving to transform her own body into one that looks more like Zule's is now converted into the means to send Zule back home.

In the airport, Caye strikes up an unexpected conversation with Spanish police officers, informing them that her friend has left, not because she was deported, but because she desired to do so. This is the last instance in which the Spanish prostitute evinces her authority within the social sphere and her ability to speak and to occupy whatever position she desires. When Caye returns to her home to have dinner with her family, she reveals that Zule was a prostitute and has returned to her home because she could not take life in Spain anymore. Like the doctor, the novelist, or the director, Caye reveals what has been masked, confirming that her earlier revelations were not just mere outbursts, but examples of her power in the movie.

Princesas ends with Caye allowing her mother to answer her phone, signaling an end to her life as a prostitute. This coda involves both women, although Caye is the only one

present in the scene. Caye not only keeps her own body intact, but also the Spanish one by facilitating Zule's return to the Caribbean. In addition to preserving her own body by opting not to alter it with plastic surgery, Caye's family is restored, another symbol of the preservation of the Spanish nation. This preservation occurs literally on the back of Zule, the foreigner who has trespassed and transgressed the law. Despite cultural competence and her moral capacity to adapt to life in Madrid, the suffering that she experiences portrays the fundamental inassimilable nature symptomatic of the other. Caye, who can be seen as symbolizing white womanhood, is reconstructed and restored through this interaction with the Other. As in the nineteenth colonial metropolises, imagining of the colonial Other facilitates sexual regulation; in this case, the neocolonial relationship between the Spanish national and the immigrant lies beneath Caye's restoration. In addition, Zule personifies what must be expelled to attain a healthy, cohesive familial-national unit.

Thus, *Princesas* is a film about looking and finding death and horror in the immigrant body. This body, like the prostitute's body in the nineteenth century lupanar novels, constitutes a threat to the nation and must be analyzed utilizing a medical-social gaze. Frederic Jameson speaks of power paradigms underlying the "right to look" (in Kaplan xvii). Historically, men have looked at women and colonizers have looked at the colonized. Initially, the viewer concentrates on Caye's body, which is highly sexualized and commodified; indeed, at the beginning of the film, she is presented naked in bed and surrounded by money. Nevertheless, the focus inevitably shifts to Zule's body and the havoc continually wreaked on it to convey her inassimilability into the social body. The film bundles the male gaze, the colonial gaze, and the medical gaze into a central gaze on this foreign woman's body. This gaze is predicated on scientific objectivity to expose the horror

and death intrinsic to the Other's body, which threatens the nation-state's cohesion and wholeness.

Ethics and Radical Otherness in "La Piel de Marcelinda" and "From Lagos to Lago"

"La Piel de Marcelinda" is a short story by Lourdes Ortiz that engages contemporary immigration to Spain and prostitution from the perspective of the young criminals who work with the prostitutes on a daily basis. Carlos Dorrega's "From Lagos to Lago" tells the story of a relationship that develops between a Spanish man and a Nigerian prostitute. In both stories, the notion of saving the prostitute from her sad existence emerges, alluding to the precarious, violent lives these women lead in Europe and constructing Spanish men as chivalric saviors. And in both short stories, an ethical approach to the immigrant Other is elaborated, in both instances, fueled by romantic desire.

"La Piel de Marcelinda" begins, "el lote venía de Jamaica o algo así, un sitio exótico y caribeño y daba gloria verlas" [the new batch came from Jamaica or somewhere, some exotic Caribbean country, and it was a pleasure to see them] (Ortiz 26). The women are viewed as merchandise and like Estrella in *La Prostituta* and *La Pálida*, who was objectified and commodified, these Caribbean women are reduced to their most basic parts, bought, and sold. Like the nineteenth century prostitutes in Arístidis's brothel, there is a notable linguistic difference that explains alterity and even presents it as more radical that the Andalusians in *La Prostituta* and *La Pálida*. The narrator comments that the women "hacían bromas en su endiablada lengua," [they told jokes in their wretched language] and when Marcelinda says "thank you," the narrator remarks that "ni siquiera parecía inglés" [it didn't even seem like English] (Ortiz 29, 36). They are beyond the foreign or exotic; they are Othered in a way that

suggests they are incapable of even communicating in any ostensibly Western—that is, civilized—language. Following Koshy's paradigm, they possess little or no sexual capital, the obverse and foil of acceptable feminine sexuality. The narrator describes how some customers insult the prostitutes, which explicates their potential to stir both desire and disgust in their Spanish clients. He states: "Hay muchos que los pone a cien llamarlas negras y decirles que se vayan pa' su tierra, tratarlas como esclavas, que eso forma parte de la cuestión… los atraen y los excitan, precisamente porque, bueno, les da asco y se creen por encima, pero es precisamente lo que buscan, lo que los enciende" [There are many that are driven wild by calling them names and telling them to go back where they came from, to treat them like slaves, this is all part of it… precisely because, well, they disgust them and they think they are above them, but this is exactly what they are looking for, it turns them on] (Ortiz 38). This phenomenon mirrors Fanon's examination of the simultaneous anxiety and desire the Other produces for the colonizer (*Masks* 207). They are exotic and sought-after sexual partners, yet their marginalization and exclusion from the national family stirs disgust in the very men that desire them.

The language the narrator uses to recount the story, replete with regional colloquialisms and slang, reflects his working class background. Like the prostitutes, he, too, is involved in this business he admits is "un poco chungo" [a bit sketchy] but he also admits that, "No es mala vida… ni para ellas, ni para nosotros" [It's not a bad life, neither for them, nor for us] (Ortiz 28). He is the antithesis of the "niños de papá" [spoiled kids] described who buy and sell the women working in the Casa de Campo (Ortiz 42). As in the nineteenth century, the noble and rich find their entertainment in the prostitute's abused body, yet in this

context, part of the entertainment consists of the degradation of the prostitute as an illegal immigrant.

El Chano assists the narrator in guarding the prostitutes for El Goyito and becomes smitten with Marcy, who he names Marcelinda, alluding to her loveliness. He hopes to save the very young, Caribbean girl from her life on the streets. Marcelinda is repeatedly described as fearful, vulnerable while El Chano calms her and protects her. The narrator observes that "la trataba con un respeto como si fuera la virgen o la hermana" [he treated her with respect, as if she were a virgin or his sister] (Ortiz 36). The virgin or the sister are members of the national family from which Marcelinda is excluded both as an illegal immigrant and a prostitute. El Goyito punishes her for Chano's kindnesses; the narrator explains the crime boss's rationale in this way: "el mundo es como es y seguramente en su tierra estaba buscando comida en las basuras… así que agradecida debería estar" [the world is how it is and I'm sure that in her country, she was searching for food in the trash… so she ought to be thankful] (Ortiz 38). Imagining Marcelinda in her nation of origin and the sordid life she must have lead there owing to global inequalities allows him to justify the deplorable conditions in which she finds herself in Madrid. For the narrator, Marcelinda has already been saved in being allowed to sell herself in Europe, removing her from the streets of the underdeveloped world.

"From Lagos to Lago" forms part of an anthology entitled *Inmenso Estrecho.* This collection accentuates the idea of the border, which Ryan Prout indicates entails "the physical barrier between Spain and Morocco… the gulf between Europe and the Americas… the gulf between rich and poor…the hurdles which keep non-nationals from establishing a Spanish identity" (67). Prout also speaks to a "psychological terrain" that compares and contrasts the

present and the past; this terrain contains traces of Fanon's incorporation of difference into one's psyche and also it's deflection onto certain bodies (67).

"From Lagos to Lago" begins in a hospital parking lot, where the immigrant character, P., is having a routine procedure to remove an ovarian cyst. The narrator, her Spanish friend and lover understands her complaints about losing money and the bosses' anger with her due to this situation, but attempts to console her. This initial scene accurately reflects the narrator and P.'s relationship. Like El Chano, he wants to save P. from a life of danger and abuse in prostitution. He admits that in the hospital parking lot, upon seeing P. in such a dismal state wants to cry, he refuses to do it in front of her. He informs the narrator that this unfavorable situation is simply a matter of money. Like several other prostitutes, P. has been sold to a crime ring and must work to end her debt; the criminals threaten her life and the lives of her family members in Lagos if she refuses to work. While money contributes to her objectification and commodification, it is also the vehicle that can bring about her liberation.

The narrator is painfully aware that his story will form part of a corpus of narratives about the sad lives of immigrants in Spain. He admits, "He empezado a escribir sin verdaderas ganas de hacerlo, con la sensación de que estoy narrando una historia triste más, con todos los lugares comunes del género" [I have begun to write without any desire to do so, with the sensation that I am narrating another sad story, with all the places common to this genre] (Dorrega 22). Indeed, his story takes place in the Casa de Campo, the place where Zule, Marcelinda, and Fatén in *Esperanza y otros sueños* all work in the same profession. The *lago* in the title refers to the lake in Casa de Campo.

As in “La piel de Marcelinda,” the specter of violence that aims to degrade and to dehumanize the Other or eliminate the immigrant from sociality is a central component of “From Lagos to Lago.” When asked who the bad people are, P. and her friends quickly respond “la polisía,” from whom they must often hide in their scanty apparel for hours in the cold among the trees in the park to avoid detention, deportation, or even death at their hands. They add that Moroccans, Ecuadorians, and gays are bad people, in addition to José Luis Rodríguez Zapatero for legalizing gay marriage. It is odd that the Nigerian criminal ring that threatens their families, guards them constantly, and forces them to do sex work or starve is not mentioned at all.

Both romances in “La piel de Marcelinda” and “From Lagos to Lago” occur within the debilitating and dangerous systems of illegal immigration and prostitution. The reader imagines their relationships will take a turn for the worse owing to their lack of agency within these systems. The prostitutes experience violent encounters with clients and police officers in the Casa de Campo, the park where the girls work. This specter of violence is nationalistic, realized by citizens who feel licensed to degrade the immigrant prostitutes and by police officers who are authorized to remove them from Spanish sociality through jailing or deportation. One night, a group of rambunctious men attempt to force Marcelinda into their car, while insulting the other prostitutes who offer to accompany her. Again, the ambiguous relation to the Other fueled by disgust and desire emerges in Marcelinda’s assailants vile comments and the attacks they use to abuse the women they attempt to purchase. A struggle ensues, and both El Chano and Marcelinda are stabbed during the fight and die.

In the final scenes of the story, El Chano and Marcelinda are in a deathly embrace, covered in blood. Their embrace is analogous to "una escena de *Romeo y Julieta*" [a scene from *Romeo and Juliet*] and Marcelinda specifically is compared to Mary Magdalene as she comforted the dying Jesus (Ortiz 40-1). Ortiz employs a similar image in "Fátima de los naufragios," another short story in the collection in which the title character, a Moroccan immigrant named Fátima, takes part in a dying embrace with a sub-Saharan immigrant who washes up on the shores of a small Andalusian fishing village. These dying embraces highlight the humanity of the immigrant despite the propensity to view them in other, commodifiable terms.

In "From Lagos to Lago," the narrator saves P., by paying off her debt to the crime ring with the help of his Venezuelan girlfriend. When the Nigerian prostitute expects their romantic relationship to go further because of this kindness, the narrator refuses. He cites the vast cultural gulf that separates them in addition to the fact that he simply is not in love with her as reasons for this rejection. Despite their proximity, both geographical and intimate, engendered in their unpaid sexual encounters, the narrator perceives a separation between himself and P., which he first notices when she critiques gay marriage and Zapatero's policies. Nonetheless, he views her work and her slavery to the crime ring as unjust and works to remedy this aspect of her life.

The juxtaposition of the working class Spanish men and the Caribbean prostitutes is also of interest. This interaction complicates the notion that "the white man is the symbol of capital as the Negro is that of labor. . . . Beyond the black-skinned men of his race it is the battle of the world proletariat that is his song" (Senghor in Fanon *Masks* 101). Unlike the "niños de papá" with money and opportunities, some working class Spaniards might be able

to identify more with the poor and exploited Caribbean prostitutes who work within the few options afforded them in order to survive. As in the nineteenth century, immigration brings the rich, the working class, and the utterly destitute into a Madrid where national boundaries and class distinctions are seemingly blurred. Immigration also becomes a platform on which to consider the labor hierarchy in accord with gender and race crafted through globalized capitalism and creates a space to unify those on the lower stratifications of this hierarchy.

As Koshy asserts, "narratives of interracial desire… [are] influential because of their ability to address social questions precisely by not seeming to" (20-1). Yet, as Berlant reminds us, politics of personal feeling cannot supplant institutional-structural reasons for injustice (in Woodward 71). In these short stories, the authors contemplate the concept of the nation through the failed romances between Spaniards and immigrant prostitutes. In uniting the poor prostitute with the kind Spaniard, the story seems to present a populist narrative of contemporary history, fueled by the phenomenon of immigration. Koshy cites Doris Sommer's extensive work on the national romances of Latin America to posit that national romances "could transform the political abstraction of the nation into a deeply felt affective state" (21). The stories present a novel version of the nation, in which the exploited can unite in love and harmony against those who oppress and marginalize them. Nonetheless, their love is short-lived, demonstrating their embeddedness within a sociality and a context that will not foster their love, rather violence and bloodshed in the case of "La piel de Marcelinda."

Beyond a concern for hybridity or multicultarlism, "La piel de Marcelinda" and "From Lagos to Lago," present an ethical approach to the Other that emerges upon eschewing the ways in which race, gender, and ethnicity are deployed to dehumanize the

prostitutes in these narratives and to transform their bodies, their work, and their humanity into a commodity from which others benefit. Even when their Spanish neighbors attempt to humanize them, death in "La piel de Marcelinda" and a counter-commodification realized through buying P. from the criminals contribute to their respective destruction and objectification.

Prostitution and Subjectivity in *Esperanza y otros sueños*

Laila Lalami was born and raised in Morocco. She left her home to study in London and in the United States and is currently a professor at the University of California, Riverside. Her collection of short stories, *Esperanza y otros sueños* emerges from an article in *Le Monde* online about 15 Moroccans who died attempting to enter Spain illegally in a *patera.* She was intrigued by the story, recognizing that despite their shared nation of origin, these immigrants live lives very different from her own. On her website, she remarks that she never had to struggle in Morocco and after she decided to pursue a doctorate in the United States, she was granted an American visa "within hours." Like Gerardo Muñoz Lorente and Nieves García Benito, upon learning heretofore unknown details about illegal immigration into Spain through pateras, Lalami wanted to explore the phenomenon further in the space of the text. Prior to its release, the collection was lauded by several prominent writers, including Junot Díaz and Whitney Otto. Unlike the other texts in this study, Lalami's books have received wider acclaim outside of Spain and her audience is more international.

In *Esperanza y otros sueños,* Lalami presents the stories of four Moroccans who are united in a dangerous journey via *patera*. One of these characters is Faten, a university student who is on the run from the law owing to her fundamentalist Islamic beliefs and her

anti-establishment plotting with the Student Islamic Organization. Faten becomes a prostitute in Madrid, yet her trajectory is distinct from those described above, and she exerts a notable degree of agency over her life. She deploys this agency to float through subject positions and to use her body as leverage to survive in the unfamiliar context of Europe. Through the character of Faten and others that I do not discuss here, Lalami seems to rethink agency and the modes through which one can resist norms.

Like several other narratives of African immigration, *Esperanza y otros sueños* begins with the *patera*. The man operating the boat ejects the passengers abruptly, refusing to dock on the beach out of fear of the Spanish authorities. Murad, a fellow on the voyage to Europe, saves Faten from drowning. Once they arrive on shore, they are apprehended by the *guardia civil*; in the precinct, Faten must remove her veil. Murad, who has prevented her from drowning at sea, notices her and calls out to her from behind the glass, relieved to see a familiar face. Faten is waiting to be examined by the authorities, and she will somehow be released onto Spanish soil, while Murad awaits deportation. Faten cannot hear him, but when she does finally see him through the barrier, she looks away and moves forward. This separation between Murad and Faten symbolizes her very conscious decision to refigure herself upon her arrival to ameliorate her circumstances as an immigrant to Spain. Unlike Murad, who is not desired by the officers, Faten can leverage her sexuality to her advantage to get what she wants.

Lalami dedicates a chapter titled “El Fanático” to Faten; this section of the novel describes her life in Morocco prior to the journey to Spain. While in Morocco, Faten befriends Noura, a wealthier girl at the university she attends; Faten eventually convinces her to wear the veil and to abide by the laws of the Koran. Noura’s father is appalled at these

transformations. He fumes, "¡Su única hija, vestida como cualquier campesina ignorante! Pero es que ni siquiera las campesinas se vestían así" [His only daughter, dressed like some ignorant peasant. But not even peasant women dressed like that!] (Lalami 43). As Noura begins to follow the Koran more strictly and resents her parents for their lack of devotion, her parents decide to invite Faten to their home to attempt to use their money and influence to convince her to stop indoctrinating their daughter. During this tense dinner, Faten lauds meritocracy and admits that no one gives anything without expecting something in return. She reminds them of the tenets of the Koran and Noura's parents see that the young woman cannot be swayed.

Faten's noble principles first come into question when she is involved in academic dishonesty; an unimpressive student, she has Noura provide the answers for her during a final exam. She is expelled from the university, and Noura appeals to her father to bribe someone or to send Faten to America so that her life will not be ruined; it is not surprising that he refuses this request. He reminds his fundamentalist daughter that breaking the law is anti-Islamic, and she becomes livid, while he is satisfied that Faten will be forced to leave their lives. He ruminates, "Allí estaba la purista, la de la línea dura, la activista anticorrupción." (Lalami 58). Indeed Faten, the cheater, the expelled, the corrupt, has come a long way from her earlier self-righteous proselytizing. This is the first instance in which Faten's moral code stands on rather shaky ground and she prioritizes her advancement—at any cost—over her beliefs.

Faten arrives in Spain in the unfortunate *patera* and is arrested. Removal of her veil in the precinct constitutes a radical change for Faten, who prides herself on wearing the *hijab*, although it is rather unpopular, especially among university students. As Fanon states in

"Algeria Unveiled," the veil was a central site of contention in the colonization of Algeria and continues to be a polemical issue for Western states with Muslim populations (163).[8] The veil, moreover, indicates the status of the Maghrebian woman (Fanon "Unveiled" 163). Hence, Faten's removal of her veil may seem to be an action that places her under the authority of Spanish culture and Spanish men. Yet, it has already been noted that most Moroccan women do not wear the veil, and Faten opts to wear it owing to her fundamentalist beliefs. Removal of her veil, like the other actions she takes in Spain, creates a site of agency in which Faten can manipulate the Spanish officers.

The chapter that describes Faten's life in Spain is titled, "La Odalisca." This refers to the image of the odalisque, widely circulated in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, principally during Spain's colonial campaigns in Morocco and in other European Orientalist texts that evince a burgeoning fascination with the ethnic Others encountered during imperialism. Martín Márquez analyzes Marià Fortuny's painting *Odalisque* (1861), in which a nude woman stretches out on an ornate bed, as a symbol of the colonized nation (*Disorientations* 130). Drawing on Linda Nochlin's work on Orientalist painting, Martín Márquez posits that mastery of this nude female body in the painting reasserts the Spanish conquest of Morocco and confirms their dominance through the establishment of colonial enclaves.

In a similar fashion, Faten's body is unveiled and possessed by Spaniards, not in a paradigm of conquest, but of strategic manipulation on the part of Faten. She sleeps with a police officer in order to gain entry into Spain. Prior to the act, she recalls her imam's words that "los momentos extremos a veces requerían medidas extremas" [desperate times call for desperate measures] (Lalami 151). Following this advice, Faten elects to do things she may

not have considered in Morocco. Crossing the Spanish border for her own safety has altered her approach to life. She does whatever is necessary to remain in Spain, playing into Spanish stereotypes about the Moroccan odalisque and seeming to allow her body to be conquered as a prostitute in Madrid.

Faten's favorite client is Martín, a university student who reminds her of her former life in Morocco. Their relationship, like several others, is rooted in his exoticization of the young When Martín asks her about her upbringing, she playfully admits that she grew up in a "casa mora" with six sisters who instructed her in the art of pleasure (Lalami 152). With this statement, Faten shows cognizance of the stereotypes of women from the Maghreb, which excites and interests her customers. Gayatri Spivak significantly influenced the concept of strategic essentialism, although she currently disavows this term in her most recent book *Other Asias*. Strategic essentialism explores the ways in which gendered, cultural, and political identities can be mobilized as part of a strategic response toward and against patriarchy (Abraham 157). By playing the part of the odalisque, Faten is able to gain recognition from her Spanish neighbors, which is the only way she is able to further her own interests.

Faten discovers a Koran in Martín's glove compartment, among CDs, gas receipts, and condoms; despite storing it among such impure items, he warns her not to touch it, indicating its sacredness. Faten becomes discouraged and sadly recognizes that despite his university education and his intelligence, Martín knows nothing. For him, she functions as a Maghrebian odalisque, subject to his gaze and his fascination with her. Her powerlessness is conveyed utilizing a story from her childhood about silk worms that she raised and cared for, yet died, despite her efforts. In a similar fashion, her hopes for her relationship with Martín,

and the joy she usually experiences when with him, is stolen from her. While she has been playing the role of a "mora" for personal gain, in this situation with Martín, she has lost agency, and his fantasies have extended into the religious aspect of her identity, which she refuses to introduce into her "mora" character.

Faten wields a significant degree of agency, in her ability to shift between the archetypes of the sexualized and exotic Other and the asexual freedom fighter. Neither of these types belong to the nation, which evinces Faten's liminality with regard to the world at large, evident in her domestic situations both in Morocco and in Spain. Faten is able to leverage herself to get ahead in Spain, as she has no other bargaining chips. Even her roommate, Batouel, a wealthier Moroccan from Marrakech, cannot use her status to control Faten. The narrator observes that Batouel would not even speak to someone like Faten in Morocco, much less live with her. And when she berates Faten for being a prostitute in retaliation for cruel words from Faten about her job in domestic child care, Faten merely retorts, "Yo no te obligo a estar aquí… Puedes irte si quieres" [I'm not forcing you to be here… You can go if you like] (Lalami 148). This not only refers to their conversation, but also to their relationship as roommates. Faten is able to survive without anyone's help or kindness. The meritocracy she described to Noura's parents, in which those from the global South serve the North, is the structure that allows her to survive, albeit in the only space that Spanish sociality permits her to occupy.

In her book *Politics of Piety*, cultural anthropologist Saba Mahmood examines the da'wa movement, or the revival of Islam in Egypt, specifically women's participation in the movement. The book interrogates forms of agency that may not resonate with secular-liberal thought or with Western feminism. Faten's situation reflects the overarching point to be

taken away from *Politics of Piety*, "What we learn is that common dichotomous reading of agency as resistance and domination, the ways in which people can pursue a moral self, and the desires that these particular beings have for things other than the vaunted goal of freedom are all 'tears' in the theoretical cloth of feminism and agency" (Farmer 57). Faten engineers her future in Europe, appealing to the collective notions about Moroccan women that cohere around the figure of the odalisque. Inhabiting this role when she must constitute a form of agency and a site from which to attain her goals.

Faten's story deviates from the others analyzed and thus confirms the others' collective power and appeal. Faten does not frequent the hospital, nor is she dying. She is not a wound on the Spanish social body that ought to be cured through removal. While Faten's situation is unfortunate and has the capacity to disgust the reader, the novel does not shock and appall the reader with excessive abuse and violence. Unlike Estrella, Rosita, Marcelinda, and Zule, who all fall victim to the destructive system of prostitution, Faten manifests a great deal of agency over her home and professional life. She serves as a foil to the archetypically sick and degenerative prostitute littering Spanish texts from the nineteenth century to today.

Faten's exceptionality confirms the extent to which women in other narratives of prostitution are fragmented, racialized, and presented as a danger to the social body. The *lupanar* novels and the transnational texts of prostitution today structure sexual desire and delimit the relationships permissible per the collective imagination. The imagination is central to this configuration as sexualized citizens begin to picture what sexual relationships are possible and the sort of people desirable for this relationship. This allows for the creation of a hierarchy of sexualized citizens, with the foreign, or the colonized in earlier contexts, occupying the lowest place. Yet, many of the immigrant women in these transnational

narratives are conscious of how they are being interpreted by their interlocutors. They are able to conform to a script of exoticized sexuality when necessary, availing themselves of the repertoire of ethnically-specific behavior their Spanish interlocutors possess. Through the process of immigration, these women are able to raze borders, yet they are given a limited number of roles in Spanish sociality. Becoming prostitutes owing to little possibilities and pretending to embody notions of alterity impressed on them allows for a continual process of disorienting and reorienting sociality.

[1] In *Black Skin, White Masks,* Frantz Fanon similarly theorizes that the colonized interiorize their inferiority. He states that cultural values that denigrate the black man are internalized, or "epidermalized" into consciousness, creating a fundamental disjuncture between the black man's consciousness and his body. Under these conditions, the black man, like the prostitute, is necessarily alienated from himself (20).

[2] Ledger observes the tension between heredity and environment in *L'Assomoir* in which the condidtion of the urban poor is connected to both heredity and the wretched slum environment in which Nana's family lives (70).

[3] Fernández states that while previous novels had the same subject matter, the titles were much more subtle. Examples include *La desheredada* by Galdós (1881) and *Cleopatra Perez* by José Ortega Munilla (1884).

[4] Helen Graham points out that during the Franco era, the regime propagated "an 'ideal' image of womanhood as 'eternal', passive, pious, purse submissive woman-as-mother for whom self-denial was the only road to real fulfillment" ("Women" 184). This image of woman hinged on representations of the Virgin Mary, St. Teresa of Ávila, and Queen Isabella. Women were viewed as fundamental not only to physical reproduction, but also the social reproduction of Spanish culture as dictated by the regime. To that end, women were heavily controlled and compelled to remain within the private sphere. Despite this puritanical official discourse, Graham notes that the extreme poverty Spain experienced following the Civil War forced women to work in the domestic sector and as seamstresses for meager wages; women also sought employment in illicit activities, such as working on the black market and prostitution. Graham observes that prostitution, in fact, thrived in the postwar period owing to the rigid gender roles elaborated and oppression the state utilized to present itself as a secure family unit (191).

[5]According to Tabea Linhard, hybridity, "should not be taken for granted as a happy ending for any story of migration, but rather as the beginning of an interrogation, opening up the question of subjectivity in the first place (421).

[6] Koshy specifically describes the American context, affirming that unlike in European nations, immigration and miscegenation laws in the United States formed the primary site for defining the frontiers of nationhood (3). These frontiers change with the political and social climate, yet remain defined in the interracial sexual contract and cultural productions that uphold it.

[7] In *The Logic of Practice,* Pierre Bourdieu extended the idea of capital to categories such as social capital, cultural capital, and symbolic capital. For Bourdieu each individual occupies a position in a multidimensional social space. Individuals enter into subject positions not only by social class membership, but also via the forms capital leveraged through social relations.

[8] In 1989, the first *hijab* incident took place in a suburb of France when three Muslim girls wearing scarves were expelled. As reported in 2003, "A number of European countries have been struggling with the dilemmas posed by the Muslim headscarf, which throws up a variety of difficult issues relating to tolerance and equality." European nations such as France, Britain, and Spain priding themselves on their secular democracies argue that the veil or *hijab* signifies women's religious oppression in Islam. Those who claim to have fought for gender equality in Europe also detest the gender inequality and the domination of women they perceive the veil to symbolize. Those who advocate the removal of the hijab argue that upon immigrating, Muslims ought to adopt the culture of the destination rather than cling to their own customs. British Prime Minister Tony Blair remarked in 2003 that the veil is a "mark of separation." The debate became even more polemical that same year when French president Jacques Chirac proposed a law that would ban any girl wearing *hijab* from attending public schools. And in March 2004, the French legislative council voted on a ban of all religious symbols in public schools. Several journalists believe that the post 9/11 milieu marked by Islamophobia and the xenophobia that resulted from a visible increase in foreign immigration in Europe made this and similar laws throughout Europe possible.

CHAPTER 4: Assimilation and Sexualized Citizens in Contemporary Spain

In this chapter, I examine the two modes of textual resolution that delimit the outcome of immigrating to Spain. In several transnational narratives about women immigrants, two axes of resolution seem most pertinent. The first model consists of assimilation. This model coheres around domestication, articulated through marriage or friendship with a Spaniard. The second model entails expulsion. In this scenario, women immigrants' difference is depicted as so immense that they cannot be incorporated into the social body. Like the prostitutes in Chapter Three, these women pose a threat to the nation. In addition, their ethnic difference suggests that they are the Other of Spanish sociality and must be expelled to ensure its survival. In this chapter, the question of difference, specifically its negotiation in the first model and its extraction in the second, is my primary concern; in addition, I analyze how sexual, ethnic, and racial difference crafts new contours in the contemporary Spanish cultural landscape. Representations of women immigrants in Spain, in positing a double-bind of difference predicated on both race and gender, offer rich terrain to interrogate how Spain embraces identity or obliterates it, thus forging certain nationalistic desires and fantasies while eschewing others.

The protagonists' bodies themselves highlight the messages these texts attempt to convey, in the spatial positioning of their bodies and in presenting their bodies in a way that often highlights difference. As Butler reminds us, there is a *schema* of bodies as a historically contingent nexus of power/discourse that allows a body to be materialized and understood (Butler *Bodies* 33). Through these processes, immigrant women's bodies are figured and recognized as bodies marked by ethnic-cultural difference. The majority of the texts I analyze in this chapter are films. The medium of film elucidates the questions at hand by visually

rendering the bodies of migrant women on the screen and linking them to a narrative. As bell hooks states, "In this age of mixing and hybridity, popular culture, particularly the world of movies, constitutes a new frontier providing a sense of movement, of pulling away from the familiar and journeying into and beyond the world of the other" (2). Indeed, transnational narratives on film are able to *show* a great deal, literally, about the Other. Reading these films as cultural productions that reflect the particularities of contemporary Spain for predominantly Spanish audiences allows for a more complex understanding of the representation of the recent phenomenon of Spanish immigration and Spanish national identity.

Gender and Citizenship in *Flores de otro mundo*

In *Strangers to Ourselves*, Julia Kristeva analyzes the stranger and the notion of foreignness ascribed the stranger. The foreigner in primitive societies was often the enemy (4). As Flesler has shown, in contemporary Spain, male Moroccan immigrants are often linked to the figure of the Moorish enemy of the medieval Spanish Reconquest. The question of gender complicates the perception of the foreigner. Foreign women are less likely to be portrayed in a hostile or aggressive light as an enemy. Yet, women are incorporated and expelled from the social body in ways that elucidate how gender informs these processes of assimilation and exclusion.

Kristeva observes that the first immigrants in Western literature are, in fact, women. According to Greek mythology, the Danaïdes were Egyptian women who arrived in Argos. Kristeva situates the Danaïdes' foreignness in two character traits: their Egyptian origin and their opposition to marriage (*Strangers* 44). They remained outside of the community

constituted by family (Kristeva *Strangers* 44). The two out of the 50 Dinaïdes who did accept Greek suitors did so with the blessing of the king of the gods' wife, Hera, having accepted the social contract of marriage. Kristeva's interpretation of this myth resonates with contemporary representations of assimilation and incorporation of the foreign into the social body. Kristeva concludes, "The Greek mind condemned foreignness only when the latter tended to defy the common mean. Amazons and murderous women were disposed of, while foreignness—disassociated from moral outrageousness after having been involved in it—was amenable to the rites and laws of the polis" (*Strangers* 45). Assimilation of foreign women, similarly, must be in line with the social contract, which, both in Greek myth and in the contemporary world, often hinges on marriage and feminine subjugation.

The film *Flores de otro mundo* illuminates these issues of assimilation and gendered citizenship. In this movie, several women attend a festival designed to bring possible partners to a male-dominated Castilian village suffering from population decline. Three relationships develop in the film; two result from the festival: a Dominican mother, Patricia, marries a shy farmer named Damian and a woman from Bilbao, Marirrosi, begins a relationship with Alfonso. In addition, a wealthy man in construction work, Carmelo, brings his Cuban girlfriend to Spain promising her that she will see the world. The modes through which Patricia is incorporated into the social body as opposed to Milady illuminate the theories of assimilation, gender, and citizenship outlined by Kristeva and Carole Pateman. In addition, the film focuses on rural Spain as opposed to the metropolises where immigration is more widespread. As Parvati Nair reminds us, "The village, apparently synonymous with community, provides a landscape of permanence… Relatively little consideration has been

given either by cultural texts or cultural analysts to the toll of modernity on rural life… Iciar Bollaín's film *Flores de otro mundo* is significant for doing so" ("Modernity's Wake" 39). The integration of these women into a rural Spanish town outlines the parameters of inclusion in a seemingly "traditional" Spanish milieu less cosmopolitan than large cities such as Barcelona or Madrid.

Patricia, divorced with two children, arrives in Santa Eulalia in the caravan described above. Her situation is especially difficult. She left Madrid, where she was a domestic worker, to attend the festival in Santa Eulalia in hopes of finding a man who will rectify her illegal residency and become a father figure for her two children. Patricia meets Damián after warding off the advances of a sexually aggressive suitor. Throughout the film, Patricia must negotiate the excessive sexuality assumed of Caribbean immigrants and her motherhood and the animosity of her new neighbors, including her future mother-in-law.

Several of the Spaniards in the film, including Gregoria, Damián's mother, question the domestic capabilities and moral rectitude of the Caribbean women in the film. After Patricia marries Damián, she moves to his farm, where he lives with his mother. She and Gregoria have contentious moments about cooking, her friends, and the hyper-sexual music that her friends play when they come to visit. In another scene, a group of Spaniards questions why Patricia and Milady have settled with men in the town, opining that once their papers are in order and they have taken advantage of the artless farmers, they will abandon them. These xenophobic comments demonstrate that the villagers cling to a particular notion of community that eschews the Other. Yet their circumstances force them to look beyond this community to sustain themselves and their corresponding identity, thus "rethinking the Self *in terms of* the Other" (Nair "Modernity's Wake" 40). While this has the radical potential to

transform collective notions of identity, the film later suggests this nascent multiculturalism is firmly grounded in atavistic cultural practices and conservatism. Patricia will not only prove to them that she is not the plotting immigrant who is a threat, but also will convey her willingness embrace their communal practices.

One scene accurately demonstrates how Patricia must negotiate her sexuality and her domesticity. Patricia reveals to her husband Damián that she is not officially divorced from her Dominican husband, angering the Spanish farmer. They begin to discuss the situation and she also admits that marrying him was a neat and easy way to rectify her situation in Spain. Damián, frustrated and vexed, accuses her of having been a prostitute in Madrid before moving to Santa Eulalia and suggests that he wants to separate. Patricia loads up her car, and Gregoria, with whom she has had an uneasy relationship, says to Damián, "Tu familia se va. ¿Quieres que se vaya?" [Your family is leaving. Do you want them to go?] Damián leaves the house and begins to remove Patricia's things from the car, indicating their union will be preserved. The dichotomy between domestic women who are a part of the community and the inassimilable, promiscuous women who must be expelled from the home is firmly established. Like her son, Gregoria recognizes in Patricia a desire for home and for family aligned with Spanish values. This desire is most clearly evinced in the final scene, in which Janai, Patricia's 8-year old daughter receives Holy Communion. The final shot, a photograph of the multi-ethnic family celebrating this sacrament, indicates the sort of multiculturalism propagated in contemporary Spain. This multiculturalism is founded on what Yeon-Soo Kim describes "a homogeneous way of life" and the exaltation of the family as "a widely desired commodity" (*Family Album* 185). In addition, religion serves as a family glue. Multiculturalism's apparent aim is to reestablish atavistic forms of Spanish national identity.

Flores de otro mundo establishes a link between Patricia and Gregoria, suggesting that she will continue and actualize the modes of female citizenship the latter realized, most likely under the Franco dictatorship. Pamela Radcliff notes the difficulty women experienced in Spain in terms of defining the parameters of their citizenship during the Transition from Francoism to democracy. She observes: "While women's 'different' roles as mothers, housewives and neighbors provided an acceptable path into civil society under the Franco regime, the democratic discourse could not translate these housewives into "equal" housewife-citizens and recognize their subjectivity as actors in the larger transformation" (79). As the quote suggests, women in democratic Spain have increasingly eschewed the role of stay-at-home wife and mother celebrated by Francoist rhetoric. This has resulted in Spain's extremely low birth rate, only recently bolstered through immigration (Zecchi 147). Barbara Zecchi examines *Flores de otro mundo* among other films as part and parcel of "a plethora of discourses that, either through the glorification of procreation or through guilt and fear, promote maternity again as the *sine qua non* for an integral fulfillment of womanhood" (Zecchi 147). In contemporary Spain, where Spanish women have increasingly abandoned this role, immigrant women fill the void as maternal figures. This is precisely what occurs in *Flores de otro mundo*. As Susan Martín-Márquez shows, Patricia must reproduce traditional gender roles upon arriving in Spain, contradicting what Marirrosi, the Basque woman opts to do ("World" 268). The latter equates migration to Santa Eulalia with death and desires her own freedom and her own life in Bilbao. Patricia's incorporation into the social body is predicated on her adherence to a specific form of womanhood and maternity akin to that of her mother-in-law, now distanced from the types of womanhood circulating in contemporary Spain.

Paul Schroeder Rodríguez argues that Patricia is complicit with patriarchy; in fact, she is complicit with an anachronistic form of patriarchy marked by women's exclusion more so than 1990s Spanish society. This bond between Patricia and Gregoria is forged prior to Patrica's argument with Damián in a graveyard where Gregoria honors her dead husband and their relationship together. Gregoria realizes that Patricia, like herself, loves Damián because he is a decent and nurturing man who will take care of her and her children, just as her own husband took care of her and Damián. In this way, Patricia continues a particular form of marriage and motherhood characteristic of a generation past. As Martín-Márquez has indicated, this moment constitutes a turning point in their tenuous relationship in which Gregoria recognizes that despite their racial and cultural differences, an "intense commonality" unites them ("World" 267). Yet, the divide that Greogria believed to separate them hinged primarily on race and ignored the linguistic, cultural, and religious similarities the women shared. This exaggerated difference displays the falsehood often underlying border formation. Both symbolically and literally, as Martín-Márquez suggests in the adjacent positioning of their beds, separated by a thin wall, Gregoria and Patricia are connected more than divided ("World" 266). Nair cites Antonio Sánchez and Helen Graham to posit that Spain's entry into postmodernity elicited a confused and confusing hybridity ("Modernity's Wake" 44). In *Flores de otro mundo,* this uneven process is seemingly resolved in Patricia who offers the best of both worlds to the depopulated village: post-national multiculturalism and womanhood reminiscent of Francoism.

Patricia effectively upholds what Pateman describes as "the sexual contract." Pateman argues that the social contract presupposes another, sexual one which regulates women's bodies and actions. Pateman cites Rousseau to affirm that the social contract

enables individuals voluntarily to subject themselves to the state and civil law; freedom becomes obedience and, in exchange, protection is provided (7). For Pateman, the social contract corresponds to the public sphere and the sexual to the private sphere, which is deemed politically irrelevant (Pateman 3). Following this line of reasoning, the sexual contract illuminates that sexual difference is political difference, or as Pateman describes it, "sexual difference is the difference between freedom and subjection" (6). Patricia, in accepting this role, accepts the contract that myriads of women in the new millennium tend to opt out of in favor of more equal marriages and/or careers that allow them to assume roles in society that are not limited to marriage, motherhood, and the private sphere.

Domestication and the Pet

Milady, in contrast, is a young, single woman from Cuba brought to Santa Eulalia by her middle-aged boyfriend Carmelo. Milady embodies a wilder sexuality which must be brought under control. As Schroeder Rodríguez states, "Milady's sexuality is depicted as uncontrolled and therefore dangerous. In effect, the film reproduces the stereotypical view of race intersecting with sexuality, whereby the darker a person's skin, the greater that person's sexual prowess." When Milady's sexuality becomes too threatening, she must be expelled from the social body, much like the prostitutes previously analyzed. Like the prostitute characters, Milady is highly sexualized in the film. The men in the town comment brazenly about her physical appearance and sexual attractiveness, and Carmelo relishes in their admiration and fascination with Milady, who Schroeder Rodríguez describes as "a sexual object, a trophy from a hunt overseas." As these quotes suggest, Milady's unbridled sexuality is linked to her racial and national identity as an Afro-Cuban. When she first appears in the

film, she is wearing shiny leggings emblazoned with the American flag. Jaume Martí-Olivella observes, "A close-up of the pants precedes a hilarious scene where Milady 'humiliates' Carmelo's masculinity, consequently establishing the real dominant symbolic order" (169). The juxtaposition of these two scenes suggests that Carmelo will not be able to control Milady as he hopes, which will create a site of tension in *Flores de otro mundo*.

Milady's objectification can be explained utilizing the work of Patricia Hill Collins on the sexual politics of black womanhood. Hill Collins states that black women's bodies are likened to those of animals so that they can be "economically exploited, worked, sold, killed, and consumed," evincing the inassimilability and even expendability of these bodies (171). She extends this idea to elaborate on the notion of the "pet." Much like Milady, the "pet" described by Hill Collins is dominated and treated with affection and is simultaneously included and excluded from the national family, like a domesticated animal permitted to remain in the home. Unlike the animalized sexuality described above, which is ultimately destroyed, the pet is a construct of subordination, predicated on the pet's ability to play along with those who wield power over her. This idea of the included-excluded pet is especially significant as Milady comes from a former colony of Spain. Martí Olivella suggests traces of this former connection remain in current representations of Cuban and Spanish relations. He states, "Cuba must be analyzed as the imaginary articulation of two historical phenomena: the nostalgic reinscription of the Spanish imperial subject and the touristic commodification of the island as an erotic and 'archeological' paradise" (162). In *Flores de otro mundo*, both models hold true. Carmelo travels to Cuba for sex tourism and upon bringing Milady back to Spain, he attempts to dominate her body in a manner that resonates with the imperial control exercised during colonization.

Milady rebels against Carmelo, who has brought her to Spain and treats her as his pet. She calls her Italian boyfriend regularly, even confessing to Patricia's daughter that she is in love with him, but his family won't accept their relationship. In addition, she leaves Carmelo for a weekend unexpectedly, venturing to Valencia with a truck driver who takes interest in the sexy Cuban woman as she passes on the street. In Valencia, Milady dances energetically and enjoys herself in the clubs and at the beach; this experience contrasts greatly with her life of boredom in the dreary Castilian town of Santa Eulalia. She returns and attempts to tell Carmelo about the wonderful time she had in Valencia, only to be reproached by her lover. He punishes her for her abandonment and betrayal with a brutal beating.

In this way, Milady oscillates between the domesticated pet who remains in the home, providing her benefactor with attention, affection, and unbridled animalistic sexuality, and uncontrollable comportment reminiscent of the prostitutes described in the previous chapter. Her relationship with Carmelo manifests this disjuncture in his excitement and her continual boredom. When he first brings her to Santa Eulalia, his large house and fancy gadgets do not interest Milady. The violence he uses to convey his anger when she returns from Valencia also evinces a breakdown in communication between them. He does not reason with Milday or try to convince her of his opinion; he must resort to violence to get his point across to her. Schroeder Rodríguez points out that in addition to crafting stereotypes in which race intersects with sexuality, race also intersects with violence, again, stereotypically in *Flores de otro mundo*. Damián yells at Patricia and even pushes her daughter off his tractor during their argument. Carmelo beats Milady in public view and is not punished, indicating "that all of Santa Eulalia, including now Patricia, is complicit with the patriarchal structures of class,

gender, race, and sexuality" (Schroeder Rodríguez). The violence is utilized to domesticate her, yet Carmelo fails to do so.

Following the argument, they reconcile, and Carmelo begins to suggest that she would not be as bored at home if she had children. Milady dismisses this point of entry into citizenship— marriage and motherhood—refusing to serve as Carmelo's pet. One scene accurately represents Milady's opposition to domestication. She is in the kitchen cooking, listening to fast-paced and sexual Caribbean rap music. She is most likely cooking a Caribbean dish, which, like the meals prepared by her friend Patricia, will be too spicy for the Spaniards who eat it. Carmelo enters and asks her if she's ever danced to a romantic *pasodoble*; he turns her music off and replaces it with soft, slow music and begins to dance with his lover.[1] Milady's disappointment with the music and Carmelo is palpable. Soon after, she leaves Santa Eulalia with Carmelo's young farmhand. She later abandons him, as well, and through these short-lived trysts with Spanish men, Milady demonstrates her refusal to be domesticated and suggests that she will continue to wander on the periphery of Spanish sociality as a pet that continually turns on its masters instead of behaving in a subordinate, loving manner.

Nair affirms that all six individuals who form couples in *Flores de otro mundo* experience migration, displacement, and isolation ("Modernity's Wake" 39). Yet, they reorient themselves in a way aligned with their sense of community and the respective desires to belong. Milady and Patricia specifically evince the inner workings of the sexual contract. These women are able to travel and to reside in Spain if, like the first immigrants in Western literature, the Danaïdes, they welcome marriage and domesticity and accept the sexual contract that continues to structure women's inclusion in society. Modes of being

outside of this paradigm, especially those that hinge upon the immigrant women's sexuality, are acceptable for a short period, but result in the immigrant's excessive sexuality causing her eventual expulsion from Spanish sociality.

Hierarchies of Normalcy in *I love you, baby*

I love you, baby (dir. Alfonso Albacete and David Menkes 2001) also deals with interethnic desire between Spaniards and immigrants; this film shows the love triangle that develops between Marcos, Daniel, and Marisol. All three characters have come to Madrid in search of better opportunities. Marcos is from a Spanish *pueblo,* Daniel is Argentinean, and Marisol is from the Dominican Republic. In the opening scene, when Marcos arrives in Madrid, he first sees a multiracial woman speaking on a pay phone and soon after runs into Marisol, who gives him directions to his uncle's home. This initial presentation of Madrid centers on the multiculturalism of the Spanish capital.

When his aunt and uncle learn that Marisol likes Marcos, they have contradictory feelings toward the Dominican woman. The aunt cautions her nephew that foreign women are hunting husbands, and they only want to marry to improve their situation in Spain, creating a fun wordplay with *cazar* and *casar*. The uncle, in contrast, tells Marcos that he is young and he ought to have fun with the Dominican woman before settling down with a woman like his aunt. His uncle's response reflects the "pet" paradigm described above of simultaneous and ambiguous inclusion and exclusion. Later, when Marcos decides to go out instead of watching television with the older couple, his aunt warns him that it is dangerous to go out at night, bemoaning "cómo se ha puesto el barrio" [what the neighborhood has become]. She suggests, as did the opening scene, that immigration has changed the

atmosphere of the area. Yet, she elides the idea of kind, comely immigrants in the opening scene for a more sinister view. Her impression speaks to the native inclination to associate the immigrant other with violence and aggression. The uncle, in contrast, gives Marcos money and tells him to find that Dominican woman and buy her a drink. Again, the aunt reflects a model of separation and animosity, while the uncle mirrors the tendency to exploit and to use the immigrant before settling into one's own cultural norms.

I love you, baby is especially poignant as it presents two forms of desire that undermine paradigms of hegemonic normalcy: interethnic desire and queer desire. Michael Warner asserts that heterosexual processes of normalization structure society, creating heteronormative desire and delegitimizing other forms of sexuality (xxvi). Indeed, he traces a genealogy of discourses on sexuality in Aristotle, Marx, and even NASA pamphlets destined for extraterrestrials to show that heterosexuality is equated with humanity from antiquity to the moment of his analysis. Similarly, as Hill Collins and Koshy remind us, the sexuality of the Other, evinced in interethnic relationships, is animalized and distanced from hegemonic forms of normalcy. The film creates a hierarchy of these marginalized relationships, privileging the heterosexual desire of the interethnic relationship between Marcos and Marisol over the same-sex love between Marcos and Daniel.

Marcos meets Daniel, a handsome young actor, in a bar that is closing, and they go to a gay nightclub together. From the beginning of their interaction, Marcos seems reluctant to embrace same-sex desire fully. Their first kiss occurs as Marcos recoils and asks his date, "¿Un beso? ¿Aquí en público? ¿En pleno día?" [A kiss? Here in public? In broad daylight?] Daniel responds that they are in Madrid, insinuating that same-sex desire is not taboo or repressed in the progressive Spanish capital. One night, Marcos and Daniel go to a karaoke

bar with several friends. An Asian woman is singing flamenco in another scene that suggests the cultural hybridity and multiculturalism present in twenty-first century Madrid. In a scene that is supposed to be comical, Marcos and Daniel sing "Can't Take My Eyes Off You," and a disco ball suddenly falls on Marcos's head, a blow that, the viewer later realizes, causes him to become heterosexual.

Marisol goes to Marcos's uncle's restaurant regularly, with the hope of catching Marcos's eye. Following the disco ball incident, after months of visits, he notices her. One night, he sees her going into a Dominican nightclub in their neighborhood, and follows her there. The contrast between the two nightclub scenes indicates how the film creates a hierarchy of desire that privileges heterosexuality, even if interethnic, over same-sex desire. The gay nightclub featured an abundance of scantily clad men dancing to electronic music in a highly sexualized fashion. The Dominican immigrants, often exoticized and hypersexualized, are not in this scene; rather, they are portrayed as tender, loving, and provincial as all the nightclub patrons sing the chorus to a bachata song in unison and repeat the word, "Amor." Their love is human, as Warner reminds us, because it is heterosexual, as opposed to the harsh electronic rhythms and plethora of sexualized bodies at the gays' place. These scenes of socialization of space insinuate that Marisol will provide Daniel with a loving and nurturing partner.

Marisol is characterized as embracing domesticity. After she meets Marcos, she is seen at work, dressed as a maid and doing domestic chores. She is also a mother who longs to be reunited with her daughter, who lives in the Dominican Republic. In addition, Marcos and Marisol share several interests rooted in similar culture, which indicate that they will mesh well. Earlier in the film, Marisol rushes to put the Real Madrid game on television, as her

Dominincan friends comment she is “muy rara” [very strange] because of her love for soccer. She watches the crowd on television, and present there are Daniel and Marcos; the latter is cheering avidly, while Daniel seems bored and uninterested in the game. Soon after, he and Daniel go to a play where Marcos falls asleep. The disjuncture between the sensitive actor and Marcos, who loves the national pastime of soccer “as a real man” suggest their incompatibility. In another scene, once Daniel and Marcos move in together, Daniel prepares a welcome dinner to celebrate their love nest. Marcos remarks that the pizza is burnt in a critique of his cooking skills. He also decorates their apartment with posters of Boy George, which Marcos finds odd, another indication that his idea of domesticity contrasts with his lover’s. Marisol, in contrast, brings him Dominican food during one of their first dates and Marcos enthusiastically raves, “Ah, ¡qué bueno!” [Ah, it’s so good!] Her ability to take care of her partner is naturalized and normalized whereas Daniel and Marcos’s domestic situation was made strange.

Realizing that he is losing Marcos to Marisol, Daniel contrives one final plan to get him back. He begins to cross-dress, believing that if Marcos prefers women, then he will become the woman his ex desires. Marcos’s uncle and the Dominicans who meet “María,” the feminized Daniel, all believe that she is a man. Shortly after, Marcos learns that he is not only a man, but also his ex-lover. Judith Butler notes the importance of recognition that allows individuals to become socially constituted beings (*Undoing* 2). She explains: “What I call my ‘own’ gender appears perhaps at times as something I author, or, indeed, own. But the terms that make up one’s gender are, from the start, outside oneself, beyond oneself in a sociality” (1). Through this process of social recognition, Daniel’s body is firmly repositioned within the scope of signification that those who view him who serve as a

microcosm for society, deem appropriate, despite his attempt to appear otherwise. He is not a woman, and he is certainly not the woman that Marcos ought to date or marry according to Spanish norms.

In the end, Marisol and Marcos marry and have several children, while Daniel begins a relationship with Boy George in London. The heterosexual relationship is again naturalized and normalized through the notion of family while queer desire is spectacularized and refigured as incredible with the addition of an eccentric pop star. Rosi Song observes that Daniel's homosexuality is incompatible with Spanish culture and, thus, removed and repositioned in England (59). As Lauren Berlant and Michael Warner suggest, "National heterosexuality is the mechanism by which a core national culture can be imagined as a sanitized space of sentimental feeling and immaculate behavior, a space of *pure citizenship*" (549; my emphasis). The nation becomes recuperated in the film through the relationship between the immigrant woman and the Spanish man, purifying them and making them citizens again.

I love you, baby, circulates images of relationships: there is the older aunt and uncle, who like Marcos, are internal immigrants. The film also presents Daniel's friend Carmen, who has a series of failed relationships and opts to adopt a Russian child in order to become a mother. Similarly, Marisol's friend Kenya is hyper-sexualized and advises her against dating a Spanish man, or any man, exclusively; she tells her to forget about Marcos by going out to nightclubs and meeting lots of other men.[2] Like Daniel, Carmen and Kenya have repudiated the hegemonic form of familial—and consequently, nationalistic—creation personified in characters like Marcos's relatives and Marisol. Song notes that the conventional heterosexual narrative advanced in films like *Flores de otro mundo*, *I love you, baby*, and *Cosas que dejé*

en la Habana contradicts the reality of sexual liberation in contemporary, democratic Spain (48).[3] While Daniel's relationship with Boy George is not denigrated outright, it is construed as popular, trendy, or fun, one of the new possibilities afforded in progressive, twenty-first century Madrid. Marcos and Marisol's relationship mirrors the less glamorous relationship of his older aunt and uncle, again repositioning the immigrant woman as an atavistic instantiation of ultraconservative Spanish femininity if she is to assimilate. This heterosexual narrative, like the narrative of beneficial motherhood advanced in *Flores de otro mundo*, sustains the multicultural enterprise in allowing a foreign character who espouses an ideal that is valuable to the nation to be incorporated into the social body.

Representations of Multiculturalism in the Novels of Najat El Hachmi

Depictions of an increasingly diverse Spanish state hinge on the notion of who is assimilable into the social body and who ought to be expelled from it. Discourses of diversity and citizenship structure these cultural productions and create hierarchies of desirable citizens, as evinced above. The pluralistic society in which various ethnicities, sexualities, and lifestyle possibilities coexist is restricted, and certain forms of alterity, often those that can be most easily assimilated, are considered apt for Spanish culture. Multiculturalism, following this notion, refers not to the destination's ability to accept new cultures but to the immigrant's ability to assume the dominant culture and to assimilate into Spanish sociality.

Juan Díez Medrano analyzes a survey carried out by the International Social Survey Programme in 2003 to examine which criteria they feel are ideal for nationals and for immigrants to have. In other words, Spanish nationals lay out the parameters for nationality and outline the best ways for immigrants to assimilate and for Spain to adapt to the

phenomenon of immigration. This survey is unique in taking the pulse of Spanish attitudes toward immigration, which often differs from official state policies toward immigration. When asked about immigration levels, 44.6% of respondents thought that immigration should be reduced, evincing a contrast with state policy that would be rectified with the reduction (144). According to Díez Medrano, the dominant model of citizenship in contemporary Spain equates being Spanish with being a Spanish citizen (134). While this might seem a little obvious, this idea contrasts with what Eric J. Hobsawm terms the "Age of Empire," in which nationality and citizenship were unhinged through extensive colonial holdings. Unlike that model, being Spanish is closely tied to the physical land, among other characteristics.

Díez Medrano constructs a matrix of factors that structure what it means to "be Spanish," including to have been born in Spain, to have Spanish citizenship, to have lived in Spain for most of one's life, to be able to speak Spanish, to be Catholic, to respect Spain's institutions and laws, to feel Spanish, and to have Spanish ancestors. He also includes another separate dimension of sharing Spain's customs and traditions. The majority of the respondents identified with what Díez Medrano considers a republican conception of the nation in which those who have citizenship, long-term residence, and a will to be a citizen are considered citizens; yet within this model, he notes varying degrees of ethno-biological and politico-territorial content (139).[4]

In terms of multiculturalism, the majority of those surveyed (61%) agreed that other ethnic groups ought to adapt and blend into the larger society as opposed to maintaining their own customs and traditions (Díez Medrano 142). This approach to immigration establishes that a fundamental component to citizenship is a corresponding set of customs and traditions

characteristic of the destination. Díez Medrano's study confirms that often, multiculturalism results from the Other assuming dominant culture's traits as opposed to that nation incorporating the cultural particularities of the Other into its culture. Díez Medrano concludes that his study "describe[s] Spanish views, perceptions, and attitudes on a number of related topics that have been analyzed in the literatures on national identity, citizenship and immigration politics over more than two decades" (154).

In the work *White Nation,* Ghassan Hage investigates discourses on immigration and multiculturalism and the nationalistic fantasies underlying attitudes toward immigration and corresponding state policies in Australia. He questions if immigration polls and debates that purportedly gage national attitudes serve as "rituals of white empowerment" where, in his context, white Australians feel licensed to talk, decide, and wield power over "Third-World looking Australians" (241). In both Hage's analysis, which he describes through a subtitle as "fantasies of white supremacy in a multicultural society" and Najat El Hachmi's transnational narratives describing the lives of Moroccan immigrants in Catalonia, the question of positioning and situating the immigrant Other arise, evincing the problematic of multiculturalism in contemporary Spain.

Najat El Hachmi was born in Nador, Morocco and moved to Spain in 1987, at the age of eight. Her first work, an autobiographical essay entitled *Jo també soc catalana*, engages the integration of immigrants into Catalonia with regard to language, culture, and religion. Susan Martín Márquez points out that, "El Hachmi explains that her book is a response to the statistical analyses of immigrants that now abound in Spain—analyses that entail maximum 'objectification' of the 'object of study'—and she asserts that 'people are not known through statistics.'" (*Disorientations* 347). One such statistical study is the one mentioned above,

which, following El Hachmi's logic, reveals more about native tensions about immigration than an intent to formulate policies of assimilation and integration. Throughout *White Nation*, Hage contemplates the spatial power intrinsic to the concept of race and racist discourse often underlying immigration debates. Several moments in *Jo també soc catalana* evince this tension. The title of the work itself reveals the author's identification with a nationalistic identity that the culture at large often denies her owing to her ethnic background.

One year after her arrival, the narrator begins to feel displaced from her Moroccan culture, noting that she feels compelled to choose the culture in which she was born or the culture in which she now resides. During a neighborhood festival, one person remarks, "Najat, has après a parlar català molt de pressa, tu ja ets d'aqui, oi?" (64) [Najat, you have learned to speak Catalan very quickly, you're practically from here, right?]. Her linguistic capabilities mark her as more Catalan and, in turn, less Moroccan in a model of national identity that seems to consist of fixed amounts that shift as one assimilates. This follows Hage's idea that nationality can be accumulated through the acquisition of national culture and character, evinced in certain types of preferences and behavior (52-3). The narrator's natural-sounding Catalan is one such form of national capital. The narrator responds in her mind, "Volia que els dos mons fossin un. Si jo era catlana, els mès bonics de meva infantesa s'escolaven entre les llambordes d'aquell carrer de festa inundat per la *boira*" (65, my emphasis) [I wanted the two worlds to be only one. If I were Catalan, the most beautiful moments of my childhood were swept away among the cobblestones of that street party flooded by fog]. She utilizes the symbols of clouds and fog to express the ambiguity of her identity, which is seen as less Moroccan because of her comprehension of Catalan.

This exchange makes the narrator recall another similar experience that demonstrates how her identity is bifurcated into Moroccan and Catalan and how the two are kept at a distance. The neighborhood festival occurs at the end of Ramadan, and the narrator has decorated her hands with henna for the occasion. One of her neighbors remarks that her hands are dirty and tells her to go wash them. The narrator is ashamed and disappointed that her henna, which she meticulously applied, is a source of disdain instead of praise. She states, "La il·lusió que sempre m'havia fet l'henna es transformava en una estranya senció de ridicul, una vergonya que mai abans havia experimentat" [The delight that henna had always given was transformed into a strange ridiculous sensation, a shame that I had never experienced] (66). She notes that two Najats must exist, a Moroccan one, "de portes endins" [indoors] and a Catalan one, "de portes enfora" [outdoors] (67). Her Moroccan identity is positioned in the private sphere while her Catalan identity can be performed in public. Again, this reflects Hage's spatial description of nationalistic fantasies. He states, "Racist categorizations and the nationalist practice they delineate embody an image of spatial management often manifested in policing fantasies" (44). The Spanish neighbor who tells the narrator she ought to wash her hands sets in motion a cognizance of cultural difference, difference that ought to be left at home.

El Hachmi's complicated identity formation melds her Catalonian and Moroccan backgrounds, yet the feasibility of melding these two cultures on Spanish soil becomes questionable throughout *Jo també soc catalana*. The spatial manifestation of multiculturalism comes into play more intensely at another moment in the text. When it is proposed that a mosque be built in the neighborhood, the residents vehemently oppose this possibility, arguing that there would be a conflict of interest between the mosque-goers and the

parishioners at the Evangelical church and the two Catholic churches in the area. The president of the neighborhood association asks for the narrator's assistance in opposing this venture, stating, "Tots sabem els problems que porta la religió musulmana arreu del món" (118) [We all know the problems that the Muslim religion brings throughout the world]. This plea asks the narrator to prioritize one of her identities over another, as though she should understand why her Catalonian neighbors cannot fathom these two cultures existing harmoniously, as she has for decades. This moment in the text also exemplifies Hage's assertion that "In every 'go home,' there is an 'I want and am entitled to feel at home in my nation" (40). The Spaniards' preoccupation with the sheer *quantity* of immigrants a mosque would bring to the area specifically reflects concern with a privileged relationship between race, ethnicity, and space, that makes plain the connection between ostensibly racist discourse and nationalistic issues.

Hage's analysis is rich in adding the spatial dimension to debates about racist discourse. As in *Flores de otro mundo* and other texts I have analyzed in this dissertation, negotiating the foreign body entails both positioning and situating the body both symbolically and physically within the national space. Multiculturalism aims to reconcile or to position several cultures within the same space. As stated in Chapter Two, facile forms of experiencing the other's culture, such as through food or music, foment a superficial multiculturalism predicated on the Other's domestication and invisibility in the public sphere. These types of multicultural exchanges circulate an idea of a cosmopolitan, post-national state that is not necessarily hampered by more serious interethnic issues that emerge in crafting a multicultural space in the public sphere in which matters like access to employment, religious identity, gender equality, etc. are taken into account.

Other forms of cultural hybridity described in *Jo també soc catalana*, like linguistic competency in Amizage and Catalan and a Muslim place of worship in a purportedly secular, historically Catholic nation suggest a more profound multiculturality. And indeed, these are the platforms on which more acrimonious debates ensue. The author's astonishment at the anti-immigrant sentiment spewed by her friends and neighbors, people who knew immigrants like herself personally, show the conflicted nature of multiculturalism. While they accept a few immigrant families in their neighborhood, the construction of a mosque elides the ideal forged in accepting a handful of individuals or attending a multicultural festival one afternoon. Again, following Hage's paradigm, the Spanish nationals imagine themselves as administrators of national space and have positioned the author's family and other immigrants in a cultural configuration they are able to accept. The influx of immigrants that would result from the construction of the mosque, however, is inappropriate and met with their resistance. Their recruitment of the author in their campaign against the mosque also evinces positioning insofar as they assume that she will fight on their side against members of her own religion who have immigrated to Spain just as she did.

Jo també soc catalana is poignant as the author resides in Catalonia, an autonomous region that has sought to assert its own nationality as distinct from that of the rest of Spain. Enric Ucelay Da Cal argues that all contemporary nationalisms in Spain vie for the same attention and resources, and hence, even anti-Spanish nationalisms, such as Catalonian nationalism, share the same social dynamic as Spanish state nationalism (32). Catalan nationalism, for Ucelay Da Cal, responds to exceptional demands on a single territory with unique characteristics that set it apart from the rest of the state; in Catalonia's case, economic power, cultural vibrancy, and a dynamic urban center (37). The Catalan language is

fundamental to this national identity. Following Franco's dictatorship, which suppressed any public activities that promoted Catalan nationalism, including the usage of Catalan, Catalonian state policies have been enacted to increase, protect, and ensure the usage of Catalan. Clare Mar-Molinero observes that Catalan has historically been the language of the entire Catalan population, including upper and middle classes; unlike Basque or Galician, Catalan serves as a marker of social mobility and acceptance (339). Like today, myriads of immigrants flocked to Catalonia throughout the twentieth century, lured by opportunities unavailable in rural Spain. Knowledge of this language facilitated the integration of this massive population, who were probably encouraged by Catalan's wide acceptance at higher rungs on the social ladder.

In the mid-twentieth century, Stewart King observes a propensity either to appropriate internal immigrants as Catalan nationals once they could speak Catalan, while others grounded these immigrants' identities in the birthplace of their parents and grandparents (99). As in today's transnational narratives, this intra-national one grapples with how society can incorporate immigrants who fear the loss of their past cultural identity if they are to assume a Catalan cultural identity upon relocating. El Hachmi's text enters into a dialogue with a litany of publications on the impact of immigration on Catalan nationalism and national identity; the title itself alludes to Miquel Arimany's 1965 *I els Catalans també* (Martín-Márquez *Disorientations* 346). Both then and more recently, openness to new cultural possibilities and to modifying older ones are central to new articulations of *catalanidad*; then, this was represented in Castilian pronouns mixed in with Catalan by immigrants and today, El Hachmi's works present the new Catalan cultural identity crafted by Catalan-speaking immigrants who are not of Spanish origin. Yet, on the other hand, as Martín-Márquez

reminds us, “despite the official policy of linguistic assimilation of internal and external immigrants, ‘native’ Catalans may still maintain a proprietary attitude toward ‘their’ language” (*Disorientations* 350).

The Catalan language is a fundamental component of *Jo també soc catalana* in terms of facilitating the narrator’s assimilation into the Catalonian social sphere and the construction of her identity. Again, the very title, El Hachmi’s appropriation of a Catalan nationalistic identity, is directly linked to her usage of this language. When speaking to her child, the narrator observes, “Sugrament menysprean els nostres sons, però aquesta sensació no et sera desconeguda. La teva *altra* llengua maternal, el català, fou en altres temps perseguida i menystinguda” (27, my emphasis) [They will surely look down on our sounds, but this sensation will not be unknown to you. Your *other* maternal language, Catalan, was also persecuted and despised in other times]. In this quote, she affirms that Catalan is just as much her son’s maternal language as Amazigh is. Not only does the author embrace Catalan as her own, she creates an equivalence between the rejection Moroccan Amazigh with historical repudiation of Catalan as a site of connection between herself both as a Moroccan and as a Catalonian.

As mentioned, Castilian had a less privileged relation to Catalan socio-linguistically among the Spanish internal immigrants during the twentieth century. The language created both a connection and a site of debate. Today, most Catalonian nationals assume that immigrants speak Castilian, a stereotype also impressed on the internal migrants of earlier decades. In one exchange, the narrator defends herself and her son, Rida, in Catalan against a Catalan national who imagines they do not speak the language. The woman is astonished when the narrator tells her that Rida speaks Catalan, justifying her surprise with the statement

"Es que no hay muchos que lo hablen" (51) [It's just that there are lots that don't speak it]. "Muchos," [Lots] beyond any doubt, refers to immigrants. The narrator responds, "Jo també el parlo, sap? I quasi tots els marroquins d'aquesta edat, si això és el que vol dir, parlen la seva llengua perfacetament, és la llengua de l'escola si no ho recordó malament" (51) [I also speak it, you know? And almost all of the Moroccans of his age, if that's who you mean, speak your language perfectly, since it is the language taught in schools as you might recall] . When the woman shrugs off the narrator's extensive explanation with a "bueno," she admits that she would like to correct her and inform her that "bueno" is a barbarism. Indeed, the narrator seems to be shoring up national capital in the form of language to confirm that she, too, is Catalan.

The most obvious form of linguistic capital is her skill as a Catalan writer, a difficult profession to develop owing to her cultural difference and the primacy of culture in literature. As a girl, the narrator dreams of becoming a writer. She imagines that stereotypes about the immigrant experience will shock her readers, who will wonder how she managed to become a successful writer; in addition, she imagines that interviewers will ask her what she likes most about Spain, without realizing that she is more from here than from there, as she describes it (62). Her fascination as an adolescent with Mercè Rodoreda, Montserrat Roig, and Víctor Català situate the narrator within a rich history of Catalan women novelists, disrupting the ethnic dynamic intrinsic to the Catalan canon. Because of her age, her background, and her desire to become a writer, the narrator recognizes that she is experiencing an identity crisis that she will not be able to overcome very soon.

Her son's question, "Jo sóc català, mama?," [Am I Catalan, mother] over a decade later also elicits another interrogation of multicultural identity in Catalonia. The narrator

remarks on the homogenization of Catalonia through Catalan-speaking immigrants like herself. This process expels certain immigrants who have not yet assumed the Catalan culture more fully and erases the cultural hybridity of the Catalan-speaking immigrant for political purposes that advance Catalan nationalism. The author states: "Tota aquella gent que ens acceptava tan bé, no ens acceptava a nosaltres, tal como érem, només expressaven el seu anhel d efer-nos homogenis, es traquil·litzaven a ells mateixos pensant que tots els que veníem de fora ho deixaríem tot enrere per convertir-nos a la causa catalana" [All those people who accepted us so well, did not accept us, as we were, they only expressed their longing to make us homogeneous, it was calming for them to think that all of us who came from outside would leave everything behind to convert ourselves to the Catalan cause.] (90-1). As this quote shows, while the narrator has assumed a multicultural identity that blends both her Moroccan background and Catalan upbringing, the society in which she resides desires a homogenized immigrant whose difference has been effectively neutralized and remains only as a marker of the tolerance in Catalonia.

The author refers to the *boira*, a fog or cloud to symbolize her identity in Europe, a nebulous in-betweenness she navigates and deconstructs throughout *Jo també soc catalana*. In one example, she says that those around her rarely think she speaks Catalan; she imagines they assume she's recently arrived from Morocco, and hence, disconnect her from Catalonia, the place in which she grew up. She concludes, "una s'hi acostuma com s'acostuma a la boira" [you get accustomed to it like one accustoms oneself to the fog] (50). The foggy articulation of Moroccan and Catalan identities confounds the narrator and advances the text. The dual nature of the narrator, who is bifurcated into "dos Najats" [two Najats] who alternate between the private and public spheres, in a Moroccan and in a Catalonian manner,

manifests the difficulty of cultural hybridity even in a seemingly post-national world in which borders are increasingly porous.

The cultural hybridity Moroccan immigrants experience in Catalonia is also detailed in El Hachmi's second work, *L'Últim Patriarca*. In 2008, she won the Ramón Llull prize, the most prestigious award in Catalan letters for this work; this award demonstrates the author's impact on Catalan language and culture. The winning of this award suggests that the forms of public multiculturality that the author laments are lacking in *Jo també soc catalana* are indeed coming into being in Catalonia.

L'Últim Patriarca narrates three generations of the Driouch family. As the title implies, the novel recounts how the patriarchal order that has existed within this family crumbles with the anonymous protagonist's father, Mimoun Driouch. He is despotic, cruel, and unforgiving. As a toddler, he murders his baby brother to eliminate this unexpected rival. This fratricide allows the reader to comprehend Mimoun Driouch's boundless and extreme cruelty for others, even as a young child. As an adolescent, he experiences sex and infidelity, horrified to learn that his promiscuous neighbor has been sleeping with him and other men in their town. He formulates a plan for his future wife based on this lesson, "Debería serle fiel hasta con el pensamiento. Y si no era así, o él tenía la menor sospecha de que no lo era del todo, ya la domesticaría" (39) [She ought to be faithful to him, even in her thoughts. And if she wasn't, or if he had the slightest doubt she wasn't, he would domesticate her]. This passage demonstrates the sort of patriarchy to which Mimoun plans to submit his future wife and his children, especially his daughters. The narrator describes Mimoun's first meeting with his wife like this: "Por el modo en que había bajado la mirada, supo que ésa era la mujer a la que podría domesticar, con la que crearía unos vínculos tan intensos que no podrían

deshacerse nunca, nunca" [By the way she lowered her head, he realized that this was the woman he could domestícate, with whom he could form ties so intense that they would never, ever be undone] (55). Again, domination is central to Mimoun's relationship with his wife, manifest in the verb to domesticate. This idea inheres in a notion of untamed feminine sexuality, which he experienced with his neighbor and must be brought under masculine control to uphold the male-centered patriarchy. This statement also speaks to woman as Other, who, like the pets described by Hill Collins, are simultaneously positioned both inside and outside of sociality.

Even prior to his and his family's relocation, Mimoun's rash temper and irrationality are chipping away at the patriarchal order in his household in Morocco. His immediate family members live in fear of one of his attacks, which often occur without justification. He gets into a physical altercation with his father, a scandal that can humiliate their family if made public. In addition, he has problems with keeping a job and decides to become a migrant worker in Spain. Yet another scandal causes Mimoun to lose his job in construction. He begins to have an illicit affair with his boss's wife; one day, when she refuses him, he will not be denied, and he forces himself on her. When he returns to Morocco to marry, his mother must sell part of her dowry to finance his wedding. This act is so shameful that, despite being a wife and mother, she could be disowned by her family and her husband if they find out. Mimoun's violence and irrationality contradict the rationality, assiduousness, and respectability that characterize his father and the other men in the Driouch family. In one scene, the narrator describes the effects of Mimoun's malevolence and irresponsibility, "Era Mimoun el responsable de mantener a su familia y que si no lo hacía, [su esposa] era tan solo una víctima" (121) [Mimoun was the one responsible for supporting his family, and if he

wouldn't do it, [his wife] was just a victim]. Mimoun's inability to adhere to the established norms of the patriarchal order is most detrimental to the members of his own family, especially his wife, whom he is unable to support and protect without a job or a sense of restraint.

Mimoun beats his wife Mila viciously, accusing her of impossible infidelities. When she gives birth to a boy, Mimoun is furious. The narrator states, "Mimoun dijo que nadie dejara ir un 'iuiu' de alegría, que para él la alegría hubiera sido una hija, de modo que en el pueblo todo el mundo pensó que había nacido una niña" (119) [Mimoun said that no one could emit a shout of joy, that for him, joy would have been a girl child. So, throughout the town, everyone thought a girl had been born.]. This attitude toward male children reflects the subversion of the patriarchal order which privileges boy children over girls. Mimoun's actions are not aligned with the social norms in their Moroccan town. His actions do not mesh well with Spanish society either, evidenced in his firing for rape during his initial trip. Once he relocates his family to Catalonia, his relationship with his wife and to his children worsens.

The narrator describes her mother, Mila, as transforming what surrounds her. Instead of assimilating into the Spanish environment, it is Mila, the passive wife who has been dominated by her husband, who acts as an agent upon her environment, continuing in her role as a Moroccan Muslim housewife although they now reside in Spain. Like nearly everything she does, Mila's identity and corresponding behavior create a site of discord between the narrator's parents when her father decides he doesn't want her mother to wear the veil or *hiyab* when she goes out shopping, "Quítate eso de la cabeza, que me haces pasar vergüenza. Y ella que no, que me que me sentiré desnuda, que no. Mira que aquí las cosas

son diferentes y que a mí me conoce mucha gente y tengo una empresa y no hay ninguna necesidad de llevar estos harapos" [Take that off, you are bringing me shame. And she responded, no, no, I will feel naked, no. Look things are different here, lots of people know me, I have my own business, and there is no need to wear those rags.] (187). Ironically, their argument does not stem from Mila's desire to defy Muslim religious law, but from her refusal to break this law despite her new cultural environment and her husband's pleading. Mimoun, who has achieved wealth through his construction business in Catalonia, wants Mila to assimilate in a similar manner by dressing in a more Western manner.

The daughter, who narrates the story, is aware of the intercultural context in which she and her family exist. She refers to her environment as "Mango Street" several times, alluding to Sandra Cisnero's 1984 novel about a Chicano neighborhood in Chicago. As in *L'Últim Patriarca*, a major theme of *The House on Mango Street* is the male mistreatment of other family members. And as in Cisneros's novel, the protagonist crafts a new identity for herself through the space of fiction that reflects the hybrid nature of her life in Catalonia. A significant dimension of that new identity is her split from the patriarchal culture in which she grows up. At one point, when the narrator accompanies her parents back to Morocco, she observes that her father is most dominant back in their nation of origin, stating, "[Mimoun] se sentaba entre todas ellas y era más poderoso que nunca" (253) [[Mimoun] sat among them and was more powerful than ever]. In Morocco, he wields much more power than in Spain, sustained by their family members. In Spain, however, his patriarchal authority is not as certain; Mimoun's relationship with his daughter exemplifies this fact.

The anonymous protagonist recognizes that she is living through a crisis, "aún era incapaz de reconocer como de *identidad*" (272, *my emphasis*) [I was not yet able to recognize

it was one of *identity*]. She has a plethora of experiences that set her apart from both her Catalan neighbors and her Moroccan background. When she learns that one of their classmates likes her, she details why this is impossible, "A los moros les gustan todas las mujeres, pero especialmente las moras. En cambio, a los de aquí no les tenían que gustar nunca las moras" (247) [Moorish men like all types of women, but especially Moorish ones. However, men here don't have to like Moorish women ever.]. She views interethnic desire as possible only in the way that she has seen it in her own life, through her father's numerous Spanish mistresses. Moroccan women, on the other hand, like her mother, can only marry Moroccans and definitely cannot date Spanish men. The Moroccan students in *L'Últim Patriarca* are also very different from the protagonist. She states that girls like herself began to disappear throughout her high school years, girls who ended up with several children, who never learned how to draft an essay because their days consist of keeping house and feeding their children. And when they travel to Morocco, the protagonist feels similarly displaced. She states, "A mí todo aquello me hizo gracia al principio, pero pronto tuve ganas de volver ya a casa. Se suponía que ése era el lugar del mundo que debería serme más familiar, pero a mí se me hacía un nudo cuando oscurecía" (253) [Everything was cute to me at first, but soon, I felt like going back home. You would think that this was the one place on earth where I would feel most at home, but a knot developed in me once it got dark]. And unlike her relatives who recognize her father as an authority figure unquestioningly, the protagonist rebels against her father's laws. She refuses to be cloistered and wants to further her education. This deviation from her father's rules culminates with a clandestine marriage that her father does not permit.

The protagonist falls in love with a Moroccan immigrant who loafs around, dabbles in drug-dealing, and has not achieved any success in Spain. When they discuss marriage, the protagonist informs him that she has begun to take classes at the university, and she would like to finish her studies. Her boyfriend says he doesn't see anything wrong with this, and the narrator is astonished, "Yo me sentí conmovida de que un hombre nacido en el mismo lugar que todos nosotros pudiera ser tan diferente de padre" (299) [I was moved that a man born in the same place as us could be so different from my father]. This difference between her lazy, open-minded suitor and her old-fashioned, ruthless father entices the narrator. Yet, she knows that she cannot be seen in public with her lover as this would confirm what her father begins to suspect with her continual library visits and spontaneous jogs, that his daughter is seeing a man without his permission, or, following her father's beliefs, that she is a whore (298). The narrator's decision to continue seeing her boyfriend, even after her father rejects his marriage proposal, reflects her resolution to live as she desires, despite his laws and customs. This dis-identification with her father's law positions her between the Catalan and the Moroccan world, in the hybrid identity she has been building throughout *L'Últim Patriarca*.[5]

When her father learns that she has had sex with her boyfriend, the marriage is inevitable. The protagonist insinuates that her own union will differ from the sort of marriages that usually occur in her culture. She says that in her culture, women are transferred from a paternal authority to a spousal one. She rejoices in the fact that her cunning and violent father will no longer wield power over her. She also boasts that "El pacto con mi marido era de igual a igual" [the pact with my husband was one made between equals] and refers to him as her "compañero" [partner] (324). This phrase mirrors the

equality that she believes will characterize her marriage, a sort of equality that did not exist in her own household, where her father domesticated and violently dominated her mother. The space of Catalonia, in providing the narrator with a comprehensive education and in allowing her to witness a multiplicity of relationships perhaps contributed to the way in which her marriage is envisioned. And with this marriage, Mimoun must accept that his favorite daughter disobeyed him and no longer submits herself to his patriarchal authority.

When the marriage fails, the protagonist's next steps continue and amplify this initial dis-identification with the established customs of her Moroccan upbringing. She attains total liberty, which she expresses as the ability to decide (330). The protagonist decides to rent an apartment and to earn money by working as a server in a restaurant until she graduates. Her parents cannot comprehend why she would want to live like this. The most obvious step following a failed marriage is to return home, where she would again be subject to her father's authority. The protagonist's refusal to do so marks a new moment in her life and in her family's history. She admits that her situation elides "toda la tradición, a todo el orden establecido" (331) [all tradition, the entire established order]. Again, the reader recognizes the fundamentality of the European nation-state in which the Driouch family lives to this subversion of the patriarchal order and to the "liberation" the narrator claims she attains toward the end of the novel.

El Hachmi's work manifests the concern with positioning the Other in the multicultural nation and the ways in which immigrants are included or excluded in Spanish society. The author in both texts remarks on her position as a writer, as someone who wants to devour the Catalan language and use it to create literature. This is important, as she also refers to Cisneros's *The House on Mango Street* and the film version of Alice Walker's *The*

Color Purple in *L'Últim Patriarca*. In these two American texts, as in El Hachmi's novel, the women protagonists are minorities who grapple with their identities. The ways in which *Jo també sóc catalana* echoes with these American works evinces El Hachmi's capacity for what Martín-Márquez terms "border thinking" (*Disorientations* 346). Like Gloria Anzaldúa's *Borderlands – La Frontera*, which is radical in aiming to destroy the border and therefore, the relationship of domination intrinsic to the notion of separation the border suggests, El Hachmi is able to deconstruct monolithic identity constructions and painfully able to embrace the defamiliarizing aspect of her cultural hybridity.

El Hachmi's work shows how immigrants are agents of change and how immigrants themselves are changed through migration. In addition, her work shows how national identity is questioned, modified, or solidified through the presence of the migrant. Indeed, in this and in the other texts I analyze in this chapter, the question of how/where to position women immigrants is tantamount. Her aim in *Jo també sóc catalana* is to free herself from her "designated origins," yet as Martín-Márquez observes, she leaves her audience with "more" as opposed to "nothing" of Morocco (*Disorientations* 354). Key to her Catalan identity are her roots in Morocco and the confluence of these two national identities as the result of migration. In *L'Últim Patriarca*, the author oscillates between a Catalonian and a Moroccan identity, without being able to identify with her Catalonian neighbors nor with her Moroccan friends who end up leaving school while she goes on to university studies. The act of migration, in facilitating this transformation negates a seamless construction of the subject that national identities often imagine themselves to be. By mentioning the historic disdain for Catalan, she charts the forms of plurality that Spain has had to deal with in recent history.

The Moroccan immigrants constitute a novel form of difference the Spanish nation will have to consider when imagining itself.

Difference and Abjection in *Agua con sal*

The transnational narratives I have analyzed thus far largely present women who remain in Spain and are placed at various locations within Spanish sociality. Women are also expelled from society when their alterity proves too much for the Spanish social body to assume. This occurred in the narratives of prostitution analyzed in the previous chapter. Indeed, all of the prostitutes in the previous chapter were contained, which as Hage reminds us, does not necessarily entail exclusion, but positioning and management within a culture (133). Following this containment, these characters eventually died or returned home in the narratives, which evinces their inassimilability and the need for them to be removed from the Spanish social body. In Pedro Pérez Rosado's film *Agua con sal*, an immigrant who is not a sex worker migrates to Spain and cannot be incorporated into the Spanish social body. Her expulsion must be articulated through her alterity. The processes of expulsion at work in *Agua con sal* mirror Julia Kristeva's theory of abjection.

Kristeva's theory of abjection elaborated in her *Powers of Horror* indicates the importance of the feminine body in processes of signification. She defines the abject as the human reaction to the threatened breakdown in meaning caused by the loss of distinction between subject and object, or between the self and the other. In short, "abjection preserves... the immemorial violence with which a body becomes separated from another body in order to be" (*Horror* 10). The processes of abjection are useful analytical tools in analyzing cinema related to immigration since abjection in itself is concerned with "what disturbs identity,

system, order. What does not respect borders, positions, rules" (*Horror* 4). Just as Kristeva asserts that we abject the maternal, in order to establish ourselves as individuals, one can perceive an analogous process in the abjection of the female immigrants in these films as to maintain a fixed sense of national identity. I coordinate Kriseteva's conceptualization with both race and gender theory to attain a clearer understanding of the representation of the recent phenomenon of women immigrants in contemporary Spain. The utilization of bodies and processes of expulsion crafts a fixed national identity that refutes the fragmentation of Spain in a culturally pluralistic society through immigration and through the circulation of alternative cultures. This disjointed Spain can be most easily remedied by casting out these foreign elements. Nonetheless, some acceptable components of local culture, the ones the blend an ostensibly Spanish identity mixed with regional flavors, are embraced. This not only explains characters like the vocal cosmopolitan prostitute in *Princesas* who is recuperated into her family unit, but also naturalized foreign women like Patricia who espouse a Spanish ideal, peppered with her Dominican background.

For Kristeva, abjection is "productive of culture" (*Horror* 45). It is one aspect of the process of individualization and self-constitution per Freudian psychoanalytical theory. Unlike the uncanny, which transforms what was once familiar into something separate and loathsome, the abject is opposed to *I* and is ambiguous, shady, and generally unknown. At its most extreme point, abjection signals death; it is what is "within the body, yet *inassimilable* and monstrous" (*Horror* 11; my emphasis). The abject is represented when the division between what is internal to the body and external to it becomes unclear, or when the boundary between life and death is destabilized. "Corporeal waste, menstrual blood, or everything that is assimilated to them… represent [metaphorically] the objective frailty of the

symbolic order" (*Horror* 70). This frailty in the symbolic order is analogous to the frailty of the geographical border in this study. When outsiders cross on the national border, the distinction between the *I* and the other becomes tenuous. The inassimilable other becomes perceivable in the national body. The breakdown of international borders inherently suggests the abject, which, according to Kristeva, "persists as an *exclusion* or taboo… but drifts over to secondary forms such as transgression (of the Law)" (*Horror* 39). The act of migration, represented in *Agua con sal* as an illegal act signals the particulars of abjection as an instance of subject formation that upsets the symbolic order, through the menacing and foreboding reminder of the inassimilable within the subject (nation, in this case) and its subsequent variants of defilement and taboo or sin in a religious context.

In Kristeva, the abject seems to be a cultural universal, unconscious and outside the realm of will. The abject, furthermore, can be displaced on to particular subjects through processes of abjection—that signify the participation of a will to abject. For Kristeva, woman is the "other without a name," the primeval essence which culture opposes (*Horror* 58). Like the immigrant body, the feminine body is "desirable and terrifying, nourishing and murderous, fascinating and abject" and both are consequently signified by defilement and bodily excrement (*Horror* 54). Thus, in the portrayal of both the feminine body and of the immigrant body, there seems to be a will to abject, that is, to present them as outside of the Law and sociality, to demonstrate their alterity, to terrify and to fascinate the audience with their experiences.

Agua con sal's usage of the feminine immigrant's body constitutes a sort of double abjection; the film surreptitiously reveals the primitive, the corporeal, the inassimilable—the abject—through which the women immigrant is articulated. Throughout this film, scenes of

defilement or bodily decay and/or abuse in which the border between the internal and external of the body is ambiguous signal the similarly ambiguous disintegration of the national body. The latter body has been made seemingly impure by these characters owing to their femininity, the primeval and primitive essence, and their racial and cultural difference, the inassimilable. Circumstances within these texts of metaphorical death or its manifestations signify the wounds that women immigrants inflict on the national body in refusing to respect Spain's geographical borders and the established, masculine culture contained within them. In *Agua con sal*, the Spanish character, Mari Jo, repeatedly debases and lowers herself, most often sexually, in the film; she sells herself and she receives several insults from her married Puerto Rican lover. This symbolic defilement of Mari Jo transmits society's defilement or woundedness, that is, the sickly state of Spain I discussed in the previous chapter. Like the prostitutes expelled in the previous chapter, the immigrant woman in the film, are similarly removed from the Spanish body for it to thrive. Such forms of being that deviate from the national project represent a sort of death inside, death that serves as a contagion and sickens those around them and death that must be shed through abjection for sociality to endure. This link to death explains why imagery of bodily decay and horror freely circulate in transnational narratives about women immigrants.

The opening establishing shot of *Agua con sal* takes place at Madrid's airport, indicating the protagonist's recent arrival to Spain. Olga informs the immigration official that she has come from Cuba through a scholarship to study abroad. Moments later, there is a flash-forward to an elderly woman in agony. Olga is not a student, but working as a caregiver for this woman. In numerous scenes in the film, Olga cares for this sick, dying woman who also suffers from dementia. While Olga's body is not the site of suffering in this

instance, her proximity to the dying woman is significant. In addition, Olga and an internal immigrant share shifts caring for this nearly dead being.

Olga has three jobs: caring for the sick woman, waiting tables at a tapas bar, and crafting and assembly line work at a furniture factory. Her first day on the job, she chats with other immigrants in Russian, displaying that she is very educated, a fact already intimated with the scholarship she supposedly received to study abroad. Olga is the personified death inside that must be expelled to achieve national cohesion, again constructed through the family unit. The factory-workers are primarily female, and the rough work is apparent on their hands. Olga recommends water with salt to soothe her colleagues' weathered skin. The repeated portrayal of Olga as a caregiver reinforces the motif of her being surrounded by sickness. These women's bodies are being destroyed by the work they perform in the factory. Most of the women are immigrants, except Mari Jo. She is crude in her manners, moonlights as a prostitute, and regularly visits her incarcerated sister—her sole reason for remaining in the small, stagnant town. Mari Jo works with Olga and lives in her building. As in other transnational narratives, an immigrant and a native Spaniard are positioned together; proximity and shared work experience facilitate the friendship that will develop between the two women. This juxtaposition of an immigrant with a national subject serves to demonstrate the similarities and the even greater differences between these two, with the immigrant often serving as a counterpoint to the national subject.In *Flores de otro mundo*, Patricia is also contrasted with Milady, to emphasize her goodness and suitability for marriage. As in these films, Olga and Mari Jo's relationship will convey which national subjects and immigrants are desirable in contemporary Spain and what they ought to learn from one another.

Olga visits Mari Jo with water and salt in a bowl and cleanses her hands. She calls it a saints' remedy, signaling Olga's dedication to the Catholic faith. Olga's faith is spectacularized in the film, however, through her altar of orishas. Upon arriving in Spain, the customs official asks her about these orishas she's carrying, and she explains that they protect her, which amuses him. Her altar features saints' statues, a coconut, a bottle of rum, and candles. Throughout the movie, she addresses the coconut as her favorite saint. In one scene, she screams violently at the coconut, swigs rum, and laments her horrific living situation in Spain. Santería, a syncretic form of Catholicism, serves to distinguish her faith, superstitious and odd, from a more traditional Catholicism practiced in Spain. Shohat and Stam elaborate a rather long list of Eurocentric, Western hierarchies that serve to the detriment of African religions (202); in the film, Olga's religious practices share several of the characteristics they mention. Her practices are polytheistic, superstitious rather than scientific, corporeal, and insufficiently sublimated. Olga's syncretism manifests multiculturalism in blending European and African religious beliefs; yet, this religious multiculturalism consists of a sort of hybrid Catholicism too contaminated by Africanness, portrayed as inassimilable within Spanish culture. While this sort of cultural hybridity rooted in Catholicism ought to exemplify the sort of regional flavor that actually lauds an ostensibly Spanish identity, her syncretism and her numerous gods displayed on her altar instead convey an alterity that cannot blend with Spanish culture.

Olga is also a tireless worker, another trait that ought to indicate that she is an ideal candidate for assimilation. Yet, Olga is frustrated by the demands of her three jobs, which impede her from studying. In addition, the chemicals that she uses to finish the pieces of furniture affect her health. As mentioned above, physical infirmity connotes the immigrant's

literal inability to survive in the Spanish landscape. Olga is not only surrounded by death when she nurses the ailing Spaniard, but also harbors death in her body, which has been poisoned by the harsh chemicals she inhales at her job in the factory.

Olga's relationship with Mari Jo provides more scenes characterized by tranquility and even, joy. Olga provides Mari Jo a heretofore absent interlocutor with whom to share her dreams, hopes, fears, etc. One key scene illustrates the profound extent to which Olga provides Mari Jo a voice. Mari Jo and Johnny, the married, Puerto Rican foreman at the factory, have had an affair, and she has become pregnant with his child. She tells Johnny that she has something to tell him, but later falters; and it is Olga who must bear the perturbing news. Johnny rejects Mari Jo, insisting that he refuses to have a family with a prostitute. Nevertheless, Mari Jo is imbued with a new sense of hope, of being able to give her unborn child an honorable and decent life. Olga has provided Mari Jo with the strength and inspiration to continue on, yet, the immigrant does not have sufficient strength to lead the emotionally and physically taxing life of an illegal immigrant in Spain.

In *Agua con sal's* film's coda, it is Olga who addresses the immigration officials at the airport. When he observes that she has overstayed her visa, she defiantly asks if he is going to allow her to pass or if he would prefer that she stay. He stamps her passport begrudgingly, and she returns to Cuba, clutching photos of herself with Mari Jo. Mari Jo, in turn, visits her sister in jail. Her sister, who had previously refused Mari Jo's gifts owing to their futility given her circumstances, is now wearing the watch her sister bought her. They press their hands on the glass separating them, and the sister chastises Mari Jo for thinking that her baby might be a male. The sister affirms that it will have to be a girl, just like them. Once more, the immigrant's departure is connected to the recuperation of the Spanish family.

Olga has assisted in solidifying the Spanish family unit, a process that culminates with her return to Cuba.

Olga's experiences in *Agua con sal* reflect the abject in relation to death and the breakdown of the human body. The film also portrays a certain level of grittiness that heightens the idea of defilement and unclear borders. One such example is the sound in the film. The various modes of transportation Olga takes reverberate loudly in the background and often impede communication between her and other characters. The bus engines, train whistles, etc. cause a noticeable degree of commotion among the characters. The spaces Olga inhabits are sordid, and her apartment has an irreparable sewage problem. The overflow stains the floors and emits a putrid odor. The movie also portrays several scenes of bodily functions, such as vomiting and urinating, which signal a sort of base corporeality that makes experiencing this film rather unpleasant. The discomfort *Agua con sal* conveys mirrors Laura Marks' notion of haptic visuality as outlined in *The Skin of the Film*. In this work, Marks posits that cinema can create a sensual experience of many sides. The sensual experience of *Agua con sal* coheres around an uneasiness and displeasure that is linked to the immigrant experience. The image of the decaying feminine body is embedded in the mind of the viewer from the onset of the film, in the figures of Olga and in her dying patient, and is only reversed upon Olga's return to her homeland, which symbolizes both Mari Jo's and Olga's reconstitution, the latter only being possible once she has returned to Cuba.

In *Agua con sal*, Mari Jo assumes an ambiguous role in which she flirts with the exterior identity of the other. In the beginning of the film, Mari Jo blindfolds one of her clients and seduces him, telling him to imagine that she is a black woman. These flirtations with the other's outward image perhaps signify the interior crisis she faces, a crisis

perpetuated in these transnational films by the changing nature of the Spanish nation and the rather recent increase in foreign immigration. On a greater plane, these crises are evinced in her fragile, convoluted relationship with her families. This troublesome notion of self translates into assuming the other's image, leading to the collapse of the family unit, which often serves as a microcosm for the nation.

Friendship with the other enriches Mari Jo's knowledge of herself and her relationship to the world. As in other transnational narratives, Olga explains and demystifies her culture for Mari Jo. For example, Mari Jo is shocked to learn that Olga is Cuban since she is not a *mulata*. Olga teaches Mari Jo that not all Cubans are blacks and mulattoes, and she also tells her about the beauty of Cuba and its beaches. This process of demystification presupposes a certain level of intelligence on the part of the immigrant, which is denied in other circumstances. A lack of access to rationality related to superstition characterizes Olga, while Mari Jo's stereotypical views or cultural misunderstandings are easily rectified via friendship. While friendship constitutes a unification of sorts, the film's ending is somewhat divisive in Olga's return to Cuba. Yet, this return allows for the resolution of Mari Jo's personal and familial crisis, thus alluding to the resolution of the larger, national crisis. The Spaniard has a clearer understanding of the other and consequently the self. As Kristeva states, referring to the feminine, specifically maternal body, the separation from the other—fascinating and abject, nourishing and murderous—is critical to the assertion of the self. In other words, the division between Mari Jo and Olga women fosters a notion of identity ultimately freed from the appealing horror of the other.

In *Agua con sal*, the suffering, primitiveness, whimsicality, and hyper-sexuality of the other is depicted to function as a foil to the well-being, modernity, logic, and morality of the

contemporary citizen of the Spanish nation-state. Key to this identification is the *well-being* of the Spanish national who distinguishes between self and other, requiring the expulsion of the other within to enable national life, literally to exist. The rhetorical maneuver, however, is not as overt as expulsion, in which the immigrant is forced out. Like Zule in *Princesas* and Milady in *Flores de otro mundo*, in *Agua con sal*, Olga opts to leave Spain. The scenes of departure, in which their desire to leave is accentuated, are especially significant to these narratives. These women are not expelled, they are not detained; they willfully just go away. We do not know where Milady goes, but Zule and Olga leave Spain. This act removes any suspicion of xenophobia, but reveals an underlying anxiety of difference that negate the ambitious ideals of multiculturalism that circulate in pluralistic societies like Spain.

The texts in this chapter engage how to deal with the presence of women immigrants and position them both physically and discursively or symbolically within Spanish sociality. This presentation of multiculturalism crystallizes around a concept of belonging, of who belongs to the nation and who must be excluded from it so that it may live. Sara Ahmed contemplates how difference is incorporated into the national body, difference imagined as paradoxically vital to the nation (*Strange* 97). A similar process occurs in Spain, where immigration is necessary to increase the birth rate. This positioning of strangers entails imagining the nation in a particular way prior to ascertaining how the immigrant Other can be included or excluded. Yet, even those included are incorporated as difference (Ahmed *Strange* 113). This notion is poignant as those immigrants who are incorporated in many texts I have analyzed do so vis-à-vis a homogenizing sameness. This sameness consists of a monolithic articulation of feminine domesticity in the case of *Flores de otro mundo* and *I love you, baby*. While these women are "different," they possess traits that suggest

"Spanishness," even if they are not from Spain. In the work of Najat El Hachmi, the difficulty in accepting certain forms of difference, such as the mosque, evince how certain manifestations of difference are often co-opted to further national aims.

NOTES

[1] The *pasodoble* is a traditional Spanish dance played at bullfights and during military parades. Milady's aversion to this music represents her aversion to traditional Spanish culture and to the role Carmelo wants her to play as his partner in Santa Eulalia.

[2] The Cuban actress Marilyn Torres plays the roles of Kenya in *I love you, baby* and Milady in *Flores de otro mundo*, providing a sort of recognizable face as a highly sexualized Caribbean immigrant in Spain.

[3] Relationship scenarios similar to those in *I love you, baby* occur in *Cosas que dejé en la Habana* in which a Spanish mother seeks a woman to marry her gay son to keep up appearances. Her son, Javier, ends up marrying a Cuban immigrant whose love and excessive femininity seem to be able to "convert" the son into a heterosexual.

[4] Medrano surveyed a total of 1,212 Spaniards. 21.9% (265 respondents) manifest a Republican national conception with strong ethno-biological content and with politico-territorial content. 29.1% (353 respondents) had a Republican national conception with moderate ethno-biological content and with politico territorial content. And finally, 22% (267) had a Republican national conception with weak ethno-biological content and with politico-territorial content. According to these responses, while the will to be a citizen is important, categories such as a biological background considered "Spanish" and residence in Spain or a connection to the territory are also significant.

[5] Beverly Skeggs studies dis-identification and agency in her study on working class women in London. While not possessing control over external elements of society, these women can control their minds, bodies, and homes, and alter them in was that belie their real class status, as dictated by society. Similarly, the protagonist takes ownership of her life, mixing elements of her Moroccan and Catalan identities, without fully identifying with either.

CONCLUSION: Reconceptualizing Home in Contemporary Spain

In this dissertation, I have examined how gender and national identity intersect in representations of immigrant women. Central to these representations are concepts of the home and how to position these women within the national space in ostensibly domestic or feminine ways. In the first chapter, I assessed women's mobility within the national body, charting both Spanish, or domestic women's mobility, and that of foreign women. The second chapter examines issues of realism and representation, noting the reliance on the sentimental to create a sense of empathy between the foreign women and the Spanish audience who learns about them through documentary narratives. This question also explored the forms of agency possible in such exchanges. The third chapter constructed a genealogy of representations of prostitutes in Spanish literature, anchoring this analysis in nineteenth century naturalist works and extending this inquiry into recent texts on immigrant women prostitutes. The final chapter examined multiculturality as a risky ideal that often positions foreign women in atavistic roles eschewed by national women within the national body. Within these representations and the nationalistic discourses they echo, the role of women in the home is continually reinterpreted.

The reformulation of national space figured through the prism of the home speaks to the fundamentality of the concepts of home and domesticity during colonialism, a process that, in an analogous fashion, crafts domestics and foreigners, colonizers and colonized, and privileged and marginalized classes rooted in fantasies of racial difference, gender difference and national space. This affirms the notion that "nationalisms have typically sprung from masculinized memory, masculinized humiliation and masculinized hope" (Enloe qtd. in McClintock 353). And similarly, the nation is often imagined as a racially pure entity that ought to be protected from all degradation (Balibar in McClintock 353). Further, citing Fanon, McClintock asserts that in the

colonial imagination, the colonizer and colonized are unthinkingly male, and the space to be colonized is perceived as female vis-à-vis analogies of control and domestication. These nationalistic discourses took shape during colonization, as McClintock attests, and explicate women's peculiar symbolic role in broader national projects and their primacy to the home and the private or domestic sphere. Similar processes are at work in Spain today, where immigration, coupled with democratization and European integration, have led to what David Corkill determines to be "a reassessment of national self-perceptions" and "a reformulation of national identity as constructed during the Franco regime" (48). The masculine, pure Spanish nation touted in Francoist discourse of Spain and anti-Spain had been questioned with the advent of democracy; yet, with immigration, as during earlier periods with the negotiation of Gypsies in nationalistic discourse, the young democratic nation was compelled to question how ethnic Others could be situated within Spanish sociality.

Sarah Ahmed notes a "cartographic imperative" that normalizes certain bodies and certain directions (*Phenomenology* 113). The distance from the Other, as a result, stems from this geographic dimension in addition to a concomitant imagining of the Other as far away from home. For Ahmed, this Other can be domesticated, brought into the home space, yet this very act of bringing sustains difference (*Phenomenology* 113). With these assertion, Ahmed effectively surmises the colonial process, in which the colonized Other was brought into the national body, yet positioned marginally within that body. These acts of domestication shape "collective bodies… [and] allows some objects and not others to be within reach" (Ahmed *Phenomenology* 117). These acts of domestication permit the creation of a collective that hinges on home, what can be brought within the home, and those perceived to be "at home."

Gayatri Spivak, building upon Martin Heidegger's concept of "worlding" posits that the seemingly natural earth is transformed through the creation of the "world," complete with historical, political, and economic strife (in Khanna 4-5). In this creation, the colonized world remains concealed to the European metropolis that creates "the world," thereby transforming the colonized other into the "nonself", "the unsayable," and "the concealed" (Khanna 5). This distancing of the metropolis and the self from the colonial Other is possible during colonialism. But, in present times, as the formerly colonized travel to former metropolises, a new dynamic comes into play that destabilizes this paradigm and makes for a reconfiguration of the concept of home.

The concept of home arises in several of the works, in how women are incorporated into the social body and how women are permitted to occupy national space. In Chapter One, Lucia Etxebarria's *Cosmofobia* provides the most strident example in the figure of Susana, who is perceived as foreign to the national home although she is, in fact, a Spanish citizen born to parents from a Spanish territory. She is imagined as a body that is not at home, despite her national identity. Her ethnicity forecloses the possibility of her being imagined as an autochthonous Spaniard, manifesting that the sorts of women who are allowed to reside within the national home space must conform to a specific ethnic identity, affirming Balibar's idea that the nation is a racially pure entity that must be protected from degradation. For the character of Susana, her position within Spanish society is articulated through displacement and foreignness.

The concept of home not only arises to distance the perceived Other from the self, but also to paradoxically situate her in particular ways within the home body. In the documentary films I discussed in Chapter Two, Juan Laguna's *Princesa de África* and Helena Taberna's *Extranjeras*, sentimentality and stereotype function to establish the idea of home as populated

with rather predictable characters on the margins who actually serve to illuminate the characteristics of the self vis-à-vis the negated Other. Stereotype, in turn, creates a "readable" Other, who the self now only encounters superficially, if at all, through a set of conventions that do not adequately transmit the Other's reality. Empathy operates in a way that brings the Other closer to home, yet maintains a degree of distance, recreating the paradigm described by Ahmed to refer to colonial processes. Again, the negotiation of nearness and difference is maintained, reflecting Ahmed's assertions.

In these first two chapters, the neocolonial logic at work in several of the texts serves to create paradoxical proximity and distance between the immigrant Other, in processes analogous to those of colonialism that sought to create a simultaneous closeness and distance from the colonial territories and the colonized. In this instance, the Other resides in the metropolis, posing a unique situation to collective approaches to alterity. The immigrant or ethnic Other is not incorporated into this society, but positioned on the margins in order to sustain the fantasy of a pure national home that is now obliged to house ethnic Others.

The third and fourth chapters treat the specific question of national and non-national women, again elucidating the value placed on home and a neocolonial logic that continues 19th century nationalistic discourses. These chapters address the options for non-national and national women and study the ways in which the domestic sphere and women's roles within it are organized. Chapter Three, specifically examines the prostitute as exemplifying non-national womanhood and Chapter Four reads texts in which women remain, and often marry, in Spain and are seemingly assimilated into the national body. Like the previous two chapters, they also evince an interest in proximity and distance with the immigrant Other. Further, they shed light on

the primacy of domesticity both for colonialism and for the neocolonialism that characterizes representations of immigration in a globalized world.

These chapters manifest the nineteenth century nationalistic claim that the nation is a vast family where women are relegated to the private sphere to carry out the work of social reproduction while men occupy the public sphere. In Spain, domesticity, coupled with motherhood, has been the pivotal characteristic of the cult of true womanhood espoused in the ideal of the "ángel del hogar." Both then and in more present texts, the prostitute is antithetical this character in being a "mujer pública" who is fully available in the public sphere. Prostitutes are portrayed to threaten the national body with disease and wreak havoc on the idea of the national home. Many Spanish women, who are not prostitutes by any means, also contradict this "ángel del hogar" paradigm owing to greater mobility, which allows them to leave the domestic sphere and enter the public sphere. Immigrant women amenable to the notion of filling this void are ostensibly admitted into the national home space through the domestic sphere. Finally, some immigrant women, who are not prostitutes, such as Olga in *Agua con sal* do not conform to these paradigms of femininity and are similarly marginalized and ultimately expelled from the national body, much like the prostitute in nineteenth century works by Eduardo López Bago and in more recent texts that engage foreign prostitutes.

Women who assimilate, like Patricia in *Flores de otro mundo* and Marisol in *I love you, baby*, often conform to atavistic roles of womanhood, increasingly abandoned by Spanish women, who have gained greater mobility in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. Or, like the protagonists in the work of Najat el Hachemi are pressured by their new Spanish neighbors to repudiate or shed elements of the origin culture and to shore up "national capital" as described by Ghassan Hage by embodying cultural forms that typify the destination. Hence, assimilation is

articulated through conforming to a particular form of womanhood, a Spanish womanhood that actualizes the 19th century paradigm of the "ángel del hogar."

For McClintock, race, gender and class are not separate realms of experience, but "articulated" categories that bolster and contradict one another (4). In several of the texts analyzed in *Crossing Borders, Crossing Margins*, contemporary discourses of national identity and gender reflect McClintock's position. The multicultural ideal circulated in pluralistic societies, such as Spain, veils this other process of neocolonialism that aims to enforce a nationalistic fantasy that imagines the nation as homogenous and closed. Ethnic Others serve to further this project, as well. McClintock points out the affinity between the cult of domesticity and the project of imperialism (4). Women, who are relegated to the domestic sphere, are central to such a schema in assisting in the deployment and consolidation of hegemonic power. Domesticity, a putatively private matter guarded by women in the corresponding private sphere is brought to the fore in discourses of assimilation and expulsion. The prostitute's seemingly private affairs merit her exclusion from the national family, and in turn, virtuous women who perform a certain type of "Spanishness" are accepted into Spanish families and consequently, the national family. Domesticity, which, like race, is "central to the definition of middle-classes and to the policing of the dangerous classes" enables a refiguring of the immigrant or ethnic Other (McClintock 4). This reimagining eliminates some of the distance attributed to the Other, as stated above and injects national capital into the immigrant Other, capital that often emerges from reorienting her in a manner aligned with nationalistic fantasies. In short, immigrant women must assume a domestic role the destination envisions for her as a readable Other that confirms suspicions about alterity or as a continuation of antiquated forms of femininity. As in earlier

colonial times, the immigrant serves less to explain herself than to define the Spanish self and to perpetuate hierarchies based on race and gender.

Bibliography

Abraham, Susan. “Strategic Essentialism in Nationalist Discourses: Sketching a Feminist Agenda in the Study of Religion.” *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* 25 (2009): 156-61.

Abrahams, Yvette. “Images of Sara Bartman: Sexuality, Race, and Gender in Early-Nineteenth-Century Britain” Ruth Roach and Nupur Chaudhuri ed. *Nation, Empire, Colony.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1998. 220-236.

Adorno, T.W. “How to Look at Television.” *The Quarterly of Film Radio and Television* 8 (1954): 213-35.

Agua con sal. Dir. Pedro Pérez Rosado. Wanda Visión, S.A., 2006.

Ahmed, Sara. *Queer Phenomenology: Orientations, Objects, Others. Durham*: Duke UP, 2006.

---. *The Cultural Politics of Emotions*. New York: Routledge, 2004.

---. *Strange Encounters: Embodied Others in Post-Coloniality*. New York: Routledge, 2000.

Alcoff, Linda. “The Problem of Speaking for Others.” *Cultural Critique* 20 (1991-2): 5-32.

Amago, Samuel. “Lesbian Desire and Related Matters in Carmen Laforet’s *Nada*.” *Neophilologus* 86 (2002): 65-86.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Refelctions on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*. London and New York: Verso, 1991.

Anzaldúa, Gloria. *Borderlands*. San Francisco: Aunt Lute Books, 1999.

Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1996.

Appiah, Kwame Anthony. *Cosmopolitanism: Ethics in a World of Strangers*. New York: W.W. Norton and Co., 2006.

---. *Race, Culture, Identity: Misunderstood Connections.* Tanner Public Lectures On Human Values Delivered at University of California, San Diego. 1994 http://www.tannerlectures.utah.edu/lectures/documents/Appiah96.pdf

Arias, Arturo. "Authoring Ethnicized Subjects: Rigoberta Menchú and the Performative Production of the Subaltern Self." *PMLA* 116 (2001): 75-88.

Association for Borderland Studies. Home Page. 25 Feb. 2010. <http://www.absborderlands.org/>

Balibar, Etienne, and Immanuel Wallerstein. *Race, Nation and Class*. London and New York: Verso, 1991.

Ballesteros, Isolina. "Embracing the other: The Feminization of Spanish 'Immigration Cinema'." *Studies in Hispanic Cinema* 2.1 (2005): 3-14.

---. "Screening African Immigration to Spain: *Las cartas de Alou* and *Bwana*." *Chasqui* 2 (2005): 48-61.

Barthes, Roland. *Camera Lucida*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1981.

---. "Rhetoric of the Image." *Classic Essays on Photography.* 259-86.

Bazin, André. "The Ontology of the Photographic Image." *Classic Essays on Photography.* 237-44.

Benito, Nieves García. *Por la vía de Tarifa*. Madrid: Editorial Calambur, 2000.

Benjamin, Walter. "A Short History of Photography." *Classic Essays on Photography*.

269-86.

Bergner, Gwen. “Who Is That Masked Woman? or, The Role of Gender in Fanon's *Black Skin, White Masks*.” *PMLA* 110.1 (January 1995): 75-88.

Berlant, Lauren. *The Female Complaint*. Durham: Duke UP, 2008.

---. “The Female Complaint.” *Social Text* 19-20 (1988): 237-59.

--- and Michael Warner. “Sex in Public.” *Critical Inquiry* 24.2 (1998): 547-66.

Bermúdez, Silvia. “Let’s Talk About Sex? From Almudena Grandes to Lucía Etxebarria, the Volatile Values of the Spanish Literary Market.” *Women’s Narrative and Film in Twentieth-Century Spain*. Ed. Ofelia Ferrán and Kathleen M. Glenn. New York: Routledge, 2002. 223-37.

Beverley, John. “Anatomía del testimonio.” *Revista de Crítica Latinoamericana* 13 (1987): 7-16.

Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture*. London and New York: Routledge, 1994.

---. *Nation and Narration*. London and New York: Routledge, 1990.

Bost, Suzanne. *Mulattas and Mestizas*. Athens: U of Georgia P, 2003.

Burshatin, Israel. “The Moor in the Text: Metaphor, Emblem, and Silence” *‘Race,’ Writing and Difference.* Ed. Henry Louis Gates, Jr. Chicago and London: U of Chicago P, 1986. 117-37.

Butler, Judith. *Undoing Gender*. New York: Routledge, 2004.

---. *Bodies That Matter*. New York: Routledge, 1993.

---. *Gender Trouble*. New York: Routledge, 1990.

Bwana. Dir. Imanol Uribe. Aurum, 1996.

Canclini, Néstor. *Hybrid Cultures: Strategies for Entering and Leaving Modernity*.

Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1995.

Cartas de Alou. Dir. Martxo Armendáriz. Elías Querejetas Producciones Cinematográficas S.L., 1990

Carr, Robert et. al. "Re-presentando el testimonio: Notas sobre el cruce divisorio primer mundo/tercer mundo." *Revista de Crítica Latinoamericana* 18 (1992): 75-96.

Carrasco-Urgoiti, María Soledad. *The Moorish Novel*. Boston: Twayne, 1976.

Charnon-Deutsch, Lou. *The Spanish Gypsy: The History of a European Obsession*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004.

---. "Exoticism and the Politics of Difference in Late Nineteenth-Century Spanish Periodicals." *Culture and Gender in Nineteenth-Century Spain*. Ed. Lou Charnon-Deutsch and Jo Labanyi. London: Oxford University Press, 1995.

Checa y Olmos, Francisco ed. *Mujeres en el camino: El fenómeno de la migración femenina en España.* Barcelona: Icaria, 2005.

Chow, Rey. *The Protestant Ethnic*. New York: Columbia UP, 2002.

Colmeiro, José. "Exorcising Exoticism: *Carmen* and the Construction of Oriental Spain." *Comparative Literature* 54.2 (2002): 127-45.

Cornejo-Parriego, Rosalía. "Espacios híbridos, iconos mestizos: imaginando la España global." *Letras Peninsulares* 15.3 (2002-03): 515-31.

Cosas que dejé en la Habana. Dir. Manuel Gutiérrez Aragón. Cinemateca, 2005.

Dean, Carolyn. "Empathy, Pornography, Suffering." *differences* 14.1 (2001): 88-124.

de Diego, Estrella. "Staged Ethnicity, Acted Modernity: Identity and Representation in Spanish Visual Culture." *Post-Authoritarian Cultures* Ed. Luis Martin-Estudillo and Roberto Ampuero. Nashville: Vanderbilt UP 1999. 175-95.

Diez Medrano, Juan. “Nation, Citizenship, and Immigration in Contemporary Spain.” *International Journal on Multicultural Societies* 7.2 (2005): 133-56.

Dittgen, Herbert. “World Without Borders? Reflections on the Future of the Nation State.” *Government and Opposition* 34.2 (1999): 161-79.

Doane, Mary Ann. “Woman’s Stake: Filming the Female Body.” *October* 17 (1981): 22-36.

Dorrega, Carlos. “From Lagos to Lago.” *Inmenso Estrecho II: Cuentos sobre inmigración.* Ed. José Ovejero. Madrid: Kailas Ficción, 2008.

Dramé, Kandioura. “Léopold Senghor: Introductory Notes.” *Callaloo* 13 (1990): 11-3.

Duffy Jr., John J. “Diversions: The Structure of Marginality in *Nana*.” *Nineteenth-Century French Studies* 27.3-4 (1999): 363-383.

El Hachmi, Najat. *Jo també sóc catalana*. Barcelona: Columna, 2008.

---. *L’últim patriarca*. Madrid: Planeta, 2008.

En la puta vida. Dir. Beatriz Flores Silva. Venevision, 2004.

Etxebarria, Lucía. *Cosmofobia*. Barcelona: Ediciones Destino, 2008.

---. *Beatriz y los cuerpos celestes*. Barcelona: Ediciones Destino, 1998.

Extranjeras. Dir. Helena Taberna. Lamia Productions, 2003.

Fanon, Frantz. *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove Press, 2008.

---. “Algeria Unveiled.” *The New Left Reader*. New York: Grove Press, 1969. 161-85.

Farmer, Tessa. “Agency and Illiberal Others: A Retrospective Review of Mahmood’s *Politics of Piety*.” *Text, Practice, Performance* 8 (2009): 53-8.

Felman, Shoshana and Dori Laub. *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History*. New York: Routledge, 1992.

Fernández, Pura. *Mujer pública y vida privada: Del arte eunuco a la novela lupanaria*. Rochester: Tamesis, 2008.

---. "Introduction." *La Prostituta*. Sevilla: Editorial Renacimiento, 2005. 21-30.

Flesler, Daniela. *The Return of the Moor*. West Lafayette: Purdue UP, 2008.

Flores de otro mundo. Dir. Iciar Bollaín. Image Entertainment, 1999.

Foucault, Michel. "The Eye of Power." *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977 by Michel Foucault.* Ed. C. Gordon. Sussex: Harvester Press, 1980. 146-165.

---. *The History of Sexuality Volume I: An Introduction* Trans. Robert Hurley. New York: Vintage Books, 1978.

Freud, Sigmund. "The Uncanny." *The Standard Edition of the Complete Works of Sigmund Freud* (SE). Vol. 17. London: Hogarth and the Institute of Pyschoanalysis, 1955: 219-256.

Fuchs, Barbara. *Exotic Spain*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2008.

Fusco, Coco. *English is Broken Here*. New York: The New Press, 1995.

Gaines, Jane. "White Privilege and Looking Relations." *Cultural Critique* 4 (1986): 59-79.

Gilman, Sander. "Black Bodies, White Bodies: Toward an Iconography of Female Sexuality in Late Nineteenth-Century Art, Medicine, and Literature" *Critical Inquiry*12 (1985): 204-242.

Gordon, Avery F. *Ghostly Matters: Haunting and the Sociological Imagination*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1997.

Graham, Helen. "Gender and the State: Women in the 1940s." *Spanish Cultural Studies:*

An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity. 182-95.

--- and Jo Labanyi ed. *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1995.

--- and Antonio Sánchez. "The Politics of 1992." *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity*. 406-18.

Grassilli, Mariagiulia. "Festes, Ferias and Hip-Hop: Images of Multiculturalism in Barcelona." *The Mediterranean Passage: Migration and New Cultural Encounters in Southern Europe*. Ed. Russell King. Liverpool: Liverpool UP, 2001. 66-94.

Grosz, Elizabeth. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1994.

Hage, Ghassan. *White Nation: Fantasies of White Supremacy in a Multicultural Society*. London and New York: Routledge, 2000.

Hall, Stuart. *Stuart Hall: Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*. London and New York: Routledge, 1996.

---. *Representations: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London: Sage Publications, 1997

Hardt, Michael and Antonio Negri. *Empire*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 2001.

Hauser, Philiph. *Madrid bajo el punto de vista médico-social*. Madrid : Editora Nacional, D.L. 1979.

Higginbotham, Virgina. "Nada and the Cinderella Syndrome." *Rendezvous* 22.2 (1986): 17-25.

Hill Collins, Patricia. *The Sexual Politics of Black Womanhood*. New York: Routledge,

2000.

hooks, bell. *Reel to Real: Race, Sex, and Class at the Movies*. New York: Routledge, 1996.

Howard, June. "What Is Sentimentality?" *American Literary History* 11.1 (1999): 63-81.

I Love You Baby. Dir. Alfonso Albacete and David Menkes. Strand Releasing, 2003.

Ilegal. Dir. Ignacio Vilar. Productaro Faro Lerez S.L., 2003.

Jordan, Barry. "Laforet's *Nada* as Female Bildung." *Symposium* 46 (1992): 105-18.

Joseph, Miranda. *Against the Romance of Community*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 2002.

Kaplan, Anne. *Looking For the Other*. New York: Routledge, 1997.

Khanna, Ranjana. *Dark Continents: Psychoanalysis and Colonialism*. Durham: Duke UP, 2003.

Kim, Yeon-Soo. *The Family Album: Histories, Subjectivities, and Immigration in Contemporary Spanish Culture.* Cranbury, NJ: Rosemont Publishing, 2005.

---. "Bearing Witness to the Death of an African Immigrant in Nieves García Benito's "Cailcedrat." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 5.3 (2004): 301-15.

Koshy, Susan. *Sexual Naturalization: Asian Americans and Miscegenation*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 2004.

Kristeva, Julia. *Strangers to Ourselves*. Trans. Leon S. Roudiez. New York: Columbia UP, 1991.

---. *The Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*. Trans. Leon S. Roudiez. New York: Columbia UP, 1982.

Labanyi, Jo. "Introduction: Engaging with Ghosts; or Theorizing Culture in Modern

Spain." *Constructing Identity in Contemporary Spain: Theoretical Debates and Cultural Practice*. Ed Jo Labanyi. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2002. 1–15.

LaCapra, Dominick. *Writing History, Writing Trauma*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 2001.

Laforet, Carmen. *Nada*. Barcelona: Ediciones Destino, 1995.

Lalami, Laila. *Esperanza y otros sueños*. D.F.: Grupo Oceano, 2006.

Lalioutou, Ioanna. "'I Want to See the World': Mobility and Subjectivity in the European Context. *Women Migrants from East to West*. Ed. Luisa Passerini, Dawn Lyon, Enrica Capussotti, and Ionna Lalioutou. Oxford: Berghan Books, 2007.

Landry, Donna and Gerald MacLean Ed. *The Spivak Reader: Selected Works of Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak*. New York : Routledge, 1996.

Ledger, Sally. "Naturalism: 'Dirt and Horror Pure and Simple.'" *Adventures in Realism*. Ed. Matthew Beaumont. Malden: Blackwell Publishing, 2007.

Lewis, Reina. *Rethinking Orientalism: Women, Travel and the Ottoman Harem*. New York: I.B. Tauris and Co., Ltd., 2004.

Linhard, Tabea Alexa. "Between Hostility and Hospitality: Immigration in Contemporary Spain." *MLN* 122.2 (2007): 400-22

López Bago, Eduardo. *La prostituta*. Sevilla: Editorial Renacimento, 2005.

---. *La pálida*. Madrid: Alvarez Impresores, 1885.

Mahmood, Saba. *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2005.

Mahoney, Elisabeth. "'The People in Parentheses': Space Under Pressure in the

Postmodern City." *The Cinematic City* Ed. David B. Clark. New York: Routledge, 1997. 169-185.

Mar-Molinero, Claire. "The Politics of Language: Spain's Minority Languages." *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity*. 336-41.

Mariscal, George. "The Role of Spain in Contemporary Race Theory." *Arizona Journal of Hispanic Cultural Studies* 2 (1998): 7-22.

Martí Olivella, Jaume. "Cuba and Spanish Cinema's Transatlantic Gaze." *Arizona Journal of Hispanic Cultural Studies* 5 (2001): 161-76.

---. "Touristic Trades and Neocolonial Subjects: Subplotting/ Sexploiting Women in Spain." *Spain is Still Different*. Ed. Eugenia Afinoguénova and Jaume Martí Olivella. Lanham: Lexington Books, 2008. 245-267.

Martín-Cabrera, Luis. "Postcolonial Memories and Racial Violence in *Flores de otro mundo*." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 3.1 (2002): 43-55.

Martín-Márquez, Susan. *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity*. New Haven: Yale UP, 2008.

---. "A World of Difference in Home-Making: The Films of Icíar Bollaín." *Women's Narrative and Film in Twentieth-Century Spain*. Ed. Ofelia Ferrán and Kathleen M. Glenn. New York: Routledge, 2002. 256-72.

Martínez-Carazo, Cristina. "Cine e inmigración: Madrid como espacio de encuentro/desencuentro y su representación en *Extranjeras* de Helena Taberna." *Hispanic Research Journal: Iberian and Latin American Studies* 6.3 (2005): 265-75.

Mbembe, Achille. *On the Postcolony*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: U of California P,

2001.

Mestre i Mestre. Ruth M. “Trabajadores de cuidado. Las mujeres de la Ley de Extranjería.” Francisco Checa y Olmos ed. *Mujeres en el camino: El fenómeno de la migración femenina en España.* Barcelona: Icaria, 2005. 139-68.

McClintock, Anne. *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in Colonial Contest*. London and New York: Routledge, 1995.

Mohanty, Chandra Talpade. *Feminism Without Borders: Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity.* Durham, NC: Duke UP, 2003.

Molina Gavilán, Yolanda and Di Salvo, Thomas J. “Policing Spanish/European Borders: Xenophobia and Racism in Contemporary Spanish Cinema.” *Ciberletras* 5 (2001). 8 Feb. 2010. <http://www.lehman.cuny.edu/ciberletras/v05/molina.html>

Monegal, Antonio. “A Landscape of Relations: Peninsular Multiculturalism and the Avatars of Comparative Literature.” *Spain Beyond Spain: Modernity, Literary History, and National Identity*. Ed. Brad Epps and Luis Fernández Cifuentes. Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2005. 231–49.

Monlau, Felipe. *Elementos de higiene pública*. Barcelona: Imprenta de D. Pablo Riera, 1847.

Mulvey, Laura. “Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema.” *Film Theory and Criticism: Introductory Readings*. Eds. Leo Braudy and Marshall Cohen. New York: Oxford UP, 1999: 833-44.

Muñoz Lorente, Gerardo. *Ramito de Hierbabuena*. Barcelona: Plaza & Janes, S.A., 2001.

Nair, Parvati. “Autography from the Margins: Photography, Collective Self-

Representation and the Disturbance of History." *Hispanic Research* Journal 9.2 (2008): 181-190.

---. "Europe's 'Last' Wall: Contiguity, Exchange and Heterotopia in Ceuta, the Confluence of Europe and North Africa" *Border Interrogations.* Ed. Simon Doubleday and Benita Sampedro. Oxford: Berghahn Publishers, 2007: 15-41.

---. "In Modernity's Wake: Transculturality, Deterritorializaiton and the Question of Community in Icíar Bollaín's *Flores de otro mundo*." *PostScript: Essays in Film and the Humanities* 21.2 (2002): 38-49.

Nance, Kimberly. "Disarming Testimony: Speakers' Resistance to Readers' Defenses in Latin American Testimonio." *Biography* 24.3 (2001): 570-588.

Nirenberg, "The Politics of Love and its Enemies." *Critical Inquiry* 33.3 (2007): 573-605.

Nochlin, Linda. *The Politics of Vision: Essays on Nineteenth Century Art and Society*. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1989.

Ortiz, Lourdes. *Fátima de los naufragios*. Barcelona: Planeta, 1998.

Oso Casas, Laura. "La inserción laboral de la población latinoamericana en España: El protagonismo de las mujeres" in *Nuevas migraciones latinoamericanas a Europa. Balances y desafíos*. Ed. Isabel Yépez del Castillo and Gioconda Herrera. Quito, Ecuador: Flacso, 2007. 453-79.

Parella Rubio, Sonia. *Mujer, inmigrante y trabajadora: la triple discriminación*. Barcelona: Anthropos, 2003.

Pateman, Carole. *The Sexual Contract*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 1988.

Pérez Galdós, Benito. *Trafalgar*. Madrid: Cátedra, 2003.

Perriam, Chris et. al. “The Transnational in Iberian and Latin American Cinemas: Editors’ Introduction.” *Hispanic Research Journal* 8 (2007): 3-9.

Pope Pius XII. *Munificentissimus Deus: Defining the Dogma of the Assumption*. Vatican: November 1, 1950.

Pratt, Mary Louise. *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. London and New York: Routledge, 1992.

Princesa de África. Dir. Juan Laguna. Producciones Bereberia, 2008.

Princesas. Dir. Fernándo León de Aranoa. IFC, 2007

Prout, Ryan. “Inmenso Estrecho: Obstacles to Achieving Post-immigration Identity Change in Spanish Short Fiction. *Tejuelo* 2 (2008): 66-77.

Raimon, Eve Allegra. *The Tragic Mulatta Revisited: Race and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Antislavery Fiction*. Piscataway: Rutgers UP, 2004.

Reeves, Sharon L. “Eduardo López Bago’s Revolt Against the Sexual and Economic Exploitation of the ‘Fallen Woman’ in Late Nineteenth Century Spain.” *Hybrido* 5 (2001): 88-93.

Ricci, Cristián. “African Voices in Contemporary Spain.” *New Spain, New Literatures*. Ed. Nicholas Spadaccini and Luis Martín-Estudillo. Nashville: Vanderbilt UP, 2010.

Robb, George. “The Way of All Flesh: Degeneration, Eugenics, and the Gospel of Free Love.” *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 6.4 (1996): 589-603.

Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon, 1978.

Salvajes. Dir. Carlos Molinero. Brothers and Sisters S.L., 2001.

Santaolalla, Isabel. “The Representation of Ethnicity and ‘Race’ in Contemporary

Spanish Cinema." *Cineaste* (2003): 44-9.

---. "Ethnic and Racial Configurations in Contemporary Spanish Culture." *Constructing Identity in Contemporary Spain: Theoretical Debates and Cultural Practice*. Ed. Jo Labanyi. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2002. 55-71.

Schroeder Rodríguez, Paul A. "Migrants and Lovers: Interculturation in *Flowers from Another World*." *Jump Cut* 50 (2008). http://www.ejumpcut.org/archive/jc50.2008/FloresOMundo/text.html

Shapiro, Ann-Louise. "How Real is the Reality in Documentary Film? Jill Godmilow, in Conversation with Ann-Louis Shapiro." *History and Theory* 36 (1997): 80-101.

Shohat, Ella and Robert Stam. *Unthinking Eurocentrism: Multiculturalism and the Media*. New York: Routledge, 1994.

Solé, Carlota and Parella, Sonia. "Discursos sobre la 'maternidad transnacional' de las mujeres de origen latinoamericano residents en Barcelona." *Mobilitiés au feminin*. Tangier: November 15-19, 2005.

Song, H. Rosi. "Migration, Gender, and Desire in Contemporary Spanish Cinema." *Border Interrogations* Ed. Benita Sampedro Vizcaya and Simon Doubleday. Oxford: Berghan Books, 2008.

Spivak, Gayatri. *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason: Toward a History of the Vanishing Present*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1999.

Stoler, Ann. *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things*. Durham: Duke UP, 1995.

Surcos. Dir. José Antonio Nieves Conde. Atenea Films, 1951.

Tolentino, Roland B. "Nations, Nationalisms and *Los últimos de Filipinas*: An Imperialist

Desire for Colonialist Nostalgia." *Refiguring Spain: Cinema/Media/Representation*. Ed. Marsha Kinder. Durham: Duke UP, 1997.

Trachtenberg, Alan ed. *Classic Essays on Photography*. New Haven: Leete's Island Books, 1980.

Ucelay Da Cal, Enric. "The Nationalisms of the Periphery: Culture and Politics in the Construction of National Identity." *Spanish Cultural Studies: An Introduction: The Struggle for Modernity.* 32-9.

de Urioste, Carmen. "Las novelas de de Lucía Etxebarria como proyección de sexualidades disidentes en la España democrática." *Revista de Estudios Hispánicos* 34 (2000): 123-37.

Vernon, Kathleen. "Imperio, identidad y nostalgia: Cuba recuperada en el reciente cine español" in *Cine, Nación y Nacionalidad(es) en España*. Ed. Nancy Berthier and Jean Claude Séguin. Madrid: Collections de la Casa de Velázquez, 2007. 185-202.

Vlasopolos, Anca. "Seductive Certainties: *Nana* and Nascent Eugenic Sciences." *Excavatio: Emile Zola and Naturalism* 13 (2000): 229-35.

---. "Venus Live! Sarah Barmtmann the Hottentot Venus, Re-Membered." *Mosaic* 33 (2000): 129-43.

Woodward, Kathleen. "Calculating Compassion." *Compassion: The Culture and Politics of an Emotion* Ed. Lauren Berlant. New York: Routledge, 2004.

Yúdice, George. "Testimonio y concientización." *Revista de Crítica Latinoamericana* 18 (1992): 211-32.

Zecchi, Barbara. "All About Mothers: Pronatalist Discourses in Contemporary Spanish Cinema." *College Literature* 32:1 (2005): 146-164.

Zola, Émile. *Nana* Trans. George Holden. London: Penguin Books, 1972.

---. "The Experimental Novel." *The Experimental Novel and Other Essays* Trans. Belle M. Sherman. New York: Haskell House, 1964. 1-57.